



TOWN OF COLLINGWOOD JUDICIAL INQUIRY

Before:

Associate Chief Justice Frank Marrocco

Held at:

Collingwood Town Hall Council Chambers 97 Hurontario Street Collingwood, Ontario

May 1st, 2019



```
2
1
                  APPEARANCES
2
3 Kate McGrann
                          ) Inquiry Counsel
4 John Mather
                          ) Associate Inquiry
                           ) Counsel
5
6
7 Michael Watson ) Alectra Utilities
8 Belina Bain
                          ) Corporation
9
10 (No Counsel)
                          ) For Paul Bonwick
11
12 George Marron ) For Sandra Cooper
13
14 (No Counsel) ) For Timothy Fryer
15
16 Frederick Chenoweth ) For Edwin Houghton
17
18 William McDowell ) For Town of Collingwood
19 Ryan Breedon
                          )
20
21 Patrick Gajos (np) ) For Collus PowerStream
22
                           ) Corporation
23
24
2.5
```

	3	3
1	TABLE OF CONTENTS	
2	PAGE NO.	
3	List of Exhibits 4	
4		
5	RICHARD EARL LLOYD, Previously Sworn	
6	Continued Examination-in-chief by Mr. John Mather 5	
7		
8	IAN CHADWICK, Affirmed	
9	Examination-in-chief by Ms. Kate McGrann 126	
10	Cross-examination by Mr. William McDowell 211	
11		
12		
13		
14	Certificate of Transcript 236	
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

				4
1		List of Exhibits		
2	Exhibit No.	Description	Page No.	
3	77	TOC0059065		
4	78	TOC0062875		
5	79	TOC0062881		
6	80	TOC0135342.0001		
7	81	TOC0155656.0001		
8	82	TOC0173501.0001		
9	83	TOC0193240.0001		
10	84	TOC0216131.0001		
11	85	TOC0216131.0001.0001		
12	86	TOC0044255		
13	87	TOC0038108		
14	88	ALE0000178		
15	8 9	CPS0006920		
16	90	TOC0061079		
17	91	TOC0061382		
18	92	TOC0059013		
19	93	TOC0069692		
20	94	TOC0119889.0001		
21	95	TOCO138988.0001		
22	96	Summary Doc 1-5		
23				
24				
25				

```
1 --- Upon commencing at 10:00 a.m.
```

- 3 CONTINUED EXAMINATION-IN-CHIEF BY MR. JOHN MATHER:
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: Good morning, Mr.
- 5 Lloyd.
- 6 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Good morning.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: When we were
- 8 speaking yesterday, we had just started talking about
- 9 the meetings where the RFP was scored. I showed you
- 10 that as we understand it, there was two (2) meetings,
- 11 one (1) on November 23rd, where the non-financial
- 12 components were scored, and a second meeting on
- 13 November 28th, when the financial components were
- 14 reviewed and scored.
- 15 And I was asking you questions about
- 16 the November 23rd meeting, so I'm going to continue
- 17 asking you questions about that process.
- 18 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Can I just
- 19 confirm, I'm still under oath, correct?
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Yes, you are.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Thank you.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So you said that you
- 23 were given the non-financial package for review prior
- 24 to the meeting. Did you complete your scores prior to
- 25 the November 23rd meeting?

- 1 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: The dates are a
- 2 little confusing, but yes, before the meeting, we've -
- 3 we filled out the score sheet ourselves. That's
- 4 correct.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: And when you say
- 6 "filled out the score sheet," what you mean by that?
- 7 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: It was ranking --
- 8 it was ranking each category.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you have a
- 10 physical score sheet?
- 11 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I -- I apologize.
- 12 Pardon?
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you have a
- 14 physical score sheet that you were writing rankings
- 15 down? Was it electronic?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: It was a -- a
- 17 paper copy, yes.
- 18 MR. JOHN MATHER: A paper -- a hard
- 19 copy?
- 20 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's correct.
- 21 Thank you.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And then what did
- 23 you do with that hard copy score sheet?
- 24 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: We handed it in at
- 25 the meeting, and that was the last I'd seen of it.

- 1 MR. JOHN MATHER: Who did you hand it
- 2 to at the meeting. Do you recall?
- 3 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I think -- I would
- 4 think that the executive secretary took them all.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: Would that be Pam
- 6 Hogg?
- 7 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's correct.
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: Before you handed
- 9 your score sheet to Ms. Hogg, was there any discussion
- 10 about scoring at the meeting?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I -- I can't
- 12 remember. I don't think there was any discussion
- 13 other than what was supposed be discussed. It wasn't
- 14 a -- a what did you do, or something like that. It
- 15 was --
- 16 MR. JOHN MATHER: So what -- what did
- 17 you understand was supposed to be discussed?
- 18 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: When we did the
- 19 scoring, then KPMG obviously took all the -- the
- 20 scoring and -- and did a spreadsheet or -- or an
- 21 overhead projection, if I remember right, of all the
- 22 categories and where everybody was at.
- 23 MR. JOHN MATHER: So you're recalling
- 24 some sort of overhead projection that -- and you said
- 25 you had all the categories, and everybody -- where

- 1 everybody was at. So did that reflect the scores that
- 2 had been provided?
- 3 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: It didn't say who
- 4 voted what. It was just reflective of a cumulation.
- 5 KPMG dissected all the -- the scoring that everybody
- 6 put in, and the overhead was a -- a large TV that's in
- 7 the boardroom, that everything was put on it and
- 8 presented -- and presented by KPMG. I believe that's
- 9 how it worked out.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay if we could
- 11 turn up document CPS6920.

12

13 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- MR. JOHN MATHER: The projection that
- 16 you were just describing, did it look something like
- 17 this?
- 18 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: It did.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: It's our
- 20 understanding that this reflects the scores -- the
- 21 non-financial scores of the team members. You had
- 22 said that it didn't identify who had scored what.
- Is this different than what was on the
- 24 screen at the time?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No, I think what

- 1 happened -- originally, it didn't. I -- I have no
- 2 idea. I don't remember. Obviously, it's on here. My
- 3 memory was that -- that it wasn't influenced.
- I think what happened was, if I -- my
- 5 understanding would be that KPMG took all the
- 6 valuations and then that's when they did a
- 7 spreadsheet. I didn't think it showed everybody's
- 8 individual names, but...
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: So your recollection
- 10 is what you were looking at at the time didn't show --
- 11 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's correct.
- 12 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- the individual
- 13 names?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah.
- 15 MR. JOHN MATHER: After a version of -
- 16 of something that looked like this that at least
- 17 reflected the scores was put up at the meeting, at
- 18 that point, was there a discussion about the scoring?
- 19 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: The -- there was
- 20 discussion by KPMG leading us through it and
- 21 explaining where the scores were, and -- and -- but it
- 22 wasn't -- it wasn't questioning how we scored it,
- 23 individually. It was just showing the -- the actual
- 24 score. And again, I'm -- I'm going from memory from
- 25 eight (8) years ago, trying to --

- 1 MR. JOHN MATHER: Understood.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah.
- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you remember if
- 4 there was discussion among the Task Team members about
- 5 the results they were seeing?
- 6 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't think so,
- 7 other than we've seen the results, and that's how --
- 8 there was no influence by any of the Task members,
- 9 either.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: So I'm going to walk
- 11 through the -- the non-financial scoring --
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Sure.
- 13 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- and then I'll
- 14 have some questions for you at the end and -- and
- 15 perhaps as we go along.
- 16 So this is the first page of what we
- 17 understand to be the record of the scoring. And it's
- 18 in the first category, customer experience and
- 19 satisfaction, supporting in -- the interests of the
- 20 communities. And we see here that you scored
- 21 PowerStream a ten (10)?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's correct.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Yeah. And we can
- 24 also see that a lot of people scored PowerStream a ten
- 25 (10), incurring -- including Ms. Cooper and Mr.

- 1 Houghton?
- 2 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Everyone but one
- 3 (1).
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: Yes.
- 5 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's right, and
- 6 it was a nine (9).
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: Mr. Fryer?
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's right.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: Yes. So if we could
- 10 go to the next -- okay. So this is the next category,
- 11 provision of strategic and specialized resources,
- 12 support in growing Collus business. Again, we see
- 13 that the point value is thirty (30), and you've scored
- 14 PowerStream thirty (30)?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Pretty consistent.
- 16 There's one (1) twenty-five (25), but everyone else
- 17 scored thirty (30) as well on it.
- 18 MR. JOHN MATHER: Yes. So if we go to
- 19 the next slide, this is the next category support for
- 20 employees and their careers. We see here that you
- 21 scored PowerStream ten (10)?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Four (4) of us
- 23 scored ten (10), three (3) scored eight (8), one (1)
- 24 nine (9), and one (1) seven (7).
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Right. And the

- 1 others who scored ten (10) were Mr. McFadden, Mr.
- 2 Garbutt, and Mr. Houghton?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's correct,
- 4 and Mr. Houghton.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: I -- yeah, sorry, I
- 6 said Mr. Houghton, if you didn't catch me there.
- 7 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Sorry.
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: No, that's okay. I
- 9 just wanted to make sure we were on the same page.
- 10 So if we could go to the next. So this
- 11 is the next category, competitive distribution rate
- 12 and cost structure of Collus. And in this instance,
- 13 you scored PowerStream eight (8)? Is that correct?
- 14 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's correct,
- 15 yeah.
- 16 MR. JOHN MATHER: Yes. And -- and in
- 17 this -- in this case, Horizon appeared to otherwise
- 18 get top marks?
- 19 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's -- that's
- 20 correct.
- 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: And we see that Mr.
- 22 Houghton also scored PowerStream an eight (8)?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's correct.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Yeah.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yes.

- 1 MR. JOHN MATHER: And then if we could
- 2 go to the next. So this is cultural and synergistic
- 3 fit, again out of ten (10). And again, we see that
- 4 you've scored PowerStream ten (10) out of ten (10), as
- 5 has many of -- other people on the Task Team, except
- 6 Mr. Fryer. Is that -- is that your recollection?
- 7 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's accurate.
- 8 Yes.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. And then if
- 10 we can go to the next, and then we get into the
- 11 financial components, which isn't filled out at this
- 12 point.
- 13 So that -- what we looked was the
- 14 totality of the non-financial components?
- 15 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's accurate.
- 16 That's correct.
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. We see that
- 18 both Mr. Houghton and yourself give PowerStream full
- 19 marks in every category except one (1). Does that
- 20 accord with your recollection?
- 21 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I wasn't analyzing
- 22 it as we're doing it. If that's what the documents
- 23 show it would be, there was no --
- 24 MR. JOHN MATHER: And I think -- and I
- 25 -- we can go look at the category. I believe it was

- 1 every category except in one (1), you gave them eight
- 2 (8) out of ten (10). Does that sound correct?
- 3 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: And -- and, I
- 4 guess, analyzing a little further, you mentioned that
- 5 Mr. Houghton and I gave all of them except one (1),
- 6 how -- how did I score with the other ones? Like, for
- 7 instance, Dean Muncaster, where was I with his score?
- 8 Where was I with -- because I can't just use the word
- 9 that Mr. Houghton and I were right on the same page,
- 10 because was I on the same page with the others?
- 11 MR. JOHN MATHER: So -- and this is
- 12 only with respect to PowerStream --
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- not the other --
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Exactly.
- 16 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- proponents. I
- 17 can tell you from my review, and I'm happy to walk
- 18 through this, that you and Mr. Houghton gave the same
- 19 scores to PowerStream in every category, and no one
- 20 else in every category gave -- gave the same scores
- 21 that you and Mr. Houghton did. There was overlap in
- 22 other ones. I'm not suggesting there wasn't.
- 23 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: The other ones,
- 24 yeah.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Yeah.

- 1 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah.
- 2 MR. JOHN MATHER: And the category
- 3 where you gave PowerStream less than full marks was
- 4 the competitive distribution rate, which is the one we
- 5 looked at.
- 6 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: At any time prior to
- 8 this meeting did you discuss your scores with Mr.
- 9 Houghton?
- 10 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No, never, with
- 11 anyone.
- 12 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you discuss your
- 13 scores with anyone else?
- 14 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No one at all, no.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you recall at any
- 16 time changing your scores from what you initially
- 17 wrote down to what went into the --
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't remember.
- 19 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- presentation?
- 20 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't think I
- 21 did but --
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Sorry, and again
- 23 please wait till I'm --
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I'm sorry.
- 25 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- finished.

- 1 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So the question was,
- 3 did you change your scores at any time from when you
- 4 originally wrote them down on the hard copy to when
- 5 they were entered into PowerPoint and --
- 6 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: So that was the
- 8 November 23rd, 2011, meeting. The next meeting for
- 9 scoring was November 28th, 2011. And it's our
- 10 understanding the purpose of that meeting was to
- 11 review and score the financial components of the bids.
- 12 What do you recall about that meeting?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I just remember
- 14 again KPMG presenting. I know that the -- I believe
- 15 that -- that all the financials were in a sealed
- 16 envelope, and then they were opened, I'm not sure if
- 17 that meeting or before, and that's when we -- we
- 18 reviewed them.
- 19 MR. JOHN MATHER: And so you reviewed
- 20 them at the meeting?
- 21 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I can't -- that's
- 22 a -- an assumption. I'm thinking that's probably what
- 23 we did. I can't remember if we reviewed them or they
- 24 were opened and announced, and then KPMG put them in
- 25 the -- the right categories.

- 1 MR. JOHN MATHER: So you can't recall
- 2 if you reviewed them before or at the meeting?
- 3 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: It wouldn't be
- 4 before the meeting. It would be when they were
- 5 opened, and I think they were opened at the meeting.
- 6 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. That -- thank
- 7 you. Thank you for clarifying.
- 8 How did you score the financial
- 9 results?
- 10 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: It was based on 30
- 11 percent, and you probably have the scores here that we
- 12 can look at, how -- how it was scored, on the
- 13 computer. I know that it was ranked on -- on the
- 14 amount of monies that were -- were being presented.
- 15 So if -- for instance, if one was at 10 million,
- 16 another one was at -- at 1 million, obviously it was
- 17 ranked thirty (30) for the one at 10 million and the
- 18 one at one million was ranked at one (1) or whatever.
- 19 MR. JOHN MATHER: And again I just
- 20 want to be clear here, is that what you recall
- 21 happening or is that what you --
- 22 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's what I
- 23 recall. I -- I can't confirm it. Again, it's eight
- 24 (8) years ago. I'm trying my best.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. And to the

- 1 best of your recollection, did every team member then
- 2 submit a -- a ranking out of thirty (30) based on what
- 3 they saw in the financial scores --
- 4 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't think so.
- 5 I think it was all -- when they were opened, it was
- 6 obvious who was high and who was low and the ones in
- 7 between. So I -- it wasn't scoring them. So I think
- 8 it was just, if I remember right, it was -- it was
- 9 when they were opened, we could tell which one was
- 10 high and which one was low. It's pretty simple
- 11 actually.
- 12 MR. JOHN MATHER: And do you recall
- 13 KPMG making any sort of adjustments to the financial
- 14 components of any bidders?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No, I don't
- 16 remember anything happening like that.
- 17 And again, KPMG is a pretty honourable
- 18 company. I can't imagine them fudging anything, if
- 19 that's what you're suggesting, or changing anything.
- 20 MR. JOHN MATHER: I'm not suggesting
- 21 fudging. What I'm -- there is an indication in the
- 22 documents that KPMG made adjustments to, for instance,
- 23 Hydro One's bid in order to make it an apples-to-
- 24 apples comparison.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay.

1 MR. JOHN MATHER: Does that trigger

- 2 any recollections?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No, it doesn't,
- 4 but KPMG would be the best to answer that. I'm sure
- 5 that they --
- 6 MR. JOHN MATHER: And so -- and I just
- 7 -- I want to know at this point what you recall.
- 8 Do you recall KPMG ever providing any
- 9 explanation to you about whether the financial
- 10 components had been adjusted?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No, but I do
- 12 remember when I read this document, there's stuff in
- 13 there about it but I don't remember anything at the
- 14 time.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. So if we
- 16 could bring Document CPS6920 back on the screen.

17

18 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 20 MR. JOHN MATHER: And I believe it's
- 21 Slide 6.
- So we were looking at this document
- 23 just a few minutes ago.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's right.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: We went through the

```
non-financial --
 2
                  MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's right.
 3
                  MR. JOHN MATHER: -- categories where
   there was numbers populated for everyone. This is the
   financial category, and we don't see any numbers
   populated.
                  That's -- do you remember if a slide or
 7
   a -- sorry, I think it's actually a page of an Excel,
   to correct myself, but do you remember if this
   component of the scoring was ever populated?
10
11
                  MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I -- I believed it
12
   was. We had -- and I think Council was presented with
   the numbers. I think there's a slide -- I remember
13
   seeing a slide showing the numbers on it, it was no
14
15
   secret, so.
16
                  MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could go to
17 the next slide.
18
                  MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Ahh.
19
                  MR. JOHN MATHER: So is this the slide
   you were referring to?
21
22
                          (BRIEF PAUSE)
```

23

24 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I think there was

25 a slide that showed the actual financial numbers, like

- 1 it -- for instance, if Ontario Hydro was at 18
- 2 million, it showed 18 million, whatever the -- the
- 3 amount. There was a -- a spreadsheet showing the
- 4 actual values that were being presented.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: And this
- 6 spreadsheet, do you remember this being presented at
- 7 the scoring meeting?
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No. It would --
- 9 you're making it a little bit confusing, to be honest
- 10 with you, so I'm not -- I don't know if it was at the
- 11 scoring meeting. It would be at the meeting that we
- 12 were discussing the financials, whether that was at
- 13 the scoring meeting or whatever. So the meeting we
- 14 were at with the financials is where it was discussed,
- 15 where in fact it was opened.
- 16 So the -- the sealed envelopes were
- 17 opened up. Somebody marked the -- the numbers. I
- 18 can't remember if it was Pam or whatever, recorded the
- 19 numbers, and I think in fact Mr. Fryer was involved in
- 20 it as well, from memory, because it was a financial
- 21 thing, and then it was analyzed. I think it was not
- 22 unlike a tender where they'd look at it to make sure
- 23 everything was complete, that that was the actual
- 24 number.
- Then, from what I understand or what I

- 1 remember, is that it was presented back to us with all
- 2 the numbers, to show what they actually -- the prices
- 3 they put in.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: So what you're
- 5 describing, just to confirm, is the -- your
- 6 recollection of what occurred at the meeting to review
- 7 the financial bids?
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No. This was part
- 9 of the financial meeting.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay.
- 11 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: All the
- 12 information was gathered and -- and then I think it
- 13 went back with KPMG to be confirmed, to confirm that
- 14 everything was accurate.
- 15 It'd be pretty rash to just open a
- 16 envelope and say, okay, that's the number without
- 17 reading through all the -- the -- making sure the 'i's
- 18 are dotted, the 't's are crossed, and I think that's
- 19 what was done.
- 20 We did see the numbers, but I think it
- 21 did come back later to -- to show us what the actual
- 22 accuracy was of it.
- 23 MR. JOHN MATHER: And I'm just trying
- 24 to confirm your recollection, so --
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's fine. And

- 1 I'm -- trying my best.
- 2 MR. JOHN MATHER: I -- I understand
- 3 that and -- and so from what I understand from what
- 4 you're saying, at the fin -- at the meeting to review
- 5 the financials, envelopes were opened, that's what you
- 6 recall, and then there was a subsequent meeting where
- 7 the -- the financial numbers were presented to you?
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I believe that's
- 9 what happened. They had to have time to analyze to
- 10 make sure all the numbers were in place and correct,
- 11 so.
- 12 MR. JOHN MATHER: So you recall
- 13 whether that second meeting was a strategic task team
- 14 meeting or another meeting?
- 15 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: It would have to
- 16 be the -- the strategic task force meeting. It would
- 17 have to be that.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And so you say --
- 19 but do specifically recall whether it was?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No, I don't. But
- 21 I know that the numbers would be -- the reason this is
- 22 a little bit confusing is I know that the numbers were
- 23 presented to Council as well, to show the financials
- 24 and everything, so there has to be another slide
- 25 showing the numbers, like the 18 million, that -- that

- 1 one was offering, and 15 or 14 on the other one.
- 2 There -- there's actual disclosure of -
- 3 of the numbers.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: And -- and we see
- 5 that at the December 5th Council meeting. I'm -- my
- 6 questions right now are focusing on what was discussed
- 7 at the strategic task --
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- team meetings.
- 10 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That clarifies a
- 11 lot because I'm starting to think, well, are you
- 12 suggesting, and I'm not -- I -- my mind is thinking,
- 13 well, are you suggesting there's something wrong with
- 14 what went on here? There wasn't, so.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: I'm not trying to
- 16 suggest anything. I'm just trying to -- to get your
- 17 recollections about what happened at the strategic
- 18 task team --
- 19 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I -- I agree.
- 20 Thank you.
- 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: So again we're
- 22 looking at the documents that appears to be the
- 23 collection of the scoring at the strategic task team.
- 24 This is the last slide. The slide before this we saw
- 25 that there was no data in the financial scoring

- 1 components. Here, if you look at the top line, it
- 2 says:
- 3 "Payment for up to 50 percent of
- 4 shares and other considerations in
- 5 3.1"
- 6 which is the financial component, and
- 7 then we see there are total numbers populated across.
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Right.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you know how
- 10 those numbers were calculated?
- 11 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I think when the
- 12 consultants looked at it they analyzed them and given
- 13 the scores for what they were, I wouldn't know how to
- 14 score it. I think that's how it was done.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. So if we
- 16 could go to paragraph 297 of the Foundation document.
- So I want to ask you some questions
- 18 about an event where a Barrie business reached out to
- 19 you seeking assistance in a dealing with PowerStream.
- Do you know what I'm talking about?
- 21 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Totally, yes.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. Can you tell
- 23 us what you recall about that event?
- 24 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I had a call from
- 25 one of my friend's, which is a Coll -- was a

- 1 Collingwood resident, Dan Beggs. Dan Beggs has a
- 2 machine shop over in the City of Barrie. He called
- 3 me, a little stressed, that for three (3) weeks he had
- 4 been trying to get a hold of -- of Barrie Hydro and
- 5 never had anybody come out to his site to take a look
- 6 at the transformer. He was having transformer issues,
- 7 I guess some of his equipment would -- was drawing
- 8 more power than necessary or whatever and it would
- 9 shut down and -- and he said he's pretty frustrated
- 10 nobody would -- he couldn't get anybody to come out.
- 11 And he was asking me if I knew anybody
- 12 at -- at Barrie Hydro that -- that maybe I could
- 13 rattle some chains.
- 14 So what I did is I -- I knew that Paul
- 15 Bonwick obviously was working for PowerStream and I
- 16 just sent him an email said that Danny Beggs was
- 17 looking for assistance, is there anything that -- that
- 18 you can do to get at least somebody from Barrie Hydro
- 19 to get in contact with him, he's been waiting three
- 20 weeks to -- to get this problem solved, this
- 21 transformer, nobody's even responded to him.
- Then you'll see the email chain after,
- 23 that they did, immediately somebody got a hold of
- 24 Danny Beggs, I think he spent 80 or \$90,000 on a new
- 25 transformer. That wasn't the issue. The issue was

- 1 getting it up and running again, and then it was fine.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And the paragraph in
- 3 front of you, you suggest that this -- your request to
- 4 Mr. Bonwick was on October 4th, 2011.
- 5 Does that sound correct in terms of the
- 6 time period?
- 7 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Probably, yes,
- 8 somewhere around October, November.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: Why would the
- 10 individual who was seeking help with PowerStream, why
- 11 would he come to you for help with PowerStream?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I get calls from
- 13 people all over the place, outside this Municipality
- 14 as well, still do, on trying to help them.
- 15 I think he was so frustrated he knew no
- 16 one else to -- to call, knew that over the 25 years
- 17 obviously if I've been involved at the county, I knew
- 18 a lot of different organizations.
- 19 But it's not unusual, put it that way,
- 20 I've had lots of people call me to -- for assistance.
- 21 And that's what I'd said yesterday.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Is it fair to say
- 23 you've had a lot of people call you for assistance
- 24 with companies that don't operate in Collingwood?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Oh, yes. Yes, and

- 1 the -- I've even had people bring in their tax bills
- 2 from Clearview Township or the Town of Blue Mountains
- 3 because they thought it was absurd, or helped them
- 4 with a bylaw in another municipality. It wasn't
- 5 unusual, they -- it was just all part of it.
- 6 With the county experience it even
- 7 helped further because at County Council I -- we were
- 8 sitting with -- with all the other municipalities in
- 9 Simcoe County, so I did have some connections with
- 10 them, so.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you recall that
- 12 when this individual contacted you if he told you why
- 13 he was reaching out to you?
- 14 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Just exactly what
- 15 I told you at the very beginning, that -- that he had
- 16 an issue --
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: Sorry, I don't mean
- 18 to cut you off, I wasn't specific enough in my
- 19 question, why he was -- why he thought you would be an
- 20 appropriate person to get in contact with PowerStream.
- 21 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah, he thought
- 22 it was Barrie Hydro. He was -- he didn't know where
- 23 else to turn. He was from Collingwood, good friend of
- 24 mine. And he has already contacted Barrie Hydro
- 25 several times to no avail, didn't get any response at

- 1 all from them.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And when you
- 3 contacted Mr. Bonwick, do you recall what he said to
- 4 you in response?
- 5 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: There's an email,
- 6 if we could see the email I can --
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: So we can --
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Rather than me
- 9 quessing.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: Understood. So why
- 11 don't we pull up TOC 00, sorry, I needed to read the
- 12 full number on that paragraph to know what email to
- 13 pull up. TOC 61079.
- 14 So this is the email that was
- 15 referenced in the paragraph and it's you reaching out
- 16 to Mr. Bonwick and I just wanted to know if you
- 17 remembered what his response was to you about this.
- 18 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: What Paul's
- 19 response was? I think he -- the next email tells the
- 20 story because he obviously was able to get a hold of
- 21 whoever it was at -- at PowerStream or at Barrie
- 22 Hydro, which I didn't even know, and it was -- they
- 23 went out immediately and dealt with the problem, got
- 24 it solved, got Dan his business back up and everything
- 25 was fine.

- 1 MR. JOHN MATHER: So, I may be able to
- 2 assist you with this. If we could go to TOC 61382.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yes.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could
- 5 scroll down. Scroll up. And sorry, scroll up a bit
- 6 more, keep scrolling up. And then -- sorry, just
- 7 scroll down a bit further.
- 8 So this is the next email chain that we
- 9 are aware of, and it -- it appears that PowerStream is
- 10 reporting to Mr. Bonwick about the actions they have
- 11 taken in response to your request.
- 12 What's not apparent to me was what you
- 13 -- sent Mr. Bonwick an email and then we see
- 14 PowerStream's taking action.
- I want to know what you recall about
- 16 what Mr. Bonwick said to you after you sent him the
- 17 email and before these emails reflecting that
- 18 PowerStream took action. If you recall.
- 19 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: If there's not an
- 20 email it would've been me sending it to him, probably
- 21 no response then all of a sudden he was dealing with
- 22 it.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And again, I'm just
- 24 looking for your recollection, so do you recall if you
- 25 spoke to him on the phone about it?

- 1 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No, no. It was --
- 2 it would be just emails back-and-forth, that would be
- 3 it.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could,
- 5 starting on this email, Mark Henderson at PowerStream
- 6 and this is October 5th, 2011, so it's the day after
- 7 you emailed Mr. Bonwick the email we were looking at,
- 8 Mark Henderson at PowerStream sells -- sends Mr.
- 9 Bonwick an email saying, "Please see the email train -
- 10 trail below" and basically from what I understand is
- 11 PowerStream addressed the individual's concerns.
- 12 Is that your recollection?
- 13 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: And when I read
- 14 this email, yes. But when I read this email it says
- 15 that -- that we are going beyond the norm to help the
- 16 customer with this project. Well, they've been months
- 17 waiting for it and didn't get a response from them, so
- 18 now they are, which is great.
- 19 MR. JOHN MATHER: Right, and I just
- 20 wanted to confirm that your recollection is that
- 21 PowerStream did address the individuals --
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Positively, yes.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay.
- 24 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: And earlier I had
- 25 said that -- that -- that Dan was quite pleased

- 1 because they did respond very quickly.
- 2 MR. JOHN MATHER: And then if we
- 3 scroll up, Mr. Bonwick responds "Thanks very much,
- 4 Mark", who is Mr. Henderson at PowerStream, then he
- 5 says "This is very useful as it provides DM an
- 6 opportunity first-hand to blow our horn during review
- 7 stage. I will let him know."
- I'm assuming DM is Deputy Mayor?
- 9 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's right, yes.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. Do -- did you
- 11 at the time agree with Mr. Bonwick that PowerStream's
- 12 assistance gave you an opportunity to blow their horn?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Let's go through
- 14 this for a minute. We have a friend of mine in Barrie
- 15 that has a business that depends on hydro. For weeks
- 16 he was down. Nobody responded from Barrie Hydro,
- 17 which is PowerStream.
- 18 He calls me in desperation. I get a
- 19 hold of Bonwick hoping that he can assist because I
- 20 didn't know anybody at PowerStream I could call. They
- 21 then move very quickly.
- I don't know if blowing your horn is
- 23 really the answer at that point, but I was very
- 24 appreciative that -- that they did respond once I get
- 25 involved. But, again, let's go back. Three (3)

- 1 weeks, at least, this guy was out of business.
- 2 MR. JOHN MATHER: So you did
- 3 appreciate what PowerStream had done?
- 4 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: And what Paul
- 5 Bonwick did, as well.
- 6 MR. JOHN MATHER: At that point, did
- 7 it change how you viewed PowerStream, knowing that
- 8 they were a potential bidder in the RFP?
- 9 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: None whatsoever,
- 10 no. And it didn't even come into -- in any of you at
- 11 all. I wasn't even considering it. It was Barrie
- 12 Hydro that we were dealing with.
- I know it's PowerStream, one (1) of
- 14 their subsidiaries, but I -- it didn't make any
- 15 difference to me at all.
- 16 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. And if we
- 17 could scroll up to the next email. Mr. Bonwick says -
- 18 forwards you his conversation with Mr. Henderson.
- 19 And then he says, "Let's chat."
- Did you have a conversation with Mr.
- 21 Bonwick?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't remember.
- 23 I see the email, but I don't remember. Like, that's,
- 24 again, eight (8) years ago.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could go to

```
1 paragraph 299 of the Foundation Document.
```

2

3 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: So this is -- comes
- 6 a few days after the emails we were looking at. Mr.
- 7 Bonwick sent you the following language in -- with an
- 8 -- in an email with a message that says, "As per your
- 9 request"?
- 10 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's right.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And we see that what
- 12 he's drafted here is --
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's right.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- as res -- is an
- 15 email to what I understand to be Mr. Henderson at
- 16 PowerStream?
- 17 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: It was a thank
- 18 you. I thought it appropriate. You never known down
- 19 the road if I need another -- more help from
- 20 PowerStream, so I was being cordial as doing the right
- 21 thing by thanking them for -- for all their
- 22 assistance. And did Mr. Bonwick did help me with the
- 23 letter.
- 24 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. And so one
- 25 (1) of the reasons you did that was in case you needed

- 1 further assistance down the road?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Partly that. And,
- 3 also, I was raised to be polite with things like that
- 4 and if somebody does something for you, you thank
- 5 them. That's exactly what I did.
- 6 MR. JOHN MATHER: Why did you ask Mr.
- 7 Bonwick to request that you write this for him?
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Not unlike the le
- 9 -- the letters that he had done previously for me.
- 10 And I had made it very clear yesterday that -- that
- 11 writing letters isn't my forte, any assistance I can
- 12 get would be great.
- 13 He's great at -- at writing letters.
- 14 He helped me with it. I've had numerous other people
- 15 in the community, as I said yesterday, help me with
- 16 letters.
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: And I think we see
- 18 that you did send this response if we scroll down --
- 19 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I did, yes.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: -- on October 14th,
- 21 it looks like. Is that accurate?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's correct,
- 23 yes.
- 24 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you tell the
- 25 Strategic Task Team at any point that you had reached

- 1 out to Mr. Bonwick to help an individual with
- 2 PowerStream, that PowerStream had responded and that
- 3 you had replied with their thanks?
- 4 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No. And I -- no.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- with your thanks,
- 6 sorry, sir?
- 7 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: However, I did say
- 8 previously today that -- that I didn't feel that it
- 9 had anything to do with -- with what we were doing
- 10 with PowerStream or anybody with the Strategic Task
- 11 Force.
- 12 This was an isolated situation where a
- 13 friend of mine had a business issue with Barrie Hydro,
- 14 or PowerStream, where he was shut down because he
- 15 didn't have transformer power. They weren't getting
- 16 in touch with him or back to him to help him, and I
- 17 helped him.
- 18 But at no point in time did I have
- 19 anything to do with -- with what was going on with --
- 20 with the potential sale of Collus and so on?
- 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: And so that was the
- 22 reason you didn't tell the Strategic Task Team?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Your wording's
- 24 wrong because I had no reason to. I'll put it that
- 25 way. That wasn't the reason. That isn't the right

- 1 word. I had no reason to tell anybody because I was
- 2 helping a taxpayer in the city of Barrie that's a
- 3 friend of mine that -- that I believed that -- that I
- 4 would help him or anybody else.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: Fair enough. And --
- 6 and perhaps I should have put it this way. Do you
- 7 recall turning your mind to whether or not you -- you
- 8 should or not dis -- disclose it to?
- 9 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah. No, it even
- 10 crossed my mind. Thank you. Yeah.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So as we already
- 12 went through, we've seen that when you scored the non-
- 13 financial components --
- 14 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Excuse
- 15 me. Are you moving on to something else?
- 16 MR. JOHN MATHER: I just have another
- 17 question in this area, but if -- I'm happy to have you
- 18 interject.
- 19 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: I just
- 20 wondered if you could just take a look at the email.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Sure.
- THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: And
- 23 that email says -- that email says your actions only
- 24 re-affirm the high level of confidence I have in the
- 25 PowerStream organization. But -- but I thought -- I

- 1 took from what you said this morning that actually you
- 2 weren't ultimately very impressed because it had taken
- 3 them three (3) weeks to respond to the person.
- 4 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I'm not --
- 5 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Did it
- 6 occur to you that, you know, the email was saying
- 7 something different about PowerStream than you felt?
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I sent that --
- 9 that letter of thanks. My -- my first response,
- 10 obviously, I wasn't very pleased that I had to get
- 11 involved in it to start with at all.
- I was very pleased that the higher up
- 13 people at PowerStream got involved and made sure that
- 14 Barrie Hydro, which is part of Power -- PowerStream,
- 15 did deal with it. I wasn't very happy at all that I
- 16 had to -- that I had a friend that was three (3) weeks
- 17 out of power, or limited power.
- 18 This letter was being polite, trying to
- 19 -- to ensure that -- that -- in the future, that if I
- 20 was ever dealing with them -- I -- I've done se --
- 21 similar things in the past, too, with other
- 22 organizations where sometimes I haven't totally agreed
- 23 with -- with the outcome, but they've helped me
- 24 throughout it and I've sent thank yous to them.
- 25 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: All

```
1 right. So you -- you -- it -- you actually didn't
```

- 2 have a high level of confidence in the organization
- 3 based on the fact that --
- 4 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I do.
- 5 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: --
- 6 they kept your friend waiting for three (3) weeks for
- 7 some action?
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah. I -- I do
- 9 have a -- or did have a high level of confidence in
- 10 the total organization. Somehow, it feel apart in the
- 11 city of Barrie and I wasn't very happy with what
- 12 happened in that organization.
- 13 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: All
- 14 right. Thank you.

15

- 16 CONTINUED BY MR. JOHN MATHER:
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could
- 18 scroll up to paragraph 297 again, and then go back to
- 19 that document TOC61079.

20

21 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- MR. JOHN MATHER: So this is the email
- 24 from the individual. And it -- it relates to -- in
- 25 part, to what you were saying about an issue in

```
40
 1 Barrie. Sorry, just one (1) second. I may have
 2 pulled up the wrong email.
 3
                         (BRIEF PAUSE)
 5
 6
                  MR. JOHN MATHER: Actually, if we
7
   could go to TOC61382.
8
9
                         (BRIEF PAUSE)
10
11
                MR. JOHN MATHER: Sorry. One (1)
12 moment.
13
14
                         (BRIEF PAUSE)
15
16
                  MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could just
17 go back to that email. It's 61382, TOC61382. And
18 scroll down.
19
20
                         (BRIEF PAUSE)
21
22
                  MR. JOHN MATHER: And then scroll down
23 further. And go down further. Okay. So sorry, I'm
24 just trying to make sure I find the right place.
2.5
                  MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's fine.
```

- 1 MR. JOHN MATHER: So scroll up. And
- 2 then scroll up. And one (1) more, sorry. I think
- 3 this is the right one.

4

5 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: When you -- when you
- 8 receive this email chain from Mr. Bonwick do you
- 9 recall if you looked down to see what PowerStream had
- 10 told Mr. Bonwick?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't know if I
- 12 ever seen those emails. I don't know if they were
- 13 ever forwarded to me.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we scroll
- 15 up --
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't -- no
- 17 idea.
- 18 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- we see that
- 19 Mr. Bonwick did forward the email chain to you.
- 20 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: But was it the
- 21 whole chain, or just certain ones?
- MR. JOHN MATHER: If you scroll down,
- 23 everything in this chain, it appears, was forwarded to
- 24 you.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay.

1 MR. JOHN MATHER: But I take it you

- 2 don't have a recollection of that.
- 3 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No. I've -- I
- 4 don't -- when I read these in the document, it was the
- 5 first time I had seen -- that I remember ever seeing
- 6 them.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay.
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: So we have seen that
- 10 you reached out to Mr. Bonwick to have -- seek
- 11 assistance with PowerStream for an individual who
- 12 reached out to you. You were appreciative that
- 13 PowerStream reached out to you. You said that one (1)
- 14 of the reasons you sent a thank you note was in case
- 15 you needed PowerStream's assistance and -- in addition
- 16 to other things that you mentioned.
- 17 And then we've also seen that you gave
- 18 PowerStream top marks in every category except one.
- 19 Did this experience influence how you scored
- 20 PowerStream?
- 21 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: As I said earlier,
- 22 it had nothing to do with -- with what we were doing
- 23 with PowerStream, with the -- the sale.
- Interesting enough, I'd also yesterday
- 25 made it very clear that -- that I -- I felt that it

- 1 was PowerStream's to lose. I very much, right at the
- 2 get go, believed that -- that a good partnership with
- 3 PowerStream made sense; the geographic connection to
- 4 Barrie for many reasons was important to me; the
- 5 GO Transit possibilities in the future made a lot of
- 6 sense.
- 7 So I really, as I said yesterday,
- 8 believed that PowerStream was the partner we should
- 9 have. I -- I tried to keep an open mind throughout
- 10 the -- the scoring and everything else, but I
- 11 definitely believed, and I still do today. If I was
- 12 going through it again, I would still believe that
- 13 PowerStream should be the one that we should be
- 14 involved with because of the geographic area.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. So we've seen
- 16 in this instance on October 5th, 2011 that Mr. Bonwick
- 17 assisted when you had a question or when you sought
- 18 some assistance with PowerStream.
- 19 Other than this incident throughout the
- 20 period of when the STT was formed in August 2011 to
- 21 when PowerStream was selected as the preferred
- 22 proponent in December 2011, what else did you
- 23 understand Mr. Bonwick was doing for PowerStream?
- 24 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: On I think it was
- 25 June 29th, we had a meeting -- an introduction

- 1 meeting -- and at that June 29th meeting, I believe,
- 2 as I said yesterday, Brian Bentz was at it; Jeff
- 3 Lehman, the mayor of the city of Barrie; myself; the
- 4 mayor; and CAO Kim Wingrove.
- 5 And at that meeting, it was explained
- 6 to us that Mr. Bonwick was involved with assisting
- 7 them as I said yesterday, and that's what I believed
- 8 what was told to us at that point.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: Right. And we
- 10 discussed that yesterday. After that meeting and as
- 11 the Strategic Task Team's work progressed and as the
- 12 RFP went out and the responses came in, did your
- 13 understanding change at all about what he was doing?
- 14 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't think
- 15 it -- no, I don't think anything changed at all. I --
- 16 from what I understood at the beginning what was
- 17 explained to us, he was doing his job.
- 18 MR. JOHN MATHER: As the RFP was being
- 19 developed and after it was released, did you
- 20 understand Mr. Bonwick to be seeking to gather
- 21 information about the RFP and what the STT was doing?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I can't speak for
- 23 Mr. Bonwick honestly. I would think -- or
- 24 PowerStream. I just know that -- that that's what
- 25 consultants do, and -- and I know that things like

- 1 that happen. I can't speak for them.
- 2 MR. JOHN MATHER: I understood you
- 3 can't speak for Mr. Bonwick and -- and that -- that's
- 4 fair. My question is, is at the time, what did you
- 5 think he was doing?
- 6 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Exactly what was
- 7 explained to us on the June 29th meeting.
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. And did that
- 9 include speaking to individuals in Council or at
- 10 Collus about the RFP?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Repeat that
- 12 question again. I didn't get it. Sorry.
- 13 MR. JOHN MATHER: Sorry. In your
- 14 mind -- and I understand you can only speak to what
- 15 was in your mind -- did you believe that Mr. Bonwick's
- 16 role as a consultant would include speaking to
- 17 individuals on the Strategic Task Team, in Council, or
- 18 at Collus about the RFP?
- 19 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I think what was
- 20 explained to us on -- on June 29th that we could
- 21 expect that.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. Did he ever
- 23 speak with you?
- 24 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I can't remember
- 25 any specifics, put it that way, but I'm sure. We've

- 1 had lots of conversations over the year and everything
- 2 else, but I can't think of actual specifics that, you
- 3 know, that would be.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. So what I
- 5 want to do now is I'm going to take you to a few
- 6 documents to -- and ask about information that
- 7 Mr. Bonwick appears to at least know about and ask --
- 8 and ask you about them.
- 9 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: And so if we go to
- 11 paragraph 269 of the Foundation Document.

12

13 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 15 MR. JOHN MATHER: So this is
- 16 September 14th, 2011, and to place you in time, this
- 17 is in the time period where the Strategic Task Team
- 18 has been meeting with potential proponents. That was
- 19 just to put you at a point in time, if it assists.
- 20 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Do that -- ask me
- 21 the question again. Sorry.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Sorry. I didn't ask
- 23 you a question. I'm just helping orient you in time.
- 24 It's September 14th, 2011. It's around the time when
- 25 the Strategic Task Team was meeting with potential

- 1 proponents, and they were giving their presentations.
- 2 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay.
- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: So Mr. Bonwick sends
- 4 an email to Mr. Houghton's gmail account attaching a
- 5 memo entitled "PowerStream competitive analysis for
- 6 Mr. Houghton's review and comment." And if we could
- 7 pull up that document TOC59013.

8

9 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 11 MR. JOHN MATHER: So this is what was
- 12 described in the Foundation Document. It's a draft
- 13 memo -- or a memo that's addressed to PowerStream.
- 14 It's being sent to Mr. Houghton at this point in time.
- 15 If you scroll down, it says:
- "Please review the following points
- of interest as they relate to
- 18 presentations to date, as well as
- 19 profile points of interest."
- 20 And then Mr. Bonwick in the -- in the
- 21 memo says:
- 22 "Hydro One, Mike Mueller. Ontario
- 23 Hydro clearly articulated the
- 24 regional value Collus represents to
- 25 them. They offered rationale that

	48
1	Collingwood could be a regional hub,
2	recognizing that some of the
3	territory surrounding Collingwood
4	are presently serviced by Hydro One
5	and that their model is one that the
6	province would likely accept."
7	He then goes on in the memo and says:
8	"It was made clear that all existing
9	staff would be provided an
10	opportunity with Hydro, with the
11	option for senior staff to negotiate
12	an early retirement."
13	Then it goes on:
14	"The platform of their presentation
15	was, generally speaking, predicated
16	on a straight purchase model would
17	help to solidify on Hydro One's
18	position in the region."
19	And then the final bullet:
20	"While the presenter demonstrated
21	integrity and in-depth knowledge of
22	the industry trends and, more
23	particularly, the South Georgian Bay
24	region, the Assessment Committee was
25	not enamored with the concept or

- direction Hydro One presented."
- 2 So it appears that this memo is
- 3 relaying information about Hydro One's presentation.
- 4 Did you provide Mr. Bonwick with any of the
- 5 information about Hydro One?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: None.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you provide him
- 10 in the final bullet point any information about how
- 11 the Assessment Committee had received any component of
- 12 Hydro One's presentation?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. And if we
- 15 scroll down. So -- oh, sorry -- we see that there is
- 16 also a heading about Veridian and the individuals from
- 17 Veridian?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah.
- 19 MR. JOHN MATHER: And the first bullet
- 20 point is:
- 21 "Veridian made a very strong and
- 22 positive impression on the
- 23 Assessment Committee. Once past
- 24 their introduction event of
- attendees, they focused on the

50 1 following..." 2 And then it goes through points, and so I'll just give you a moment to read through the 3 4 points. 5 6 (BRIEF PAUSE) 7 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay. 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: And scroll down. I 10 just want to... 11 12 (BRIEF PAUSE) 13 14 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay. 15 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did -- and there's a 16 few more. 17 18 (BRIEF PAUSE) 19 20 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay. 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you provide 22 Mr. Bonwick with any of this information about 23 Veridian's presentation? 24 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No. 2.5 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could go to

paragraph 279 of the Foundation Document. 2 3 (BRIEF PAUSE) 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we can scroll down, I just want to confirm the date. So this is an email from Mr. Bonwick to 7 Mr. Glicksman or an excerpt of that email --9 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay. 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- from 11 September 20th, 2011. Scroll back up. 12 So Mr. Bonwick is emailing 13 Mr. Glicksman and providing strategies on how to use information about the Strategic Partnership Task 14 15 Team's views and the plans by at least one bidder. 16 And if you scroll down, you see that Mr. Bonwick was providing information in this 17 18 paragraph about what appears to be the Strategic Task 19 Team's views. For instance, it says: 20 "They believe that palatability is 21 much greater from a Council 22 perspective if they are able to 23 announce this type of scenario 24 rather than the perceived loss of

control in a less than 50 percent

2.5

52 scenario." 1 2 Did you provide Mr. Bonwick with this information about the Strategic --3 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I did not. MR. JOHN MATHER: Again --5 6 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Oh, sorry. 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- just wait until I'm finished. So did you provide Mr. Bonwick with this information about the Strategic Task Team's 10 views? 11 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No, I did not. MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. And if we 12 13 scroll down further and keep going down. 14 15 (BRIEF PAUSE) 16 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: All right. I should 18 have told you to stop. Go up. 19 So then we see here that: 20 "Irrespective of the Committee's 21 buy-in or reluctance on this issue, 22 the municipal council retains final 23 authority, and it is in this regard we must remain mindful that at least 24 2.5 one of our competitors, Horizon,

```
53
 1
                      will submit a proposal providing a
 2
                      50 percent ownership scenario."
 3
                   Did you provide Mr. Bonwick with any
   information about what the Task Team expected Horizon
   to submit?
 6
                   MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No, I didn't.
 7
                   MR. JOHN MATHER: If we go to
   paragraph 302 of the Foundation Document.
 9
10
                          (BRIEF PAUSE)
11
12
                   MR. JOHN MATHER: And here we see
   October 5th, 2011, Mr. Bonwick is sending a memo to
13
   PowerStream with ideas concerning the RFP bid based on
14
15
   input over the past several weeks, and then there's
   some information here.
16
17
                   So if we go down to subparagraph (g),
18 one -- on the issue of "issue clarification and
   management comments" under this heading included:
19
20
                      "Provide an example where existing
2.1
                      private sector companies provide
22
                      support staff in a cooperative
23
                      working environment. Veridian
24
                      emphasized synergies with same
2.5
                      union."
```

```
1
                   Do you see that?
 2
                  MR. RICHARD LLOYD:
                                        Yes.
 3
                   MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you provide
   Mr. Bonwick with this information about Veridian?
 5
                   MR. RICHARD LLOYD:
                                        No, I did not.
 6
                   MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. And then if
   we could go to paragraph 322 of the Foundation
 7
   Document.
 9
10
                          (BRIEF PAUSE)
11
12
                  MR. JOHN MATHER: This is a
   November 14th, 2011 email from Mr. Bonwick to
13
14
   Eric Fagen at PowerStream. He -- Mr. Bonwick advises
15
   that he had sent Dennis Nolan some changes to the
   information services section of the PowerStream
16
   proposal, and then Mr. Bonwick elaborates:
17
18
                      "While the offer for back-office
19
                      support will become a reality, I
20
                      highly recommend removing at this
21
                      time a general offer of support will
22
                      be more warmly received, rather than
23
                      telling them what we will provide.
24
                      The senior person for this
2.5
                      department is presently very
```

5.5

1 supportive. I don't want us to lose

- 2 that support."
- Do you know, appreciating that you
- 4 weren't a recipient of this e-mail, who Mr. Bonwick
- 5 was referring to when he says "the senior person" in
- 6 that department? The senior person for that
- 7 department?
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No, I don't.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you provide Mr.
- 10 Bonwick the information that a senior person of any
- 11 department was supportive of anything in relation to
- 12 the are -- to the potential RFP?
- 13 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No, I didn't.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: So we've seen a few
- 15 examples of Mr. Bonwick providing information that
- 16 appears to be information about what other bidders may
- 17 be doing or feedback that was received, or feedback
- 18 from the strategic task team.
- 19 Was that the sort of information that
- 20 you expected Mr. Bonwick to be gathering?
- 21 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: If I was on
- 22 PowerStream's Board, I would hope that he would be
- 23 gathering that kind of information.
- 24 When I'm sitting on the strategic task
- 25 force team, I have no idea how much he got, I don't

- 1 know how much of it is -- is -- what he's written to
- 2 elaborate on some of the points he was trying to make
- 3 with it, they go and dissect the -- the letters and
- 4 try to figure out exactly what he's saying, is it
- 5 accurate or is it not accurate or is he just trying to
- 6 -- to make sure that his client gets the best bang for
- 7 their buck and he's trying to give them a -- a good
- 8 show for it.
- 9 I would have to dissect every one of
- 10 them to make sure that -- that it was accurate to what
- 11 we did. So I have no idea that -- that he had this
- 12 information, I don't know how he got it. I'm not
- 13 concerned about it at all, but because I don't think
- 14 anything I've seen so far is alarming to me.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you -- do you
- 16 want me to continue or -- how are you -- what are --
- 17 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Well,
- 18 why don't you finish this.
- 19
- 20 CONTINUED BY MR. JOHN MATHER:
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay, sounds good.
- 22 So at any point from when you join --
- 23 at any point from when you -- June 27th, 2011, when
- 24 there was the in-camera presentation about the
- 25 strategic partnership to when PowerStream was

- 1 announced as the preferred partner in December or
- 2 selected as the preferred partner in December 5th,
- 3 2011, did you provide Mr. Bonwick with any information
- 4 about the potential sale of Collus or the RFP that you
- 5 learned at Council or on the strategic task team?
- 6 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't believe I
- 7 did. No.
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: So you told us
- 9 yesterday that you have -- you had no concerns
- 10 providing Mr. Bonwick with information that was
- 11 relevant to his clients.
- 12 You also told us that when you did that
- 13 you would do it with a view to helping getting deals
- 14 completed in -- efficiently or more -- in a more --
- 15 more timely manner.
- 16 You also told us yesterday and today
- 17 that it was -- you were leaning to PowerStream from
- 18 the get go and you thought it was a part -- potential
- 19 partner that made sense for the Town.
- 20 Why didn't you share information you
- 21 received with Mr. Bonwick when it relate -- as it
- 22 related to PowerStream in this instance?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I wasn't asked. I
- 24 don't think Mr. Bonwick asked me for information
- 25 leading to this at all.

- 1 MR. JOHN MATHER: Had he asked you?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I'd have to
- 3 consider what he was asking. Again, that's -- that's
- 4 speculative. I have no idea. Depends on what he was
- 5 asking me. If it was something that I felt that --
- 6 that was information I could give him or any other
- 7 consultant that was working for any of the other
- 8 groups, I would -- I would consider it.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: The other thing you
- 10 said yesterday was that it wasn't only people who
- 11 asked you for information that you provided
- 12 information to, it was people who you understood could
- 13 use the information or would benefit from the
- 14 information.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Sure, yes.
- 16 MR. JOHN MATHER: I take it you
- 17 understood that Mr. Bonwick would benefit from the
- 18 information you received as a member of the strategic
- 19 task team?
- 20 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I would think that
- 21 he's already got a contract, goals and objectives.
- 22 Probably I would assume that his
- 23 contract would be already determined. What you're
- 24 suggesting is that if he was able to set some goals
- 25 and he would get more money, I have no idea if -- if

- 1 preset goals, or if there is anything with this
- 2 contract with PowerStream, I've never seen it, I don't
- 3 know what it is.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: What I'm suggesting
- 5 to you is we've seen other examples where you were
- 6 aware that one of Mr. Bonwick's clients had an
- 7 interest in a matter that related to the Town, and
- 8 that you had information about in your role as Deputy
- 9 Mayor. And in those instances you -- you provided Mr.
- 10 Bonwick that information, and you said you had no
- 11 concerns about doing it.
- 12 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's right.
- 13 MR. JOHN MATHER: I am -- I want to
- 14 know why it appears that you didn't follow that same
- 15 practice -- practice in this case with PowerStream?
- 16 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Again, I was on a
- 17 strategic task force team, the information I would get
- 18 would be sporadic except at the meetings, so I had no
- 19 reason to share with anybody.
- I wasn't asked, so I -- you know, I --
- 21 I can't answer it other than no, I didn't share it and
- 22 no, I didn't. Why didn't I? It -- it didn't even
- 23 come to mind, like it wasn't any issue at all for me.
- 24 MR. JOHN MATHER: And related to the
- 25 questions I have here, you were saying yesterday,

- 1 again, that you -- you felt that it was acceptable and
- 2 actually a good idea for you to again provide
- 3 information when it might assist a local business
- 4 person --
- 5 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's correct.
- 6 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- in order to get
- 7 something done. And -- and sometimes that might even
- 8 be information that was marked as comp --
- 9 confidential.
- 10 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Not often.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Not often, but
- 12 sometimes?
- 13 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yes. It could.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: I take it then that
- 15 it was your view that other members of council were
- 16 equally in a position to take such steps?
- 17 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I would -- again,
- 18 I don't know how the other members of Council dealt
- 19 with their clients or their -- their taxpayers or the
- 20 residents of Collingwood. Some dealt with them
- 21 differently, no doubt, and helped them.
- Some perhaps weren't even assisted,
- 23 maybe they didn't have the interest that -- that was
- 24 going on in the community. It would be -- I would be
- 25 speculating if I assumed what they were doing.

- 1 MR. JOHN MATHER: But -- and my
- 2 question was more that if you thought it was okay for
- 3 you to do this, I take it that if other members of
- 4 Council took the same approach, you would think that's
- 5 okay?
- 6 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yes, I would.
- 7 Yes.
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you not think
- 9 that's unworkable, to have various individual members
- 10 of Council pursuing Town member -- matters on an
- 11 individual basis?
- 12 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: It's done all the
- 13 time, and it's -- I'm sure it's still done when --
- 14 when somebody gets a phone call late -- they deal with
- 15 it. I would hope they would deal with it.
- 16 MR. JOHN MATHER: So you -- you would
- 17 hope that everyone was doing what -- what we've seen
- 18 that you have done during this time period, which is
- 19 assist. We've seen the documents referring to Mr.
- 20 Bonwick and your evidence was, in addition to Mr.
- 21 Bonwick other businesses in deals they had with the
- 22 Town, and you -- you don't think that's unworkable to
- 23 have individual councillors engage in those sorts of
- 24 conversations, rather than as a collective?
- 25 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I think it happens

- 1 all the time and it's no different than me helping a
- 2 business in Barrie I was helping. And I think that's
- 3 what -- that's what Municipal Councillors do, elected
- 4 officials try to help the residents of the community,
- 5 the business of the community and so on.
- I don't think it's uncommon that --
- 7 that I know that there's been other members of Council
- 8 where they've been lobbied to try and -- and get
- 9 something done in a park and they've gone to the park
- 10 director to see if it's going to be done.
- I don't see it any different than what
- 12 the role we did 25 years ago. Times have changed,
- 13 things are getting tighter, things are -- are getting
- 14 more sophisticated than they were back then.
- But I can remember when I first got
- 16 elected we -- we -- some of the members of council
- 17 would go and actually make ice rinks in some of the
- 18 residential areas, in the parks of Collingwood for the
- 19 kids. Should we have been doing it? Probably not, it
- 20 probably should have been paid Park's employees, but
- 21 we volunteered, we did it. There was all kinds of
- 22 things we did that is above the norm.
- 23 So by giving information to businesses,
- 24 yes, I did that. And other -- I'm sure other members
- 25 of Council have done it over the years. It -- it's

- 1 the norm. It was the norm anyway.
- 2 MR. JOHN MATHER: And you -- so you've
- 3 talked about ice rinks and why that approach works for
- 4 ice rinks.
- 5 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yes.
- 6 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you think it
- 7 equally applies when you're dealing, for instance,
- 8 with the sale of a piece of Town property?
- 9 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: It's totally
- 10 different when you're bringing it in that context.
- 11 When we're dealing with a piece of Town
- 12 property, if we're selling a -- a specified piece of
- 13 property that -- that has been done, the clerk's
- 14 department looks after it and quite often we're not
- 15 involved in it at all other than we're going to divest
- 16 of this property.
- 17 If it's something that's more
- 18 complicated and we're trying to work through, like we
- 19 did at the Mountain View Hotel to bring a whole bunch
- 20 of people in to try and get the thing together, that's
- 21 a little different circumstance. But most times
- 22 Council wouldn't be involved.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And so the example
- 24 of the Mountain View Hotel, is that the example we
- 25 looked at yesterday, where you were emailing one of

- 1 the parties who was interested and then forwarding it
- 2 on to Mr. Bonwick?
- 3 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: What I was doing
- 4 is I e-mailed one of the property owners that -- that
- 5 owned the property to the north of the Mountain View
- 6 property, marked my e-mail confidential, trying to get
- 7 them to know the urgency to try and sell their
- 8 property because the person buying the balance of the
- 9 property from the Town wouldn't put that deal together
- 10 without -- without buying the property to the north,
- 11 as I said yesterday. And I knew Mr. Bonwick was
- 12 working for the proponent trying to buy the balance of
- 13 the property.
- 14 So I gave them -- I went to the company
- 15 to the north, sent them the email that I thought we
- 16 should be moving on this and sent it to Bonwick.
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: And did you report
- 18 to Council that you had sent that email?
- 19 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I didn't report it
- 20 to anybody, I just did it. It's what we did.
- 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: So in that specific
- 22 circumstance where you're dealing with a more complex
- 23 matter, do you think it would be workable if
- 24 individual members of Council, like you, were emailing
- 25 the parties involved and not reporting to Council on

- 1 what those emails were?
- 2 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I do. I think
- 3 that -- that as I said yesterday, things get mired in
- 4 -- in legal stuff and lawyers and so on and sometimes
- 5 it takes somebody on the ground to get -- get stuff
- 6 going.
- 7 I was assisting to try and get this
- 8 thing moving, it worked, it was a success story, I
- 9 wasn't keeping it away from Council, I just was
- 10 dealing with it.
- 11 As I said before, I -- I have a bad
- 12 habit of micro-managing and I guess that's part of
- 13 micro-managing, trying to get this thing put together.
- 14 And it worked. Again, happy story, we
- 15 ended up getting the road widening, very little cost
- 16 to the taxpayers. We were able to successfully get
- 17 grants. The individual that bought the balance of the
- 18 property and the property to the north was able to
- 19 close his deal with the Town, cover most the cost of
- 20 the property so the Town wasn't saddled with that.
- 21 It was a -- it was a good news story.
- 22 MR. JOHN MATHER: And in your view, if
- 23 another member of Council had been doing what you were
- 24 doing on the exact same deal, that would be workable?
- 25 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I would

- 1 congratulate him for doing it and getting it put
- 2 together. I would think that rather than just rubber
- 3 stamp stuff in a Council meeting Monday nights, he was
- 4 doing his job or her job and trying to help to get
- 5 something together, which is helping the community.
- 6 We help the community in a positive way
- 7 by getting the property so we could widen the road and
- 8 the previous Council was not successful. The
- 9 expropriation didn't work and it just got to
- 10 loggerheads.
- 11 What I did was -- was help put this
- 12 thing together and all of a sudden we got a road
- 13 widened. And again, I was chair Public Works, the
- 14 road widening was important to me.
- So that was part of one (1) of the
- 16 functions I believed as chair of Public Works to try
- 17 and help when we could get this road widening through,
- 18 and that's what I did there.
- 19 So there's instances that I -- I
- 20 understand the optics, I understand what you're trying
- 21 to -- what you're trying to paint. I don't totally
- 22 agree that -- that that's exactly the norm for
- 23 everything.
- 24 MR. JOHN MATHER: I'm going to move on
- 25 to another area.

1 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Just

- 2 one (1) question before we break.
- 3 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Thank you.
- 4 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Did --
- 5 did you think that the strategic partnership task
- 6 teams response to one (1) bidder's presentation should
- 7 be disclosed to the bidders who hadn't presented yet?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No.
- 9 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Thank
- 10 you.
- 11
- 12 --- Upon recessing at 11:10 a.m.
- 13 --- Upon resuming at 11:24 a.m.
- 14
- 15 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't know if
- 16 it's appropriate, but if I could. His Honour had
- 17 asked me a question, and I answered, and I just felt
- 18 that it might require a little bit more information on
- 19 it.
- Your Honour, you had asked me a
- 21 question about whether one (1) bidder should have had
- 22 all this information sort of thing. And I had
- 23 answered, "No," but I'm not so sure. And again, I --
- 24 I don't know if this information was -- could have
- 25 been available for others if it was asked for.

- 1 You know, so I know that we've read the
- 2 documents and seen through the documents, but I can't
- 3 tell you -- I said that one (1) bidder shouldn't have
- 4 it, and I agreed with -- with that, but I'm not so
- 5 sure that -- that if others had requested or asked for
- 6 it, that some of this information wouldn't have been
- 7 available to the other bidders, as well.
- 8 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: But --
- 9 but somebody has to go first.
- 10 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah, exactly.
- 11 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: So the
- 12 person who goes first has nothing to ask about. But
- 13 the person who goes fourth can ask about the other
- 14 three (3). Does that seem fair to you?
- 15 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: It doesn't seem
- 16 fair. But I'm just not sure what -- what they had
- 17 about the -- Collus if -- if stuff was available with
- 18 some of it. I don't know all of it or anything else.
- 19 I just didn't want to taint it that --
- 20 that, no, it took a little bit more explanation, that
- 21 maybe some of this stuff was available and wasn't
- 22 confidential because I didn't go through every aspect
- 23 of every email that could have been available to
- 24 others, as well, if that helps.
- 25 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Thank

```
69
  you. Go ahead.
 2
 3
   CONTINUED BY MR. JOHN MATHER:
                  MR. JOHN MATHER: If we could turn up
   paragraph 400 and -- and -- sorry, 434 of the
   Foundation Document.
 7
                          (BRIEF PAUSE)
 9
10
                  MR. JOHN MATHER: So I'm just looking
11
   at the heading here, "Council holds a closed meeting
   on December 5th, 2011." And it's our understanding
12
   that at this council meeting there was an in camera
13
   session in which Collus reported on the results of the
14
15
   RFP and -- and announced that PowerStream was the
   preppered -- preferred proponent out of the RFP.
17
                  Do you recall that council meeting?
18
                  MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't, no.
19
                  MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could go to
20 pa -- paragraph 3 -- 436.
21
22
                          (BRIEF PAUSE)
23
24
                  MR. JOHN MATHER: So this paragraph
25 says:
```

```
1 "As the meeting was beginning at
```

- 7:37 p.m., Mr. Bonwick forwarded an
- 3 email string from a developer to
- 4 Deputy Mayor Lloyd as council was
- 5 moving from an in camera -- moving
- from public session to in camera
- 7 meeting."
- 8 He then writes -- he then advised:
- 9 "Try to lighten things up a bit when
- 10 you go in camera. We need them in a
- 11 good mood for other things."
- Do you remember receiving this email
- 13 from Mr. Bonwick?
- 14 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: And I don't even
- 15 know what the developer was. I -- I don't remember
- 16 it.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you -- again, as
- 18 you can see in paragraph 437 as we scroll down, at the
- 19 meeting there was a Collus Strategic Partnership RFP
- 20 review that was to be heard in camera.
- 21 Do you recall emailing with Mr. Bonwick
- 22 about the in camera RFP review?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't remember.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Scroll up. Do you
- 25 have any recollection at all about what you understood

```
Mr. Bonwick to mean when he said:
 2
                      "Try to lighten things up -- up a
 3
                     bit when you go in camera."
                  MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Not at all. This
   email was sent to me, or is it to --
                  MR. JOHN MATHER: It was sent to you.
 6
 7
   And if it assists, we can pull up the full chain --
 8
                  MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah, no.
 9
                  MR. JOHN MATHER: -- TOC69692.
10
11
                          (BRIEF PAUSE)
12
13
                  MR. JOHN MATHER: So you can see in
14
   that --
15
                  MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay.
16
                  MR. JOHN MATHER: -- you and Mr.
   Bonwick are emailing. You're the only ones on the
17
18
   email. You report to Mr. Bonwick at 7:35, "Public
   meeting is now over." Mr. Bonwick writes back:
19
20
                      "Try to lighten things up a bit when
21
                      you go in camera. We need them in a
22
                      good mood for other things."
23
                  MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay.
24
                  MR. JOHN MATHER: At the time, do you
25 recall understanding what he was referring to?
```

```
1 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't even
```

- 2 remember the emails, so.
- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you recall if you
- 4 turned your mind to the fact that Mr. Bonwick may be
- 5 asking you to lighten up the mood in the room because
- 6 there was going to be a discussion about his client,
- 7 PowerStream, being selected as the preferred
- 8 proponent?
- 9 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't think it
- 10 would have mattered if it was lightened up or not
- 11 lightened up. I -- I don't think there's any
- 12 revelance (sic) to it at all.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could go to
- 14 paragraph 446 of the foundation document.

15

16 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 18 MR. JOHN MATHER: So this references
- 19 an email you sent Mr. Muncaster on December 6, 2011,
- 20 which would be the day after the council meeting we
- 21 were just talking about. And you write to Mr.
- 22 Muncaster that you have a concern about Tim Fryer and
- 23 his obvious distaste for the strategic partnership
- 24 idea. Then it says:
- 25 "You suggested that at the next

- 1 Collus meeting the Board have an in
- 2 camera discussion with Mr. Fryer in
- 3 order to bring him onboard."
- 4 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's right
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you recall
- 6 sending this email to Mr. Muncaster?
- 7 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yes, I do. And I
- 8 also forward it to Mr. Houghton.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. And what did
- 10 you mean by Mr. Fryer and his obvious distaste for the
- 11 strategic partnership idea?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Mr. Fryer came to
- 13 my flower shop to discuss with me the -- what was
- 14 going down with the deal of PowerStream, Mr. Houghton,
- 15 and felt that it wasn't a good deal and that -- that -
- 16 felt that I should be maybe considering not going
- 17 ahead with it and a whole bunch of conversation like
- 18 that.
- I thought -- thought it was
- 20 inappropriate. I didn't say much at the time. I was
- 21 more surprised because Tim wasn't the type of person
- 22 that ever come to lobby me for anything.
- 23 And the more I got thinking of it, I
- 24 got hold of the chair of -- of the committee and said
- 25 this isn't appropriate. And I think that -- I believe

- 1 that I wasn't the only one that was lobbied. I don't
- 2 know for sure, but I believe that I wasn't.
- I just got hold of Mr. Muncaster and
- 4 said, You got to deal with this, the guy's not
- 5 onboard, he's a staff person, and, you know, like,
- 6 he's coming to me for -- to lobby me, and it's not
- 7 appropriate.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: What happened after
- 9 you sent Mr. Muncaster and Mr. Houghton this email?
- 10 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't remember.
- 11 I know Mr. Muncaster was going to deal with it, and I
- 12 think he did. But I'm sure Mr. Fryer can -- can
- 13 answer that. I -- I have no idea at this point.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do -- do you know
- 15 what Mr. Muncaster did?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Pardon me?
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you know what Mr.
- 18 Muncaster did?
- 19 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No, I have no
- 20 idea.
- 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you know if there
- 22 was a discussion at the next Collus board meeting, as
- 23 is suggested here?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No. No, I
- 25 wouldn't know. I brought my concerns forth to Mr.

- 1 Muncaster.
- 2 MR. JOHN MATHER: And I want to ask
- 3 you some questions about the transaction that led to
- 4 the signing of -- of the sa -- of the documents that -
- 5 that are the sale.
- 6 So there's discussions about a bylaw.
- 7 There's negotiations regarding a unanimous shareholder
- 8 agreement and a share purchase agreement.
- 9 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay. Thank you.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you recall who
- 11 represented the Town in the negotiations about the
- 12 documents that formalize the transaction?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: The legal
- 14 representation?
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Yes.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Aird & Berlis.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Was there any other
- 18 representatives other than the legal representation?
- 19 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I -- I don't know.
- 20 I would think Aird & Berlis were the legal people. I
- 21 know our clerk would be involved, the CAO, no doubt.
- 22 I don't know if -- KPMG, I would assume, would be
- 23 involved, as well.
- 24 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you know who was
- 25 providing Aird & Berlis instructions on behalf of the

- 1 Town?
- 2 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I would hope that
- 3 it would go through the CAO's office in conjunction
- 4 with -- with Mr. Houghton.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: So I understand
- 6 that's -- that's what you hope would have happened or
- 7 you thought may have happened. Do you know if that
- 8 was the case?
- 9 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No, I -- I don't
- 10 know what -- again, municipal council's role is -- is
- 11 limited once it gets to the administration sti --
- 12 side, and that's more the clerk's department. She
- 13 does a great job on it.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we go to
- 15 paragraph 480.
- 16
- 17 (BRIEF PAUSE)
- 18
- 19 MR. JOHN MATHER: So this paragraph
- 20 references a telephone call with Mayor Cooper,
- 21 yourself, and Mr. Houghton. And it appears, based on
- 22 Mr. Longo's notes, that the telephone call was on
- 23 January 12th, 2012?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you recall

- 1 participating in a te -- telephone conference with Mr.
- 2 Longo, Ms. Cooper, and Mr. Houghton on January 12th,
- 3 2012?
- 4 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you recall
- 6 participating in any conversations with Mr. Longo
- 7 about the transaction for the Collus sale?
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: There was
- 9 conversations with Mr. Longo. There was a meeting --
- 10 actually, an in camera meeting that he attended. And,
- 11 again, there's emails in here from Leo Longo to myself
- 12 and Sandra.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So with respect to
- 14 this meeting that's referred to here, I take it then
- 15 it's possible that you participated. You don't
- 16 recall?
- 17 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I'm sure I did,
- 18 yes. I'm sure I did.
- 19 MR. JOHN MATHER: But you don't have
- 20 any recollections about that?
- 21 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No. It's...
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could then
- 23 go to paragraph 473 of the Foundation Document. And,
- 24 actually, before we pull that up, Ms. Wingrove, in her
- 25 evidence, described a process whereby she wanted to

- 1 include in the bylaw that would approve the sit -- the
- 2 -- the share sale transaction a provision that there
- 3 had to be a report back to council before the
- 4 documents could be signed.
- 5 And she -- her evidence was that that
- 6 was met with re -- resistance and that that wasn't the
- 7 view of other people involved. Do you recall being
- 8 part of those discussions?
- 9 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yes. We discussed
- 10 that yesterday and -- whenever we were talking about
- 11 Ms. Wingrove. And generally speaking, all the bylaws
- 12 go through the clerk's department, and she does -- she
- 13 looks after them. She makes sure all the 'i's are
- 14 dotted, the 't's are crossed.
- 15 Sara makes sure that -- that all the
- 16 paperwork's in place, the -- the lawyers have always
- 17 signed off or, if it's an engineering thing, the
- 18 engineers have signed off.
- 19 Then, when she's satisfied that she's
- 20 got all the information, all the documentations, she
- 21 takes it to the mayor for a signature. And then she
- 22 signs it.
- So the authorizing bylaw, to my
- 24 knowledge, ever -- never came back to council. We've
- 25 passed an authorize -- authorization bylaw. Then the

- 1 clerk looked after all the administration that she
- 2 does and she gathers all the information. And when
- 3 it's all gathered, then it -- the -- she signs off and
- 4 -- and the mayor signs off.
- If there's an issue, it comes back.
- 6 But, for instance, as I said yesterday, there was
- 7 discussion that it's a \$14 million or \$15 million
- 8 transaction, that it should come back to council.
- 9 Well, that -- there's no merits in that
- 10 because we did over a \$10 million contract with Hume
- 11 Street, passed an authorizing bylaw. The clerk signed
- 12 it and the mayor signed it once all the paperwork was
- 13 done, and I've never seen it come back to council
- 14 unless there's an issue.
- 15 MR. JOHN MATHER: So what I want to
- 16 understand is if you recall being part of any
- 17 conversations where Ms. Wingrove was suggesting that -
- 18 that it be re -- that there be a report back to
- 19 council before this -- this transaction document was
- 20 signed.
- 21 Do you remember her making that
- 22 suggestion?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't remember.
- 24 I just remember there was discussion that -- that the
- 25 authori -- about the authorizing bylaw, that there

- 1 should be a clause in the authorizing bylaw that comes
- 2 back to council. And I've never seen that ever in the
- 3 past.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: So you recall that.
- 5 Do you recall that Ms. Wingrove was in favour of that?
- 6 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: She wanted the
- 7 clause, as -- as you've already said. Kim Wingrove
- 8 wanted the authorizing bylaw, as what we normally do,
- 9 but then she wanted a clause that it comes back to
- 10 council.
- 11 MR. JOHN MATHER: And it take it from
- 12 the -- for the reasons you've just said, you disagreed
- 13 that that was necessary?
- 14 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I -- it was
- 15 unusual. It was not the norm. Twenty-five (25) at
- 16 the council table I never ever seen that ever done. I
- 17 don't know if -- as I said yesterday, if Ms. Wingrove
- 18 understood the clerk's responsibilities and roles as -
- 19 as much as she should have.
- The norm was, as I said before, that
- 21 once we passed an authorizing bylaw, council's passed
- 22 it, approved it, is satisfied, then it goes to
- 23 administration to make sure all the paperwork is done.
- Let's go the role of Kim, or Ms.
- 25 Wingrove. So why would it come back to council? Like

- 1 -- so if we have the authorizing signed -- bylaws
- 2 signed -- or signatures approved, all the paperwork's
- 3 done as it's done in the past, I don't know why it
- 4 would come back to council other than if you wanted to
- 5 have a ceremonial signature in front of the media.
- 6 MR. JOHN MATHER: So I take it then
- 7 you didn't think that this was necessary, to have a
- 8 further report back to council? I just want to know
- 9 if --
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: -- that was your
- 12 view.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: It didn't make any
- 14 sense. We've never done it. And I just think it was
- 15 a lack of experience, a lack of Ms. Wingrove's
- 16 knowledge of -- of the way municipalities work.
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. So, if we can
- 18 now turn up paragraph 473. So if you recall, there
- 19 was a conversation on July 12th between Ms. Cooper,
- 20 yourself, Mr. Houghton, and Leo Longo?
- 21 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yes.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And this is Ju --
- 23 sorry, I -- I might have said July. I meant January.
- 24 This is January 13th, 2012. Mr. Bonwick is reporting
- 25 to Mr. Glicksman at PowerStream, and it refers to Ms.

- 1 Wingrove, and he says:
- The CAO attempted to cause some
- 3 problems in the middle of the week,
- 4 requesting the Town lawyer to add
- 5 some last-minute items that were
- 6 contrary to the ongoing discussion
- 7 and agreement. The CAO has since
- 8 been engaged at the political level
- 9 and has a very clear understanding
- of the level of support expected at
- 11 this late date. No more problems
- 12 expected."
- Do you recall Ms. Wingrove ever being
- 14 engaged at the political level?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No. I -- I quess
- 16 the confusion I got, explain political level. What --
- 17 what --
- 18 MR. JOHN MATHER: What does that mean
- 19 to you?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: The only thing I
- 21 can see that -- that she's engaged by politicians.
- 22 That'd be the only thing.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. So, and
- 24 you're a politician. Did you ever engage Ms. Wingrove
- 25 on the issue?

```
1 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: As I -- my
```

- 2 previous statement was, all of the stuff that I said
- 3 about the -- the authorization bylaw.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: And I understood
- 5 what you said but did you ever speak directly to Ms.
- 6 Wingrove about that?
- 7 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's what I
- 8 said. That's -- that was part of the conversation
- 9 with Kim Wingrove that I didn't agree, with the
- 10 authorizing bylaw coming back to Council.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And I'm just trying
- 12 to confirm. So you recall having this discussion?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't remember
- 14 the discussion, but I did no doubt talk to Kim about
- 15 it.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. And I'm just
- 17 asking do you have a specific recollection of that or
- 18 if you're just --
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No.
- 20 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- assuming that --
- 21 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: -- I don't.
- 22 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- you did? Are you
- 23 aware of anyone else who is a politician having a
- 24 discussion with Ms. Wingrove about this?
- 25 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No, no. I -- I

- 1 wouldn't know.
- 2 MR. JOHN MATHER: So I asked you
- 3 earlier about who was representing the Town, and you
- 4 said the -- the lawyers at Aird & Berlis.
- 5 Who at Aird & Berlis did you understand
- 6 was representing the Town?
- 7 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I can't remember
- 8 his name. It wasn't Leo Longo; it was his partner.
- 9 There's two of them that -- that were looking after --
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: Ron Clark and
- 11 Corrine --
- 12 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's it.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And Corrine Kennedy?
- 14 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's it, yeah.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So you understood
- 16 they were representing the Town?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: They were
- 18 representing the whole transaction.
- 19 MR. JOHN MATHER: And what did you
- 20 understand Mr. Longo's role to be?
- 21 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I really didn't
- 22 know that -- that Aird & Berlis -- I -- I figured
- 23 Aird & Berlis as a whole was looking after the -- the
- 24 project. The two lawyers that were assigned were the
- 25 two that you just mentioned. Ron Clark and the other

- 1 lady. I just thought it was all part of the team, the
- 2 Aird & Berlis team, trying to put this thing together.
- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could go to
- 4 paragraph 482 of the Foundation Document.

5

6 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: So -- and maybe
- 9 we'll scroll up a paragraph just to provide some
- 10 context.
- So on January 16th, 2012, Mr. Clark,
- 12 who you referred to, informed Mr. Longo that there
- 13 were two (2) other issues that Mr. Longo needed to be
- 14 aware of, and he sets out the two (2) issues.
- And if we go to paragraph 482, Mr.
- 16 Longo emails Ms. Cooper and yourself, advising that
- 17 he's reviewed the latest draft agreements. They
- 18 contain proposed reps and warranties to be made by the
- 19 Town and Services Board:
- 20 "I will review these -- I will
- 21 review these to ensure the Town can
- 22 make these statements. What I
- 23 cannot comment on are the financial
- 24 aspects of the deal. Has the Town
- 25 received advice that it is receiving

```
fair value?"
```

- 2 And then if we go down, Mayor Cooper
- 3 responds:
- 4 "Collus has included Corrine and Ron
- from A&B to review the documents,
- also David McFadden, an expert."
- 7 And she walks through what is -- what
- 8 her understanding was about the review that's going
- 9 on, and says:
- 10 "I hope this addresses your
- 11 comments."
- 12 And then Mr. Longo responds in
- 13 paragraph 44, it partially addresses his comment, but
- 14 he notes:
- "Ron and Corrine are advising
- 16 Collus, not the Town. I just want
- to note that the Town's interests
- may not be identical to Collus."
- 19 Do you recall being included on this
- 20 email chain?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yes, I do.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: What was your
- 23 reaction when Mr. Longo said that Ron and Corrine were
- 24 advising the Town and -- sorry, were advising Collus
- 25 and Collus' interests may not be identical to the

- 1 Town's?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: My biggest concern
- 3 was at that point in time that -- that I believed that
- 4 we were all one. The -- as I said before, the --
- 5 Collus was owned by the Town of Collingwood. I had
- 6 stated previously, maybe not at the hearing but I had
- 7 stated previously that in business, if I'm selling my
- 8 business, I wouldn't have a lawyer for my business and
- 9 a lawyer for me personally. I felt that was all one.
- 10 The other thing that -- that comes to
- 11 mind is, and as a lawyer you would know this better
- 12 than I do, that if Leo had an ab -- an absolute
- 13 concern on this thing or the Aird & Berlis law firm, I
- 14 would believe that they would have advised us to seek
- 15 independent legal advice, because you're obligated to
- 16 do that as a lawyer, I believe.
- 17 The other thing that -- that if it was
- 18 a separate company or -- or we needed other lawyers
- 19 involved or -- or had concerns of what that one is, I
- 20 would have thought that the law firm of Aird & Berlis
- 21 would have had us sign an affidavit agreeing that one
- 22 law firm can look after both entities.
- To my knowledge, none of that was done.
- 24 There's no red flags put up on that. The only red
- 25 flag I see is, may not be identical to Collus. I'm

- 1 not a lawyer but I do believe that there's obligations
- 2 if you thought, or if the law firm thought there was a
- 3 concern.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: So you then respond
- 5 to Mr. Longo and say:
- The fact of the best interests of
- 7 the Town has been -- the fact is
- 8 that the best interests of the Town
- 9 has been the driving force and
- 10 objective for this entire
- 11 initiative. On a consistent basis,
- 12 Council has been fully briefed and
- provided unanimous support to
- 14 continue with this direction."
- Why did you respond in that manner?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: The way I read
- 17 what he was saying at the time was that the interests
- 18 weren't identical, that the Town didn't have the same
- 19 interests as -- as Collus.
- In fact, this says basically that, yes,
- 21 we have it, we've been briefed, we -- we -- we are
- 22 steering the ship, the Town of Collingwood, and we --
- 23 we felt very comfortable that -- that the end result
- 24 was going to be positive.
- 25 Again, I'm not a lawyer. I depend on

- 1 Aird & Berlis and Aird & Berlis in my opinion is one
- 2 of the finest law firms there is in Ontario. There's
- 3 not a better planning lawyer, excuse me, than Leo
- 4 Longo in the whole province, or Jane Pepino.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: So it sounds like
- 6 your response to Mr. Longo was, our interests are
- 7 aligned. Is that fair?
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Was -- I'm sorry?
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: Our -- the Town of
- 10 Collus' (sic) interests are -- are aligned.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Totally, yes.
- 12 MR. JOHN MATHER: And then what I take
- 13 from what you're saying is, if there was anything else
- 14 to it, it was up to Aird & Berlis to raise that issue?
- 15 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Common sense tells
- 16 me that if you're my lawyer and if you had a concern -
- 17 I've just gone through some real estate transactions
- 18 with my own personal lawyer that also had us go out
- 19 and seek independent legal advice, and it was just our
- 20 matrimonial home.
- I would have thought that if there is a
- 22 concern, that there's an obligation on behalf of Aird
- 23 & Berlis to ensure that if it was necessary to have
- 24 independent legal advice, that we should do it.
- In this case, when it was all one home,

- 1 one family, one business, one owner, I don't think
- 2 they obviously thought it was a concern or they would
- 3 have advised us that way, I would hope.
- The other thing that -- that I've
- 5 always seen is, if you represent two (2) parties,
- 6 you'd want to make sure you had an affidavit signed in
- 7 advance. That was never suggested either. So my
- 8 interpretation of all this was, he was just thinking
- 9 that -- that our thoughts between Collus and the Town
- 10 of Collingwood were not aligned, or our interests.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So, and we saw
- 12 earlier the genesis of this conversation was Mr. Longo
- 13 asking the Town whether or not it had received
- 14 independent advice. Why did --
- 15 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That one.
- 16 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- so if we can
- 17 scroll up.
- I added the word "independent" and it
- 19 says -- and this is the initial email in this chain.
- 20 "Has the Town received advice that
- it is receiving fair value?
- 22 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's not what
- 23 that says to me.
- 24 MR. GEORGE MARRON: Can I clarify?
- 25 The question is -- is posited or poses, the Town --

- 1 whether there was some independent legal advice, and
- 2 the question was put on that basis, and I think that's
- 3 improper. I don't think the evidence is that.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: So I'll ask --
- 5 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Just a
- 6 minute. So what do you think it is?
- 7 MR. GEORGE MARRON: Well, the question
- 8 as I thought that was posed by Mr. Longo was -has
- 9 been referred to, and that the question was whether
- 10 there was competing interests as between the Town and
- 11 as between Collus. There was nothing posed by way of
- 12 whether there was independent legal advice. That --
- 13 that term was not employed.
- 14 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: So
- 15 it's the word "independent" that --
- 16 MR. GEORGE MARRON: Yeah. I'm just --
- 17 I'm just taking issue with the question as it has been
- 18 posed.
- 19 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: I -- I share
- 20 the concern. I thought Mr. Longo -- the issue that he
- 21 raised was has the -- has the Town received advice
- 22 with respect to whether or not they're getting fair
- 23 value, not whether or not they're getting independent
- 24 legal advice, and I think --
- 25 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Well --

- 1 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: -- they're
- 2 two (2) different things.
- THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: --
- 4 well I think he's --
- 5 MR. FREDERICK CHENOWETH: How was a
- 6 lawyer --
- 7 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: -- I
- 8 think he's -- I think when he's asking if they
- 9 received advice, that -- that it's receiving fair
- 10 value, he's implying that he's con -- he's questioning
- 11 whether they have received that advice and -- and
- 12 whether they -- well, I'm not going to go too much
- 13 further down that road.
- 14 Can you find a way to ask a question
- 15 without using the words "independent"?
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Yes, I should be
- 17 able to.
- 18 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: All
- 19 right.
- 20
- 21 CONTINUED BY MR. JOHN MATHER:
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So you receive an
- 23 email from the Town solicitor that says:
- 24 "Has the Town received advice that
- it is receiving fair value?"

- 1 There's a subsequent exchange which
- 2 leads to the Town solicitor saying that Ron and
- 3 Corrine are representing Collus and not the Town, and
- 4 that the interests may not be aligned.
- 5 You -- then we saw your response, which
- 6 was, as I understood it, the -- their interests are
- 7 aligned.
- 8 My question for you is: why didn't you
- 9 ask Mr. Longo whether or not the Town should be
- 10 getting additional advice?
- 11 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay. I want to
- 12 go on the one (1) aspect of what I cannot comment are
- 13 the financial aspects of the deal.
- 14 "Has the Town received advice that
- it is -- that it is receiving fair
- 16 market value?"
- I don't -- I don't take that as looking
- 18 for legal advice. I take that as looking for
- 19 accounting advice to make sure that -- that we've dot
- 20 our 'i's with accounts to make sure that we are
- 21 getting good value; that we have done a -- a cost
- 22 analyzation of what Collus is worth, and so on. So I
- 23 don't take that as legal.
- You had made the comment about Leo had
- 25 -- had suggested that Ron and Corrine were working for

- 1 Collus and not necessarily the Town. I don't see
- 2 that. He -- I'd like just to see the email where that
- 3 is.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: So we can scroll
- 5 down. Keep going. Keep going.
- 6 So -- sorry, go up. My apologies.
- 7 Now, this is an extract of the email, but it's -- Mr.
- 8 Longo writes:
- 9 "Ron and Corrine are advising
- 10 Collus, not the Town. I just wanted
- 11 to know that their interests not be
- 12 aligned."
- 13 And I guess -- maybe I'll put it this
- 14 way. I just want to know why, at this point, when
- 15 your lawyer is raising this issue, you didn't take any
- 16 other -- you -- you didn't take any further steps to
- 17 explore whether there was a conflict here, and whether
- 18 more needed to be done?
- 19 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: And the irony of
- 20 all of this, it's Leo -- Leo telling us the Town --
- 21 from Aird & Berlis -- that it may only be partially
- 22 addressed by Ron and Corrine. It's Leo from Aird &
- 23 Berlis advising the Town.
- 24 So I don't know if I've fallen on my
- 25 head coming in here, but if Leo's advising the Town of

- 1 this, is he not involved in the Transaction somewhat,
- 2 or advising us?
- So, in fact, Aird & Berlis were, in my
- 4 opinion, looking after the deal, and Aird & Berlis
- 5 were -- in fact, I think there's even correspondence
- 6 from Ron saying that he was looking after both the
- 7 Town's interest and -- and Collus. I believe there's
- 8 an email somewhere in there -- somewhere, but I -- I
- 9 just can't understand that -- how Leo can all of a
- 10 sudden, out of one (1) side of his mouth, saying,
- 11 well, they may not be resent -- representing you --
- 12 well, it's the same leg -- the same law firm. Like,
- 13 I'm -- it doesn't make any sense to me.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: So you were relying
- 15 on Leo to tell you --
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I was relying on --
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- if there was a
- 18 problem?
- 19 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: -- all -- Aird &
- 20 Berlis.
- 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. So if we
- 22 could go to paragraph 500.
- 23
- 24 (BRIEF PAUSE)
- 25

	96
1	MR. JOHN MATHER: So we see here that
2	at 6:29 PM, on January 19th, 2012, Mr. Houghton sent a
3	final version of the bylaw that we have been
4	discussing to Mayor Cooper, Ms. Almas, Ms. Wingrove,
5	yourself, and Dean Muncaster. And we see that
6	ultimately, the requirement that the Town solicitor
7	report back to Council before the he had this
8	version removed the requirement that the Town
9	solicitor report back to Council before the closing of
10	the transaction.
11	And then if we go down to the next
12	paragraph, Mr. Bonwick emails Mayor Cooper, yourself,
13	and Mr. Houghton, stating:
14	"Ed mentioned that the Mayor had
15	asked for a motion to be available
16	for a meeting this afternoon for
17	review by CAO, clerk, and Ed. I
18	would respectfully suggest that the
19	Mayor bring in Rick and Leo, either
20	in person or online. This will
21	provide an opportunity to provide
22	clear direction to Leo and the CAO
23	from both members of the review
24	team, who also happen to be mayor
25	and deputy mayor. If the mayor

- 1 believes this is to be a reasonable
- 2 approach, I would suggest it make --
- it must take place this afternoon."
- 4 At this point in time, why did you
- 5 understand that Mr. Bonwick was involved in
- 6 discussions about meeting with the Town's lawyer?
- 7 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: This was after the
- 8 decision was made, I believe, that we were going with
- 9 PowerStream publicly. I'm not sure the date on it,
- 10 but I think it was after the fact. And it was public,
- 11 and I think we were working a lot closer with
- 12 PowerStream, then, coming to a conclusion to put the
- 13 deal together.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you understand
- 15 Mr. Bonwick was representing PowerStream at this
- 16 point?
- 17 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Going back to the
- 18 June 29th meeting, it was very clear to us that he was
- 19 working for PowerStream. And I think this is just
- 20 continuing on from what we were told.
- 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: So was it your
- 22 understanding at this time that Mr. Bonwick is sending
- 23 this email in his capacity as a consultant for
- 24 PowerStream?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's correct.

- 1 MR. JOHN MATHER: Why would it be okay
- 2 for PowerStream's consultant to be involved in and
- 3 making suggestions about meetings with the Town's
- 4 lawyer?
- 5 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That would be a
- 6 good question to ask PowerStream, because I have no
- 7 idea.
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did it concern you
- 9 at the time?
- 10 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I never even gave
- 11 it a second thought, to be honest with you.
- 12 MR. JOHN MATHER: So in this -- in
- 13 this email, Mr. Bonwick is making suggestions on how a
- 14 meeting should proceed and -- and then how it can
- 15 provide clear direction to Leo and the CAO.
- 16 In making these suggestions, did you
- 17 understand that Mr. Bonwick was advancing
- 18 PowerStream's interests?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Again,
- 20 PowerStream's interests were already determined, I
- 21 believe, at this point in time, and I think what -- my
- 22 conclusion on -- on reading this -- and I don't really
- 23 remember the email -- but my conclusion on the -- the
- 24 whole thing is that he was trying to move forward to
- 25 get the deal put together and put it all -- finalize

- 1 it on behalf of PowerStream.
- 2 And if I can comment a little bit
- 3 further?
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: Sure.
- 5 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't ever
- 6 remember giving any clear direction to Leo, no.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: Well, that leads to
- 8 my next question, which is: do you remember attending
- 9 a meeting around January 19th, 2012, with the
- 10 individuals identified in this email?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't remember,
- 12 no.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Ms. Wingrove, in her
- 14 evidence, said that this meeting -- she recalled this
- 15 meeting occurring, and that at this meeting, her
- 16 recollection was that you had no appetite to include
- 17 the provision that there be a further report back to
- 18 Council.
- 19 Does that sound accurate?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: As I said
- 21 previous, 100 percent, that was out of the norm. Once
- 22 -- once -- as I stated earlier, once that we
- 23 determined that -- that we were going to pass an
- 24 authorization bylaw to authorize the mayor and -- and
- 25 clerk to sign the appropriate papers, it's then in the

- 1 administration of the clerk's department, which,
- 2 again, this isn't an unusual transaction.
- 3 They do it all the time. There is
- 4 absolutely no reason that you would have -- I think it
- 5 was, in my opinion, that perhaps Kim didn't know what
- 6 the clerk's department was all about, or didn't have
- 7 confidence in her. I have no idea, but there was no
- 8 reason that it had to come back to Council, other than
- 9 if you're going to have a ceremonial -- ceremonial
- 10 signature because the clerk puts all the
- 11 documentations together. They do all the
- 12 administration.
- I have no idea, and it was never
- 14 explained to me, why she wanted it to come back to
- 15 council.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we go to
- 17 paragraph 502, we see Mr. Bonwick sends an email at
- 18 7:02 p.m. of the same day, January 29th -- sorry,
- 19 January 19th reporting on the meeting to Mr. Glicksman
- 20 and Mr. Nolan. And it appears he's reporting on what
- 21 occurred at the meeting that was contemplated in the
- 22 previous email.
- Did you provide Mr. Bonwick with
- 24 information about that meeting?
- 25 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't think so,

101 no. 2 3 (BRIEF PAUSE) 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: So I would like to talk about --7 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I forget. MR. JOHN MATHER: I understand that 9 you have to leave at 12:30. 10 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Thank you. 11 MR. JOHN MATHER: Is that --12 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: At 12:30, that's right. 13 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: Is that still the 15 case? 16 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah, the -- it's 17 great, yeah. 18 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. 19 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Thank you. And 20 thank you for the --21 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Yes. 22 And -- and if -- if it gets to be 12:30, you speak up. 23 And I'll try to remember. 24 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay. Thank you. 25 I really appreciate it. Thank you.

- 1 CONTINUED BY MR. JOHN MATHER:
- 2 MR. JOHN MATHER: So I want to ask you
- 3 some questions about the termination of Kim Wingrove.
- 4 Can we load TOC119889?

5

6 (BRIEF PAUSE)

7

- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: And I believe
- 9 there's an attachment to this email. If we could open
- 10 that.

11

12 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. So just for
- 15 the benefit of the record, it's TOC119889.1. And if
- 16 we could scroll down to the bottom of the email chain.
- 17 So this is an email from you to Ms. Cooper and Mr.
- 18 Bonwick on March 10th, 2012. And you write:
- "Sandra, I would really like to meet
- 20 with you and Paul ASAP. I need to
- 21 discuss my concerns I have about
- 22 Kim. I have had -- I have had
- enough and the lack of -- and the
- 24 lack of ability. I am so pissed, I
- 25 want to deal with it ASAP. I

103 haven't really expressed how I feel 1 2 yet, but I feel if we don't deal 3 with her, I'm going to explode. Thanks, Rick." 5 Do you remember sending this email to Ms. Cooper and Mr. Bonwick? MR. RICHARD LLOYD: What I do remember 7 is the mayor reaming me out for -- including Mr. Bonwick, in the email. And this was in March 2012. I was frustrated when I did it. And I apologized to the 10 mayor because I generally collect my thoughts before I 11 -- I send something like this, but I was not very happy. And I can't even remember what it was about 13 14 now. 15 MR. JOHN MATHER: So I was going to ask if you recall what prompted this email? 17 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No, I don't. Ι 18 don't now. This was on a Saturday I think I sent it, 19 yeah. 20 MR. JOHN MATHER: So I understand you said that the mayor reamed you out for including Mr. 21 Bonwick, but why did you include Mr. Bonwick? 22 23 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I know that Mr. 24 Bonwick did advise her -- his sister somewhat.

Staffing issues aren't easy, HR issues. That's why

1 you have an HR department. I would always wish not to

- 2 have to -- to deal with HR issues, period.
- When it's the head of the Town, you
- 4 don't have an HR department to go to. You don't have
- 5 other department heads to -- to -- when you're
- 6 frustrated to be able to discuss it with.
- 7 I think I was pretty well at my end by
- 8 the look of that email. And, again, it was
- 9 inappropriate that included anybody else in it; I did.
- 10 Why did I do it? I don't know. I just know Paul does
- 11 advise his sister, which -- which happens, and I
- 12 shouldn't have.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Why shouldn't you
- 14 have not included him?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Well, just, again,
- 16 I don't want to throw staff under the bus. Mr.
- 17 Bonwick wasn't on council. And you know something? I
- 18 shouldn't have -- have included him in an email about
- 19 a staff person. I generally don't. I -- again, I --
- 20 I support staff. I -- I think we've got a great staff
- 21 in the Town of Collingwood.
- We had a weak link here. She was on by
- 23 contract. We terminated her contract. Council
- 24 decided to in the end; gave the appropriate severance
- 25 according to the contract.

- 1 And I just wish Ms. Wingrove the best.
- 2 She was given the opportunity to -- to resign, as you
- 3 know. And the only reason that opportunity was given
- 4 there, because sometimes it's a lot easier when you're
- 5 going for your next job that I resign from that one
- 6 rather than being let go or terminated.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: So going back to
- 8 this email, you said that you understood that Mr.
- 9 Bonwick sometimes advised Ms. Cooper.
- 10 Were you hoping that he would advise
- 11 Ms. Cooper with respect to Ms. Wingrove?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I was so
- 13 frustrated and -- at that point in time, I wasn't
- 14 expecting anything. I just wanted to vent. And
- 15 that's what I did with this email. Never did have a
- 16 meeting until later with the mayor about it.
- 17 But she phoned me right away and said -
- 18 I won't repeat exactly the words, but that it's in
- 19 appropriate to -- and I -- she was right --
- 20 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did she say why it
- 21 was inappropriate?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: -- that I
- 23 shouldn't have included Paul Bonwick in it and if I've
- 24 got an issue with the staff, contact her directly and
- 25 we'll have a meeting about it, and she was right.

- 1 And it was -- it was inappropriate that
- 2 I acted the way I did. I was very angry. And I -- to
- 3 now, eight (8) years later, I don't even know what it
- 4 was about, but...
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: So this is March
- 6 10th, 2012.
- 7 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's right.
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: The council meeting
- 9 where it is decided that Ms. Wingrove's employment
- 10 will be terminated is April 2nd, 2012.
- 11 What conversations or discussions did
- 12 you have between those two (2) dates about Ms.
- 13 Wingrove?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: With...?
- MR. JOHN MATHER: With anyone on
- 16 council.
- 17 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't -- I think
- 18 I cooled me jets after a while and -- and got myself
- 19 so I was fine. I don't -- I don't think there was any
- 20 other conversations. I know that other staff,
- 21 especially council -- some of the councillors were
- 22 having issues.
- 23 And I -- again, I don't know if there
- 24 was personal issues with Kim at home or anything like
- 25 that, but it -- it just wasn't working out. It was --

- 1 it wasn't -- it wasn't great.
- 2 And I'm not going to throw Kim under
- 3 the bus. She has great abilities. She came from the
- 4 Province. I think we were the first municipality she
- 5 ever worked for, so no doubt there's a huge learning
- 6 curve. And, you know, I -- I really don't want to get
- 7 into all the particulars other than what under oath I
- 8 have to -- to answer.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could go to
- 10 paragraph 582 of the Foundation Document.

11

12 (BRIEF PAUSE)

13

- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: So we see that Ms.
- 15 Wingrove was given notice of termination on April 3rd,
- 16 2012. And if we scroll up to the next paragraph, so
- 17 to 581, we see that there was -- at the April 2nd
- 18 council meeting there was a move to a close session,
- 19 which is what I referred to.
- I take it this is the council meeting
- 21 where the decision was made to terminate Kim Wingrove.
- 22 Is that correct?

23

24 (BRIEF PAUSE)

2.5

- 1 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I -- I don't know.
- 2 I'm just assuming that -- I'm reading above it is the
- 3 problem I'm having. I'm seeing:
- 4 "Council discharges CAO Wingrove.
- 5 Ed Houghton is appointed as acting
- 6 CAO for the Town." So.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: So sorry, and that
- 8 heading is not what my question's about. I showed you
- 9 the previous paragraph that said, "Ms. Wingrove was
- 10 given her notice of termination --
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay.
- 12 MR. JOHN MATHER: -- on April 3rd."
- 13 And there's an in camera council meeting the day
- 14 before that where they move in camera -- sorry, a
- 15 regular council meeting where they moved in camera and
- 16 discussed performance review for the Town CAO.
- 17 So I'm asking if this is the council
- 18 meeting where it was decided that Ms. Wingrove would
- 19 be terminated?
- 20 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I can only assume
- 21 it was that meeting.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Was the decision
- 23 made at a council meeting?
- 24 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: The decision no
- 25 doubt would be in camera because it was a personal

- 1 personnel matter. Again, in camera meetings, the
- 2 minutes are very limited, as you know. The vote
- 3 wouldn't be -- it wouldn't be a vote.
- 4 MR. JOHN MATHER: So that wasn't my
- 5 question. My question was, and I'll put it to you a
- 6 different way, how did council decide to terminate Kim
- 7 Wingrove?
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Unanimously or
- 9 near unanimous that was at the meeting, the discussion
- 10 -- open discussion, issues. If you've ever terminated
- 11 anybody, you would know that you'd be dealing with --
- 12 with all the issues that -- that would make up the
- 13 termination, why you would want to terminate them.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: And so that decision
- 15 was made at a council meeting?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: In camera.
- 17 MR. JOHN MATHER: Understood, at an in
- 18 -- at an in camera session in a council meeting?
- 19 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I believe so, yes;
- 20 it would have to be.
- 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: And it's possible
- 22 it's this one we're looking at?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's right. And
- 24 the only problem is I don't see that -- it says at the
- 25 Town council meeting. I don't know if there's an in

- 1 camera session. There should be in camera minutes.
- 2 That's why I'm hesitant on it.
- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: I'm simply asking
- 4 what your recollection was. And I understand it to be
- 5 that there was an in camera session at a council
- 6 meeting where the decision was made to terminate Kim
- 7 Wingrove?
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Totally agree with
- 9 you, yes.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. Who -- who
- 11 initiated the -- the topic to determine whether or not
- 12 there would be -- let me rephrase. Who in -- who put
- 13 forward the motion to have Ms. Wingrove terminated?
- 14 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's unfair.
- 15 There's -- again, in the in camera meetings there's no
- 16 motions. And I'm not trying to be silly with it.
- 17 Under the Municipal Act, they're not -- you're not
- 18 supposed to be able to do that.
- 19 I know that -- that -- no doubt that I
- 20 was aggressive about it or talking about it. Whether
- 21 I was the one that made the motion, I -- I have no
- 22 idea at this point. I don't know what minutes of in
- 23 camera session will tell. That's the --
- 24 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. And I'm just
- 25 seeking your recollection on who raised the idea at

1 1 ,

- 1 council.
- 2 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: It was -- when it
- 3 comes in to in camera, the chair of the meeting is --
- 4 is obviously the Mayor. The issue would have been
- 5 brought up, the CAO. And then there would be
- 6 discussion.
- 7 MR. JOHN MATHER: So --
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: And --
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: So -- I don't mean to
- 10 cut you off. But on the -- you said the issue would
- 11 have been brought up?
- 12 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: It would have been
- 13 on the agenda.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. Do remember
- 15 who requested it would be on the agenda?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: On the agenda
- 17 would be a personnel -- personal matter. I don't know
- 18 which council member, whether it was -- whether it was
- 19 me or who it was, to deal with the personnel matter.
- 20 MR. JOHN MATHER: Might it have been
- 21 you?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Pardon me?
- 23 MR. JOHN MATHER: Is it possible it
- 24 was you who put it --
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Oh, yes, quite

- 1 possible, yeah. Yeah.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: But you don't
- 3 recall?
- 4 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't -- that
- 5 fine detail I don't remember. I -- I remember that,
- 6 obviously, we went in camera. Obviously, a decision
- 7 was made. And in the end, a decision of -- of nine
- 8 (9) councillors or eight (8) councillors, whoever was
- 9 there, would -- would make the -- the determination.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. When the
- 11 determination was made did council have Ms. Wingrove's
- 12 replacement in mind?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That very night?
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Yes.
- 15 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I think it was
- 16 stressful enough to think of -- of dealing with --
- 17 with the HR issue. I would think that that night
- 18 there also was thinking, okay, we need to have
- 19 somebody interim to -- to steer the ship.
- 20 And I -- I would think -- I can't
- 21 remember, but I would think that Ed Houghton was
- 22 discussed at that point.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So you think Ed
- 24 Houghton was discussed. Do you recall Mr. -- spe --
- 25 do you specifically recall whether there was a

- 1 discussion about Mr. Houghton?
- 2 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I'm speculating,
- 3 put it that way. I'm speculating that -- that there
- 4 was discussion. I don't think we would -- we would
- 5 let our CAO go without a plan.
- 6 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. So you don't
- 7 think you would let the CAO go without a plan. Do you
- 8 recall if there was a plan?
- 9 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I think the -- I
- 10 believe that the plan was that Mr. Ed Houghton would
- 11 be the acting CAO until we could fill that seat.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you remember who
- 13 put forward the idea that Mr. Houghton could be an
- 14 acting CAO?
- 15 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: It was an
- 16 in-camera meeting eight (8) years ago, but possibly
- 17 me, possibly the mayor. It could have been possibly
- 18 any of the -- the other eight (8) councillors. I have
- 19 -- or seven (7) councillors.
- 20 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you remember when
- 21 you first discussed with Ed Houghton about the
- 22 possibility of him becoming acting CAO?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I know I discussed
- 24 after -- immediately after. Ed was reluctant to take
- 25 it. I remember trying to convince him because it was

- 1 only a short-term. We needed somebody.
- 2 And quite frankly, the clerk was really
- 3 good, and the clerk's department is so busy that we
- 4 didn't look at her to take the position at that point,
- 5 but feel that she has the ability that she could be a
- 6 CAO.
- 7 And other than that, there was no one
- 8 else that -- that -- you know, looking at the whole
- 9 town, that really could do it. And I don't like to
- 10 say, well, he was a last resort, but I don't know
- 11 anybody else in the town that had any qualifications
- 12 of management that -- that could've done the job other
- 13 than Ed Houghton at the time.
- 14 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you know what
- 15 Council did to look into what options were available?
- 16 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I think it was
- 17 very quickly done, giving them time to look at options
- 18 to fill that position. It was very clear to us that
- 19 Mr. Houghton somewhat reluctantly agreed to take on
- 20 the position only for a short-term because, again, he
- 21 was busy with -- with the other things he was doing.
- 22 And that was what our intention was.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Other than
- 24 Mr. Houghton and I think you mentioned Ms. Almas, do
- 25 you know if you or anyone else on Council considered

- 1 any other options?
- 2 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't think
- 3 anybody did at that point within the -- the town
- 4 family. Outside, yes, but not within -- within the --
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: And who's the "town
- 6 family"?
- 7 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Collus, all the
- 8 Collus Solutions, PUC, public works, pretty well all
- 9 the entities of the Town of Collingwood.
- 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we go to
- 11 paragraph 584.
- 12
- 13 (BRIEF PAUSE)
- 14
- 15 MR. JOHN MATHER: So this is an email
- 16 April 9th, 2012, so six (6) days after Ms. Wingrove
- 17 was given her notice of termination. It's an email
- 18 that you sent to Mr. Houghton, and you offered to help
- 19 him in his new role.
- 20 Do you recall -- if you need to take a
- 21 second to read it -- but my question is, do you recall
- 22 sending Mr. Houghton this email?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't, but I --
- 24 I see that it's here, and I obviously did send it.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: At this point in

- 1 time, you, it appears, know that Mr. Houghton is going
- 2 to be appointed CAO. Who else would've known?
- 3 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: All the Council,
- 4 some of the staff. I think he was already doing work
- 5 within the Town at that point, trying to set up a
- 6 management team, and so on. So it was really no
- 7 secret at that point.
- 8 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. And how was
- 9 the rest of Council informed?
- 10 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: The meeting --
- 11 whether it was that in-camera meeting or whatever --
- 12 that it was agreed that Ed Houghton, if -- if he'd
- 13 take on the position, would be the interim CAO for the
- 14 town of Collingwood.
- 15 MR. JOHN MATHER: So that's -- is that
- 16 something you recall, or is that what you're --
- 17 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I -- I recall
- 18 that, yes.
- 19 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we look at
- 20 this email, you say in the third paragraph:
- "Glad to see someone finally
- 22 steering the ship."
- Do you see that?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD:
- 25 "Glad to see someone finally

117 steering the ship." 1 2 That's right. Yeah. 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: And what did you mean by that? 5 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Somebody that can give clear direction, not unlike His Worship here; looking after the -- the -- this whole meeting; 7 somebody that is in charge; somebody that -- that is steering the ship. 10 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. And then --11 so if we open the document -- actually scroll down. 12 13 (BRIEF PAUSE) 14 15 MR. JOHN MATHER: No, okay. So open 16 the document TOC138988.1. 17 18 (BRIEF PAUSE) 19 20 MR. JOHN MATHER: So scroll down a 21 little bit. So this is the email we were looking at 22 from you to Mr. Houghton. 23 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay. 24 MR. JOHN MATHER: And then if you 25 scroll up, we see that you forwarded it to

- 1 Mr. Bonwick.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah.
- 3 MR. JOHN MATHER: Why did you forward
- 4 this email to Mr. Bonwick?
- 5 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: We -- I was -- I
- 6 had talked with Mr. Bonwick to try and convince Ed to
- 7 take on the position 'cause I knew they were friends.
- 8 And he did agree to take it on, and I just was letting
- 9 Mr. Bonwick know that -- that he took it on.
- 10 But I did ask it -- because again, Paul
- 11 is good friends -- or Bonwick's a good friend of
- 12 Houghton. I was trying every level I could, including
- 13 other staff, to try and convince Ed to take it on
- 14 because he was very reluctant to take on the role.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So can you tell me
- 16 more about the conversation you had with Mr. Bonwick?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I can't remember
- 18 the whole conversation. I was answering what I -- I
- 19 had done but --
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And was that
- 21 conversation before you sent this email to him?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Before this email,
- 23 yes. There was a conversation I had with Mr. Bonwick
- 24 about assisting to try and make Ed more comfortable to
- 25 take on the senior role at this point in time.

- 1 MR. JOHN MATHER: And what in that
- 2 conversation -- in that conversation, what do you
- 3 recall you told Mr. Bonwick about the ongoing
- 4 considerations for an interim CAO?
- 5 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I just simply
- 6 would've said to him that I'm trying to convince Ed to
- 7 take on the interim CAO's position. He's being very
- 8 reluctant. If you can help me, please do.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: At that point, had
- 10 Mr. -- did Mr. Bonwick know, again to your
- 11 understanding, that Mr. Houghton was in consideration
- 12 for the acting CAO position?
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't know if he
- 14 did -- or if -- because I had told him. I have no
- 15 idea. Yeah.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: And, again, why
- 17 would you be speaking to a person who was not staff or
- 18 on Council or in the town family about who -- about
- 19 the next CAO?
- 20 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: A friend. It's no
- 21 different than sometimes when -- when you're
- 22 recruiting someone, you go to everybody you can to try
- 23 and recruit it. Ed being reluctant to take it -- and
- 24 I think we were somewhat in a -- a problem, not having
- 25 a CAO.

1 I think the Municipal Act reads that we

- 2 must have a CAO, and we must have a -- a clerk. I
- 3 think that's the two (2) things that qualifies as a
- 4 municipality. So we didn't want to be without a CAO
- 5 for any time, because the legislation makes it very
- 6 clear, you must have a CAO.
- 7 So again, we -- we made the decision.
- 8 It may have been rash about Kim -- Ms. Wingrove. It
- 9 was quickly. We had to respond to have a CAO.
- 10 Ed Houghton was the best candidate. We had to
- 11 convince him. I felt we had to convince him because
- 12 he wasn't -- he was very reluctant. He took it
- 13 reluctantly and for -- you know, it was just an acting
- 14 position for a short-term. It was supposed to have
- 15 been three (3) months.
- 16 MR. JOHN MATHER: So if we could go
- 17 back to paragraph 585 from the Foundation Document.

18

19 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: So we saw that you
- 22 sent an email to Mr. Houghton in which you said, among
- 23 other things, glad to have someone finally steering
- 24 the ship. We saw that you forwarded that on to
- 25 Mr. Bonwick.

- 1 And then we have Mr. Houghton now
- 2 responding to that email, so directly to you. And
- 3 then -- so he says he needs to be given officially the
- 4 job so we can get on with this work at hand.
- 5 At this point, was Mr. Houghton not
- 6 officially the acting CAO?
- 7 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No. The bylaw, I
- 8 think, was the following week.
- 9 MR. JOHN MATHER: And then we go to
- 10 the next paragraph, you respond.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah.
- 12 MR. JOHN MATHER: And you say right
- 13 now we have a CAO until tomorrow, and then my hope
- 14 is -- was that Sandra would announce at department
- 15 heads that you were an interim CAO, and then a press
- 16 release stating that Ms. Wingrove had resigned,
- 17 et cetera.
- 18 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: That's correct.
- 19 MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. So at this
- 20 point in time, I take it, staff didn't know that
- 21 Ms. Wingrove was no longer the CAO.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: At this point in
- 23 time, they did know officially.
- 24 MR. JOHN MATHER: They -- they did
- 25 know officially?

- 1 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: According to this
- 2 email, it was hoped that -- announce it to department
- 3 heads that the interim CAO and a press release would
- 4 be stating that Ms. Wingrove has resigned.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: So at this point --
- 6 and I understand this to be contemplating a press
- 7 release to go out tomorrow -- so when you're sending
- 8 this email to Mr. Houghton, I understand it, that it's
- 9 not been officially stated that Ms. Wingrove was no
- 10 longer the CAO.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I don't -- I -- I
- 12 have no idea.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Okay. So at the end
- 14 of the email you say:
- "As I'm sure you are aware --"
- And then in all caps:
- 17 "-- I WILL BE STAYING INVOLVED ON
- 18 THIS, AS WELL AS ALL ISSUES GOING
- 19 FORWARD."
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Yeah.
- 21 MR. JOHN MATHER: Do you recall what
- 22 you meant by that?
- 23 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: No. But I -- I
- 24 would -- I believe that it was to assist Ed in any way
- 25 I could. So this issue, any other issues, I'll stay

- 1 involved to help you.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: So you were a -- a
- 3 general offer of support for Ed going forward.
- 4 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: A hundred percent.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: Did you make any
- 6 similar offers to support to Ms. Wingrove when she was
- 7 CAO?
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Ms. Wingrove was
- 9 already on staff whenever I came on Council. She was
- 10 hired by the previous Council.
- 11 There is no time that I would sit down
- 12 with any CAO already in the position, other than they
- 13 would know I would support whatever way I could. So
- 14 the answer, I guess -- sorry -- is no.
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Thank you. So going
- 16 down to paragraph 587. So Mr. Houghton then responds
- 17 to you, and it says -- writing:
- "Good job for you. 'Acting' CAO is
- 19 better than interim CAO because that
- 20 indicates a time. The other can be
- 21 until you and Council wishes to
- 22 change."
- 23 At this point in time, when it appears
- 24 that Mr. Houghton is about to be officially announced
- 25 as acting CAO, how long did you understand his term to

1 be, or how long did you think he'd be in the position?

- 2 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: As I said
- 3 previously, three (3) months is what I thought that we
- 4 were hoping to have.
- 5 MR. JOHN MATHER: So I'm looking at
- 6 the time, Your Honour. I may have very briefly more
- 7 questions for Mr. Lloyd. I'm wondering if we take --
- 8 I'm going to move on to something else. If we --
- 9 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: We
- 10 will stop --
- MR. JOHN MATHER: Stop.
- 12 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO:
- 13 -- we'll stop now.
- I just wanted to ask you one (1)
- 15 question. And in paragraph 586, you say, "I WILL BE
- 16 STAYING INVOLVED," and you put that in capitals. Why
- 17 did you do that?
- 18 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: I capped it only
- 19 because of the insecurity that Ed seemed to have going
- 20 into the position, to make sure that he was fully
- 21 aware that -- that I would be involved. I wanted to
- 22 emphasize it because, again, he was reluctant to take
- 23 on the CAO's position.
- 24 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: All
- 25 right. Well, we will -- we will break. Mr. Chadwick

- 1 is coming. We asked Mr. Chadwick to be available by
- 2 2:00, so lunch will be a little longer today than
- 3 normal.
- 4 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: And if I could
- 5 ask, when -- am I back tomorrow morning at 10:00?
- 6 MR. JOHN MATHER: We're starting
- 7 tomorrow at 9:00.
- 8 MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Nine's fine.
- 9 Yeah. So I'll be back here at 9:00, is that's okay?
- 10 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Yes.
- MR. RICHARD LLOYD: Okay. Thank you.
- 12 Thank you.

13

- 14 --- Upon recessing at 12:28 p.m.
- 15 --- Upon resuming at 2:01 p.m.

16

- 17 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Well,
- 18 we're off to an inauspicious start. I didn't bring my
- 19 notes with me, and the door was locked, and I couldn't
- 20 get in. But other than that, we're ready to proceed.
- 21 You can go ahead. I'll -- I'll --
- 22 yeah.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: So our next witness
- 24 will be Ian Chadwick.

2.5

1 IAN CHADWICK, Affirmed

- 3 EXAMINATION-IN-CHIEF MS. KATE MCGRANN:
- 4 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Good afternoon, Mr.
- 5 Chadwick.
- 6 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Good afternoon.
- 7 MS. KATE MCGRANN: To begin, would you
- 8 give us a brief overview of your education and work
- 9 experience, please?
- 10 MR. IAN CHADWICK: How far back would
- 11 you like me to go?
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: How about a summary
- 13 of your work experience that you felt was relevant to
- 14 the work you did on Town Council, and the work that
- 15 you were doing for Compenso Communications?
- 16 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I worked as -- in
- 17 local media for about a dozen years. I was a reporter
- 18 and editor with the Enterprise Bulletin newspaper.
- 19 For about eight (8) years, I was a
- 20 local correspondent for CBC radio's Ontario Morning
- 21 for a dozen years. I did some media work for Rogers
- 22 TV as a host for the Politically Speaking TV show. I
- 23 also ran a successful local franchise, a UPS store
- 24 franchise for eleven (11) years, giving me some
- 25 business experience.

- 1 MS. KATE MCGRANN: The media
- 2 experience that you've just described, during what
- 3 years did it -- were you doing that work?
- 4 MR. IAN CHADWICK: From early 1991 to
- 5 about 2002/2003 that I worked in local media.
- 6 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And the franchise
- 7 that you were managing, what years were you running
- 8 that business?
- 9 MR. IAN CHADWICK: From 1999 to 2010.
- 10 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And then what are
- 11 you doing currently?
- 12 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Currently, I am
- 13 semi-retired. I do some part-time work for a
- 14 nonprofit group; that's the Ontario Municipal Water
- 15 Association.
- 16 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And what is it that
- 17 you do for them?
- 18 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I do communications
- 19 work. I do a -- a media scan every week of news
- 20 stories about water. I manage their website. I do
- 21 some articles for them for related water and industry
- 22 related magazines and for the website.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Okay. I understand
- 24 that Ed Houghton is also working for that
- 25 organization. Is that correct?

1 MR. IAN CHADWICK: That's correct. He

- 2 is the CEO and I'm just one (1) of the workers.
- 3 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Turning to your
- 4 time as a member of Council during the 2010 and 2014
- 5 Council period, would you describe to us what you
- 6 understood your role and responsibilities to be as a
- 7 member of Council during that time?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Council members are
- 9 elected to serve the greater good, to -- to look at
- 10 the int -- interests of the entire community, to
- 11 provide service and support, to be liaisons between
- 12 residents and the -- the Town bureaucracy, to try to
- 13 maintain budgets, to try to maintain the lifestyle of
- 14 the community, to try to make sure that the
- 15 community's needs are met, and to make sure that
- 16 policies, bylaws, and processes are in place to keep
- 17 the community going.
- 18 MS. KATE MCGRANN: When you say that
- 19 Councillors are there to be a liaison between the
- 20 community and bureaucracy, how did you do that liaison
- 21 work as a Councillor?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Well, Councillors
- 23 are always open to being called by residents, to being
- 24 spoken to, and -- and I'm sure every Councillor has
- 25 had the experience of being approached at a grocery

1 store, at a theatre, on the main street, having issues

- 2 raised.
- 3 Issues can be as small a pothole in
- 4 front of their house to something larger like the need
- 5 for more swimming time, or more ice time, that sort of
- 6 thing. We're always open to -- to having community
- 7 groups approach us. We're always open to attending
- 8 community events, where people talk to you, or they
- 9 bring their issues up. For example, a -- a charity
- 10 might be running an event, then they bring their
- 11 issues up before you, that sort of thing.
- 12 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Okay. So you've
- 13 described to me how you would be receiving information
- 14 from the community. What routes do you then use to
- 15 get that information to staff?
- 16 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Several different
- 17 ways. And sometimes it can be brought up in Council,
- 18 in an open meeting, and it can be raised -- for
- 19 example, there'd be a special event, or there'd be a
- 20 special activity, a special interest that gets raised
- 21 at -- at Council for discussion, and then it gets
- 22 passed on to staff for action or for a staff report.
- 23 Sometimes it's just a matter of passing
- 24 those interests or those concerns on to the staff
- 25 member directory. For example, if somebody says

- 1 they've got a -- a pothole in front of their house,
- 2 and -- and cars might be in danger of -- of breaking
- 3 an axle, and we just send that off to the director of
- 4 Works, and let them deal with it.
- 5 MS. KATE MCGRANN: In the case of
- 6 taking information and sending it directly to the
- 7 staff member, was it your understanding that there
- 8 were staff members who were meant to be the recipients
- 9 of those messages and then -- then make sure that it
- 10 was dealt with by the appropriate person?
- 11 Were there contact people that you were
- 12 intended to use to share that information as a
- 13 Councillor?
- 14 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, but it was
- 15 also -- it was understood that Council and individual
- 16 Councillors -- did not give direction to staff, but
- 17 rather kept them informed.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Okay. So two (2)
- 19 questions about that.
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Sure.
- 21 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Who were -- who was
- 22 designated -- or who did you understand on staff you
- 23 were to pass information along to so that staff could
- 24 deal with it?
- 25 MR. IAN CHADWICK: It would -- it

- 1 would usually be to department heads, sometimes
- 2 directly to the CAO, but normal protocol that I recall
- 3 trying to follow was to make sure that the CAO and any
- 4 related department head would be copied with something
- 5 that would be relevant, but always the CAO would be
- 6 copied with something you sent to a department head.
- 7 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And then you made a
- 8 comment -- and unfortunately, I can't read my own
- 9 handwriting -- about what's -- what Council could do,
- 10 a list of what it couldn't do.
- 11 How did Council communicate decisions,
- 12 instructions, and directions to staff?
- 13 MR. IAN CHADWICK: That would be done
- 14 at a Council meeting, either in -- in the open, as,
- 15 for example, a -- a recommendation, or passing a
- 16 motion, or it would be done -- if it was in camera,
- 17 direction would be given, then that would normally be
- 18 approved outside in public session, at least a generic
- 19 form of approval would be provided.
- 20 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Was it the case
- 21 that individual Councillors could provide instructions
- 22 or directions to staff members directly?
- 23 MR. IAN CHADWICK: That was not --
- 24 that -- that's not a normal process. And unless it --
- 25 unless a department had asked specifically for

1 somebody to -- to help them with something, that would

- 2 not be normally done.
- 3 MS. KATE MCGRANN: During your time as
- 4 a Councillor, during the 2010 to 2014 Council period,
- 5 what was your working relationship with Town staff
- 6 like?
- 7 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I would say cordial
- 8 and professional.
- 9 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Who on staff did
- 10 you find yourself dealing the most with?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Department heads,
- 12 mostly that would -- and the CAO and the clerk. It --
- 13 it wasn't a common practice to deal with -- at -- at
- 14 least in my experience -- to deal directly with a -- a
- 15 staff member underneath a department head unless there
- 16 was something very specific, and -- and the department
- 17 head was already informed about it.
- 18 MS. KATE MCGRANN: We have heard
- 19 evidence from Ms. Wingrove and Ms. Almas about in
- 20 particular your relationship with Ms. Wingrove.
- 21 Before I summarize it, have you been following the
- 22 hearings?
- 23 Are you aware of evidence that's been
- 24 given about your relationship with Ms. Wingrove?
- 25 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I have read the

- 1 transcript, yes.
- 2 MS. KATE MCGRANN: So I will -- this
- 3 will be my summary, but both Ms. Almas and Ms.
- 4 Wingrove spoke to criticism that you had of Ms.
- 5 Wingrove that you shared with her directly. Ms. Almas
- 6 used the word "bullying." Ms. Wingrove referred to
- 7 critique.
- 8 What is your reaction to that evidence?
- 9 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Well, my first
- 10 comment would be that having a difference of opinion
- 11 should not be considered bullying. If you have a
- 12 difference of opinion with someone, you should express
- 13 it, and the role of a councillor is also to try to
- 14 make sure you are fully informed and you're fully
- 15 aware of all the consequences, all of the issues
- 16 raised.
- I find it a little curious that during
- 18 the time, and -- and both of them and myself served
- 19 under two (2) different mayors, they never raised it
- 20 with those mayors, who would have dealt with it and
- 21 made sure that that -- that there was no bullying
- 22 going on, and they apparently didn't raise it with
- 23 anybody in the HR office, who would have done exactly
- 24 the same, and in all of that time they never raised it
- 25 with me.

- 1 As for the comment that I was always
- 2 asking for clarification, I think that is the
- 3 responsibility of a councillor. It is the due
- 4 diligence of a member of Council to make sure they
- 5 understand all the information, that the information
- 6 is being presented in a way that the public will
- 7 understand, that they understand, that it's complete,
- 8 that there aren't any questions that are going to come
- 9 up later on about that information.
- 10 And the question of critiquing somebody
- 11 by email, I think it's -- it's -- is a far more proper
- 12 way for a Council member, if they have a concern or
- 13 they have an issue about, say, a staff report or what
- 14 information is being provided, to share those concerns
- 15 via email rather than doing it in a public session
- 16 where it would be perceived as adversarial and
- 17 confrontational, because Council should not appear to
- 18 be confrontational with staff.
- 19 So to save it all up for the public
- 20 meeting, it does tend to look like you're confronting
- 21 them and challenging them, and it shows that there's a
- 22 divide, but if you raise those issues in email, that
- 23 is -- that -- and usually those emails were shared
- 24 with other members of -- for example, with the mayor,
- other members of staff, or other members of Council.

- 1 So it's not a private discussion. It's
- 2 a discussion about things that involves all of
- 3 Council.
- 4 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Were you surprised
- 5 by Ms. Wingrove's account of her experience of working
- 6 with you?
- 7 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Surprised and
- 8 disappointed, because that's not my recollection of
- 9 events.
- 10 MS. KATE MCGRANN: During the 2010 to
- 11 2014 Council term, did you have any professional or
- 12 social relationships with the other members of Council
- 13 outside the work that you were doing together on Town
- 14 Council?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Nothing out -- no
- 16 social relationships, no parties. I don't play golf,
- 17 so I -- I miss out on all of that fun. Aside from
- 18 attending the things that councils normally get
- 19 invited to attend, such as -- such as public events,
- 20 not particularly, no. I can't recall -- we didn't
- 21 have dinners, that sort of thing, together.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: We have heard some
- 23 evidence that there were -- that information discussed
- 24 in -- in camera Council meetings wasn't necessarily
- 25 kept completely confidential all of the time.

- 1 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Sorry, could you
- 2 speak up a bit louder, please?
- 3 MS. KATE MCGRANN: I can do my best.
- 4 We have heard some evidence that information that was
- 5 discussed in in camera Council meetings wasn't
- 6 necessarily kept completely confidential at all times.
- 7 Is that something that you're familiar
- 8 with?
- 9 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, and I'm sure
- 10 you know that, especially in a small town, nothing is
- 11 absolutely 100 percent confidential and people do talk
- 12 to spouses, talk to friends, and talk to family, even
- 13 if it's not deliberately attempting to -- to confide
- 14 confidential information, but is -- it is a small
- 15 town. People know a lot of things.
- When I was on the media, I kind of
- 17 depended upon having some of that information provided
- 18 and sometimes members of Council would provide it to
- 19 the media in order to prevent a premature story being
- 20 released, which would have incorrect information.
- 21 They would let us know a little bit about what was
- 22 going on so that we were prepared for the meeting --
- 23 for -- for the story to come out and would not be
- 24 making a fool of ourselves or a fool Council by
- 25 presenting wrong information.

- 1 MS. KATE MCGRANN: During the time
- 2 that you were sitting on Council, during the period
- 3 between 2010 and 2014, was the sharing of information
- 4 discussed in in camera meetings outside of those
- 5 meetings of particular concern or problem for Council?
- 6 MR. IAN CHADWICK: It's always being
- 7 discussed by Council, because things get out and get -
- 8 there's also a rumour market in -- in the community
- 9 that sometimes guesses the right thing. They often
- 10 guess the wrong thing, but they sometimes guess
- 11 correctly. So people are always concerned about
- 12 information getting out.
- Mostly it was concern about, what I
- 14 recall, I should say, mostly was concern about
- 15 information about real estate and property deals
- 16 getting out and -- and being let out to the public or
- 17 to the real estate firms.
- 18 MS. KATE MCGRANN: What steps did
- 19 Council take to try to address concerns about the
- 20 sharing of confidential information outside of in --
- 21 in camera meetings?
- 22 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Well, I recall -- I
- 23 recall the mayor perhaps chastising us a couple of
- 24 times and other staff members mentioning it, but there
- 25 was no punitive measures taken. It really is up to

- 1 the conscience and -- and the morality, the ethics of
- 2 the individual, to make sure that they're not sharing
- 3 information that would affect the community in a
- 4 negative way.
- 5 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you remember it
- 6 being an issue of particular or unusual concern, the
- 7 sharing of confidential information outside of in
- 8 camera meetings?
- 9 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, I'm sorry, I
- 10 don't, and the three (3) terms times I sat, it was
- 11 always pretty much the same thing.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: To your knowledge,
- 13 do you remember during the 2010 to 2014 term being
- 14 aware that there were leaks of confidential
- 15 information about the Collus Power RFP or sale within
- 16 the community?
- 17 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, I was not aware
- 18 of any of those.
- 19 MS. KATE MCGRANN: I apologize if this
- 20 question sounds redundant, but you sat on Council, you
- 21 were not a member of the strategic task team that was
- 22 appointed to put together and review the RFP, is that
- 23 right?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, I was not.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you recall

- 1 receiving -- actually, oh -- I apologize, I'll come
- 2 back to that later.
- If we could turn to paragraph 209 of
- 4 the Foundation Document.

5

6 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 8 MS. KATE MCGRANN: So paragraph 209
- 9 describes a June 27th, 2011, Council meeting during
- 10 which Mr. Houghton makes an in camera presentation to
- 11 Council about a study that Collus was doing to
- 12 investigate strategic opportunities.
- 13 From what we've seen in the documents,
- 14 it appears that this is the first time that that
- 15 information is shared with Council about Collus
- 16 looking at its ownership options, and in particular
- 17 looking at a strategic partnership option.
- 18 When do you first recall hearing that
- 19 sale of some or all of Collus was being contemplated?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: To the best of my
- 21 recollection, it was at the May Council meeting in
- 22 which the Board of Directors presented the business
- 23 plan for Collus, and they did so in public and they
- 24 did discuss -- I believe it was the Chair of the
- 25 Board, Dean Muncaster, who talked about looking at the

- 1 options and explained that they had -- they had hired
- 2 KPMG to look at different options and give them some
- 3 ideas about where to go.
- 4 MS. KATE MCGRANN: So we have a video
- 5 of that meeting. There's a transcript available.
- 6 We've reviewed it. We don't see a reference to KMPG.
- 7 I understand you're speaking about your recollection
- 8 of that meeting.
- 9 Can you tell me more about what you
- 10 remember Mr. Muncaster saying about retaining KPMG?
- 11 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, I'm sorry, I
- 12 can't remember anything specifically about KPMG but I
- 13 do remember he used a phrase -- sorry.
- 14 I do remember that was a phrase that we
- 15 should be looking at our options while it was still a
- 16 seller's market and not when it was a buyer's market,
- 17 and this is because -- this is a year of a provincial
- 18 election. We were told that all three (3) parties of
- 19 that election were looking at reducing the number of
- 20 LDCs in the province, and before any legislated
- 21 changes came through that forced us into action, we
- 22 should be looking at our options beforehand.
- 23 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you remember
- 24 when he made that statement, what you interpreted that
- 25 to mean?

- 1 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Nothing more than -
- 2 than we should be proactive and -- and Council's
- 3 role is always to be proactive rather than reactive,
- 4 and we should be proactive in looking at what options
- 5 we had, whether there were -- whether there was
- 6 anything viable that would make a difference and that
- 7 for the betterment of the community.
- 8 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you remember
- 9 after hearing Mr. Muncaster speak and, in
- 10 particularly, make that comment, whether you
- 11 understood any specific steps were being taken with
- 12 respect to the utility?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: As far as I recall,
- 14 this was all going to be just exploratory. They were
- 15 creating a strategic planning task force to look into
- 16 it and come back to council with options. And we were
- 17 not doing anything until we had all of the options
- 18 explored and a viable choice presented to us.
- 19 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Okay. So I'm going
- 20 to turn your attention back to the June 27th meeting
- 21 but continue to speak with you about your memory of
- 22 the May meeting, as well.
- We see from the documents that Mr.
- 24 Houghton makes a slide presentation in which he
- 25 outlines several options that are available and

- 1 proposes that one (1) in particular, the strategic
- 2 partnership option, be examined by a strategic task
- 3 force.
- Are -- your memory that you've
- 5 described to us, do you specifically recall that being
- 6 from the May meeting or is it possible that it could
- 7 be from this June 27th meeting?
- 8 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Sorry, I -- I tend
- 9 to conflate those two (2) meetings together as to what
- 10 was being said. But I do remember that there was --
- 11 there -- there was talk that strategic partnership was
- 12 the preferred choice.
- One (1) of the comments made, and I'm
- 14 not sure whether it was made at that point in camera
- 15 or publically, but it was widely discussed among
- 16 members of council that we did not want to sell more
- 17 than 50 percent.
- 18 We did not want to lose control of the
- 19 utility, lose control of services and rates;
- 20 therefore, the option of selling completely was not
- 21 well received by council.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: I'm going to ask
- 23 that we move down in a little bit in the Foundation
- 24 Document. There are two (2) slides pictured above
- 25 paragraph 214. I'd like to show you the first one.

- 1 This slide on your screen is from the
- 2 presentation that Mr. Houghton made on June 27th in
- 3 camera to council. You see that it's got four (4)
- 4 points under the heading, "Next steps."
- If you look at the first point, there's
- 6 a discussion of Mr. Houghton speaking with potential
- 7 strategic partners to determine and stimulate levels
- 8 of interest. It mentions a possible preparation of an
- 9 expression of interest.
- 10 Point number 3 discusses establishing a
- 11 team comprised of members of the Collus Power Board.
- 12 Mr. Houghton, Mr. Fryer, CAO Wingrove and a council
- 13 representative to meet with interested strategic
- 14 partners, prepare an RFP and call the RFP.
- 15 Is this consistent with your memory of
- 16 the -- the presentation you received?
- 17 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, it is.

18

19 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 21 MS. KATE MCGRANN: When we look at the
- 22 minutes from this in camera portion of the June 27th
- 23 meeting we don't see any record of any decision,
- 24 consensus agreement, indication, direction from
- 25 council to proceed with the next steps that are set

- 1 out in this slide.
- 2 Do you remember how -- or what council
- 3 -- what indication, if any, council gave to Collus to
- 4 -- to move forward with this proposed plan?
- 5 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I -- in my
- 6 recollection, the discussions were about getting
- 7 Collus to move forward and come back with a more
- 8 concrete idea for a strategic planning team because
- 9 the team was going to take it from there for us.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: So, from your
- 11 recollection, was the only decision before council the
- 12 formation of the strategic team?
- 13 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes. But I -- I
- 14 believe the responsibility for creating that team was
- 15 given to Collus or the Collus Board at the time. It
- 16 would involve members of -- of the Town staff and
- 17 council, but it was not our responsibility to create
- 18 the team.
- 19 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you remember how
- 20 council agreed to and authorized Collus to assemble
- 21 that team?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, I don't recall
- 23 anything specific. We might have given -- it was
- 24 likely we gave direction to staff, in camera to staff,
- 25 to follow through on that.

- 1 MS. KATE MCGRANN: If council had
- 2 given direction to staff would you expect that that
- 3 direction would be reflected in the minutes from the
- 4 meeting?
- 5 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Quite often, when
- 6 we came out of an in camera session, and I -- this was
- 7 true all the time, both when I covered it in the media
- 8 and when I sat on council. Quite often, there would
- 9 be a motion that was generic in format that did not
- 10 give away any details. It would along the lines of
- 11 direct staff to follow through the recommendations
- 12 made in camera.
- I -- if there wasn't one (1), you'd
- 14 have to -- and sorry, you'd have to ask the clerk why
- 15 there wasn't any direction. That would be the
- 16 responsibility of the clerk and the former CAO to make
- 17 sure that those kinds of things were in the minutes.
- 18 MS. KATE MCGRANN: We've reviewed
- 19 agendas from council meetings. And it appears from
- 20 the agendas that one (1) of the items that shows up
- 21 regularly is approval of minutes from prior meetings.
- 22 As members of council, it's part of
- 23 your role to review and approve the minutes of your
- 24 prior meetings?
- 25 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, it is. We

- 1 would get the minutes with the agenda package. And
- 2 then people would read through the minutes and make
- 3 sure that the right people voted and the right things
- 4 were said, et cetera.
- 5 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And was part of
- 6 that exercise to ensure that items that ought to have
- 7 been noted in the minutes were in fact noted in the
- 8 minutes?
- 9 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Generally, yes.
- 10 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you recall
- 11 receiving a presentation from KPMG about a valuation
- 12 they did of Col -- oh, sorry, yes?
- 13 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Sorry, could I just
- 14 back up a little bit?
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Yes.
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: And I don't
- 17 remember how the structure was eight (8) years ago
- 18 but, quite often, the minutes would not appear in the
- 19 next meeting but sometimes would appear the second or
- 20 third meeting afterwards.
- 21 For example, if you only had one (1)
- 22 council meeting in a month, but then you have a
- 23 committee of the whole meeting, one (1) or two (2) of
- 24 those in-between, it might be two (2) to three (3)
- 25 weeks before you actually saw the minutes.

1 So the chance of somebody not noticing

- 2 anything or forgetting something in the interim -- we
- 3 didn't see -- see them in a draft format. We only saw
- 4 them in a final format in the agenda.
- 5 MS. KATE MCGRANN: I understand that
- 6 you said that you saw them in a final format. But did
- 7 you understand that it was part of your job as a
- 8 councillor to review that and, if you saw issues with
- 9 the final format minutes, raise them?
- 10 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, it was.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you recall
- 12 receiving a presentation, either a presented slide
- 13 presentation in-person or just receiving materials
- 14 from KPMG with respect to a valuation that they did of
- 15 Collus Power?
- 16 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I don't recall
- 17 receiving it directly at all. I've seen it since.
- 18 I've seen that material since, but I don't recall re -
- 19 seeing it all during the time that I was on council.
- 20 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And similarly, do
- 21 you recall receiving a presentation or materials or a
- 22 report setting out KPMG's assessment of potential
- 23 ownership options for Collus Power?
- 24 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, I do not.

2.5

1 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 3 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Turning from your
- 4 work on council for a second to other work that you
- 5 were doing during the 2010 to 2014 time period, it's
- 6 our understanding that you did some work for Paul
- 7 Bonwick's company, Compenso Communications Inc.
- 8 Is that right?
- 9 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, that's
- 10 correct.
- 11 MS. KATE MCGRANN: What kind of work
- 12 were you doing for him?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Well, in March of
- 14 2011 I was hired to create and present a workshop for
- 15 First Nations chiefs and the staff in New Brunswick on
- 16 a media relations, and it was held in Moncton, New
- 17 Brunswick.
- 18 And then, in August, I began to do a
- 19 news wire scan to look at publically accessible news
- 20 stories, editorials, blogs, social media, that kind of
- 21 thing, as what was being said about the energy sector.
- 22 And that included a broad range of topics in the
- 23 energy sector, from green energy to political changes
- 24 to just what energy companies were doing themselves.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Starting with the

- 1 work that you were doing March 2011 --
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes.
- 3 MS. KATE MCGRANN: -- how did you come
- 4 to be doing that work with Mr. Bonwick?
- 5 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Mr. Bonwick
- 6 contacted me and asked me if I'd be interested in --
- 7 in putting one (1) together.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you know why he
- 9 contacted you to do that work?
- 10 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Well, I can't speak
- 11 for Mr. Bonwick, but I certainly have had the
- 12 experience in the media. I've been a writer for the
- 13 last forty (40) years. I'm fairly accustomed to
- 14 talking in front of people. I've -- my apologies.
- 15 I'll try to bring it a bit closer.
- 16 I -- I've had experience. I've given
- 17 workshops. I used to teach courses, so I -- I have
- 18 the experience, so I'm assuming that, especially in a
- 19 small town, there's not a -- not a big group of people
- 20 that have all that experience in -- in a small group
- 21 or in just one (1) person. So I -- I can only assume
- 22 that he liked what he saw in my experience.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: And similarly, with
- 24 respect to the news scan work that you started doing
- 25 in August 2011, a slightly different exercise than the

- 1 --
- 2 MR. IAN CHADWICK: M-hm.
- 3 MS. KATE MCGRANN: -- than the media
- 4 workshop. How did you come to be doing that work for
- 5 Mr. Bonwick?
- 6 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Well, Mr. Bonwick
- 7 contacted me -- and I believe it was late July -- and
- 8 asked me if I could put together a weekly collation
- 9 of -- of news stories and -- and editorials and issues
- 10 about the energy sector.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: What did you
- 12 understand about why he wanted you to do that
- 13 particular kind of news scan work about the energy
- 14 sector?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Well, as -- as I
- 16 recall, he told me he had two clients in the energy
- 17 sector and -- and was possibly looking for more. And
- 18 he wanted -- wanted to keep them in -- informed about
- 19 changes in the industry and what was going on because
- 20 everybody was concerned about the political changes
- 21 that were coming.
- But also, this was a time when the
- 23 green energy was very big. The Ontario government had
- 24 released less than a year before their first long-term
- 25 energy plan, so green energy was very big on the

- 1 horizon. There were political changes coming in the
- 2 nature of LDCs.
- 3 And as far as I recall back then, there
- 4 was nobody doing this kind of weekly summation, but I
- 5 can't be sure because I wasn't involved in the energy
- 6 sector before then.
- 7 But to keep track of what was going on,
- 8 both locally and across the province and, in some
- 9 cases, across the country, looking for stories, that
- 10 kind of thing, that he could then put together and --
- 11 and send to his clients.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: When you began
- 13 working for him, did he tell you who his two clients
- 14 were?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, he did. He
- 16 was very clear. He said PowerStream, and I believe it
- 17 was Blackstone Energy.
- 18 MS. KATE MCGRANN: About how much time
- 19 a week would the news scan work that you were doing
- 20 take?
- 21 MR. IAN CHADWICK: It would depend
- 22 upon the week and how much news there was, but it
- 23 would take me anywhere from four (4) to
- 24 seven (7) hours a week to put it together, 'cause I'd
- 25 have to read all the stories, go through online, do

- 1 numerous Google searches, collate all these stories,
- 2 and then put them together, and send them off.
- But it would take, I'd say, probably
- 4 the least amount of time, it would take four (4) to
- 5 five (5) hours a week minimum.
- 6 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And what were the
- 7 terms on which you were doing that work for him?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: I billed him once a
- 9 month for a fixed amount.
- 10 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Did you have any
- 11 understanding or agreement as to how long you would be
- 12 doing this work for him?
- 13 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, I did. It was
- 14 only to go on to the end of the year. Now because at
- 15 that point, there'd be a new government in place and
- 16 that was the only -- that was as far as he wanted me
- 17 to do it.
- 18 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Were the terms of
- 19 your employment -- the rate that you charged, the
- 20 length of time that you were to be doing this work --
- 21 set out in any written agreement as between the two of
- 22 you?
- 23 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, we didn't have
- 24 a written agreement. I estimated how long it would
- 25 take me on the rates that I was charging at the time,

- 1 and I quoted an amount, and I stuck to that amount.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: If we could
- 3 turn --
- 4 MR. IAN CHADWICK: So did he, by the
- 5 way.
- 6 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Sorry. I -- I
- 7 spoke over you, and I didn't hear.
- 8 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Sorry. So did he.
- 9 He -- we both stuck to that amount, and that was the
- 10 fixed rate.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Was there any
- 12 particular reason that those terms weren't reduced to
- 13 writing?
- 14 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Sorry. Could you
- 15 say that again, please?
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Was there any
- 17 particular reason that those -- those terms of the
- 18 work that you were doing for Mr. Bonwick were not
- 19 reduced to writing, set out in a written contract or
- 20 an agreement or an email or something like that?
- 21 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Not for that -- no
- 22 particular reason for that. I -- I'm not -- I'm not
- 23 in a position to -- to say why he didn't offer a
- 24 contract for that, I know he did offer a contract for
- 25 other things for doing a -- the media relations

- 1 workshop with the -- with the idea that we would
- 2 expand that and take that on to other municipalities
- 3 of other First Nations.
- But for this, this was just a
- 5 short-term project. I don't see why there would have
- 6 to be a contract. There's -- the information that was
- 7 being gathered was all public domain or in the -- in
- 8 the public domain. It was all easily available to
- 9 anybody. So it's not like I was doing something that
- 10 was particularly private or confidential.
- 11 MS. KATE MCGRANN: It looks like at
- 12 some point during the time that you were working for
- 13 Mr. Bonwick, you are given a Compenso Communications
- 14 email account. Do you remember that?
- 15 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I -- I remember
- 16 having it, but I don't remember ever using it.
- 17 Originally, I believe the idea was to expand the media
- 18 relations workshop into something larger in which he
- 19 would have resource people he would be able to call
- 20 on, people who identify and -- and advertize and say
- 21 who the -- who these are, and so that people would
- 22 understand they have credentials behind them. As far
- 23 as I recall, I never ended up using it.
- 24 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Okay. Fair to say
- 25 that the email address is assigned to you so that if

- 1 you did move forward to continue to do that work, you
- 2 could present as a -- as if you were part of the same
- 3 group working on the same thing?
- 4 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes. And -- and as
- 5 I recall, there were other people listed on -- on
- 6 Mr. Bonwick's website to -- as -- as resource people
- 7 for -- for credentials.
- 8 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And I think you
- 9 mentioned that you don't recall using that email
- 10 address, if I got that right?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: No.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Any reason why you
- 13 didn't use it?
- 14 MR. IAN CHADWICK: At that point, I
- 15 probably -- I had a Council email; I had a personal
- 16 email; I had a Gmail account; and possibly even
- 17 others. I just didn't use it, just didn't have any --
- 18 nobody -- as far as I know, nobody ever sent anything
- 19 to me.
- 20 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Coming back to
- 21 Mr. Bonwick's two clients and -- and him identifying
- 22 them to you in August when you began working for
- 23 him -- August 2011 -- what did you understand
- 24 Mr. Bonwick was doing for those companies?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: The only thing I

- 1 really understood, he was doing some -- some
- 2 consulting and some information work, public relations
- 3 work.
- 4 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Consulting and
- 5 public relations are two terms that can mean different
- 6 things to different people. What kind of -- what did
- 7 you think he was doing when he was consulting for
- 8 these companies?
- 9 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I didn't ask, and
- 10 at that time, neither of those companies names had
- 11 ever appeared on -- on anything I had ever seen
- 12 before. So I -- my -- my concern was what job I was
- 13 going to do for him, not what he was doing for
- 14 somebody else.
- 15 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And I don't mean to
- 16 belabour the point, but when you say you understood he
- 17 was doing consulting, you didn't ask --
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: No.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: What -- what, in
- 20 your mind, did you think that involved?
- 21 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Consulting on the
- 22 energy sector. Mr. Bonwick has a lot of contacts in
- 23 government and a lot of contracts across the province
- 24 in different industries. He -- he's a good -- being a
- 25 good resource person for a lot of different people, a

- 1 lot of companies and First Nations. He's done a lot
- 2 of consulting work for them.
- 3 Consulting can mean a lot of different
- 4 things to a lot of different people. I assume that he
- 5 was doing for -- for the energy sector what he does
- 6 generally for everybody else.
- 7 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And what is it that
- 8 he does generally for everybody else?
- 9 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Oh, he -- he talks
- 10 to the government. He -- he acts as liaison between
- 11 government bureaucracies and between individuals or
- 12 First Nations people. He's -- he facilitates meetings
- 13 with people. He arranges things. He provides --
- 14 obviously from the service I was giving to him, he
- 15 provides information from outside to other people.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: The description of
- 17 the kinds of tasks that you just laid out for us,
- 18 would it be a similar kind of work that you envisioned
- 19 him doing when you understood he was doing public
- 20 relations work for these two companies?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: No. I understood
- 22 he -- he was likely to do public relations work
- 23 because I knew he was doing some of that for the
- 24 First Nations people that he worked with. I didn't
- 25 ask him specifically what task he was doing. As I

- 1 said, neither of those two companies were known to me
- 2 at the time. I had no idea who they were.
- I had to look both of them up just to
- 4 find out who they were and to -- just to make sure
- 5 that when I was going through these scans on the -- in
- 6 the news and in -- online that if their names popped
- 7 up that I would be aware of them; that I would make
- 8 sure that if any stories had them in it that I would
- 9 include them in the newswire.
- 10 MS. KATE MCGRANN: So we've looked at
- 11 a June 27th --
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: M-hm.
- 13 MS. KATE MCGRANN: -- in-camera
- 14 meeting where Council received a presentation that
- 15 Collus Power is going to start looking for a strategic
- 16 partner.
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: M-hm.
- 18 MS. KATE MCGRANN: When you began
- 19 working for Mr. Bonwick in August 2011 doing the
- 20 energy sector news scans and you understand that he
- 21 was working for two energy sector clients, did you
- 22 consider at the time whether his work may include work
- 23 related to the search for a strategic partner that
- 24 Collus Power was undertaking?
- 25 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, I didn't, but

- 1 you have to understand at that point Council had not
- 2 been presented with anything to make a decision on,
- 3 aside from creating a team to look at this
- 4 information.
- 5 The RFP was not released until October
- 6 of that year. So this is three or four months before
- 7 that, Council had not heard any names of any potential
- 8 partners, Council didn't have any idea where -- who a
- 9 strategic partner might be, how that might work, and -
- 10 and to be fair, most of Council had really little to
- 11 -- to no information about how the energy sector
- 12 worked aside from the -- the annual business plan that
- 13 was brought to -- to Council by Collus, we really
- 14 didn't understand it. That was just a little bit at
- 15 arm's length. We didn't really get any detailed
- 16 information about it.
- 17 And who a strategic partner might be,
- 18 how that might work. All of those details were never
- 19 presented until much later.
- 20 MS. KATE MCGRANN: What was your
- 21 relationship with Mr. Bonwick like, outside of the
- 22 work that you were doing for him?
- 23 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Like I said, I
- 24 don't play golf, so I don't travel in a lot of his
- 25 circles.

- 1 It was professional. We didn't have a
- 2 social life. I've -- I've known Paul for many years
- 3 through media, but we're -- we're not friends, we're -
- 4 we had a business relationship. We didn't
- 5 socialize, we didn't go to dinners or we didn't go
- 6 golfing, as I said, together.
- 7 Most of our communication, actually,
- 8 was pretty much through e-mail during -- during that
- 9 time period.
- 10 MS. KATE MCGRANN: The next -- the
- 11 next update we see Council receiving with respect to
- 12 the Collus Power strategic partner project is in
- 13 October of 2011.
- 14 Do you recall whether you received any
- 15 information or updates on what Collus Power was doing
- 16 with respect to a strategic partner between the June
- 17 27th in-camera meeting and the beginning of October?
- 18 MR. IAN CHADWICK: As far as I recall
- 19 there was no information provided.
- 20 MS. KATE MCGRANN: If we can turn to
- 21 paragraph 288 of the Foundation document.
- 22 Could you scroll up a couple of
- 23 paragraphs. Actually, I'll just tell you when to
- 24 stop. There, that's perfect. Thank you.
- So this paragraph describes that on

- 1 October 3rd, 2011, Collus Power provides an in-camera
- 2 update to Town Council, and this presentation
- 3 describes the bidding process envisioned for a Collus
- 4 Power shares and the RFP that is going to be issued,
- 5 along with the evaluation criteria and the waiting
- 6 that's being assigned to financial and nonfinancial
- 7 components.
- 8 Do you recall receiving an update like
- 9 this?
- 10 MR. IAN CHADWICK: As well as I can,
- 11 eight years later, yes.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: I'm going to ask
- 13 that the slide presentation be shown on the screen, so
- 14 that's document ALE5133.0003. And I'd like to go to
- 15 slide 11, please.
- 16 So in this update that was given to
- 17 Council on October 3rd, one of the pieces of
- 18 information that was provided was this timeline that's
- 19 centred at the second bullet point here.
- It identifies that the RFP is going to
- 21 be released on October 4, so the next day.
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes.
- 23 MS. KATE MCGRANN: The RFP will be
- 24 called on November 16th, the findings of the RFP will
- 25 be presented to the Collus Board on December 2nd, to

- 1 Council in-camera on December 5th. And then it
- 2 indicates a resolution by Council, if appropriate, to
- 3 take place on December 12th.
- 4 Do you recall whether you had been
- 5 provided with this timeline information before this
- 6 October 3rd, 2011 meeting?
- 7 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, I don't believe
- 8 we were provided that. When I say "we", I don't
- 9 believe anybody on Council -- not on the strategic
- 10 planning team was provided that information. I
- 11 certainly wasn't.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: At this point in
- 13 time, Council is now being advised that an RFP is
- 14 going to be released to look for a strategic partner.
- 15 Did you think about the work that you
- 16 were doing for Mr. Bonwick and that Mr. Bonwick in
- 17 turn was doing for PowerStream, did you consider
- 18 whether Mr. Bonwick may be involved in -- in
- 19 responding to this RFP with PowerStream?
- 20 MR. IAN CHADWICK: By that point I
- 21 knew a little bit more about PowerStream, that they
- 22 were a fairly aggressive, outgoing company, LDC in --
- 23 in the industry.
- 24 And I realize that in future I would
- 25 probably have to stand aside from the table, just in

- 1 case they got involved in any of the -- any of the
- 2 bidding or any further process.
- 3 But not specifically that they were
- 4 going to bid, I had no -- I had no idea about that at
- 5 the time.
- 6 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Did you consider
- 7 whether you should, in advance of this in-camera
- 8 portion, whether you should declare a potential
- 9 conflict and recuse yourself from this section of the
- 10 meeting?
- 11 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Excuse me, of this
- 12 -- of this meeting, of the October meeting?
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Yes.
- 14 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, I didn't
- 15 because an RFP is not specific to any company and not
- 16 specific to any business, it's an exploratory process,
- 17 exploratory device used to get information back so
- 18 that we can find out what's going on.
- No, I didn't. I didn't think it was --
- 20 it would be appropriate at that point.
- 21 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Was it the case
- 22 that you felt that because new decisions weren't being
- 23 made at this meeting, that you didn't need to recuse
- 24 yourself? This is still an information receiving
- 25 exercise, not a decision-making exercise?

- 1 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, that's
- 2 correct. I -- I did not feel that -- that sending out
- 3 an RFP was making a decision that was either
- 4 irrevocable or would -- would affect the community at
- 5 that point, because no decision had been made to -- to
- 6 sell anything, and certainly nothing had come in. So
- 7 we had no idea what would be offered.
- 8 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Similar to the June
- 9 27th, 2011 meeting, the minutes of this meeting don't
- 10 reflect any authorization agreement, decision,
- 11 direction from Council to issue the RFP or take this
- 12 next step down -- down this path.
- Do you recall if Council authorized the
- 14 release of the RFP at this meeting?
- 15 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I don't recall the
- 16 specific direction, but I'm assuming the fact that the
- 17 RFP was released and it was all put together that we
- 18 must have given them the go-ahead, because otherwise
- 19 they would not have been able to release it on the
- 20 next day.
- 21 Whether that was reflected in the
- 22 minutes or not, again, you'd have to take that up with
- 23 either the clerk or the former CAO as to why it wasn't
- 24 there.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Why -- why would an

- 1 absence of direction from Council stop the release of
- 2 the RFP on October 4th?
- 3 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I -- Council, the
- 4 Town being the sole shareholder for Collus would --
- 5 would have to make that decision to -- to tell him to
- 6 go ahead. Without direction from Council they
- 7 couldn't do it on their own because they couldn't sell
- 8 it, they couldn't sell even a portion of it without
- 9 approval from Council. If Council wasn't going to let
- 10 them send out an RFP, they weren't going to be able to
- 11 sell anything.
- 12 So Council would have had to approve
- 13 sending out an RFP.
- 14 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Okay, I understand
- 15 why Council approval would be required to effect a
- 16 sale, but I'm not sure I understand why the absence of
- 17 a Council approval would stop the release of an RFP
- 18 document.
- 19 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Well, I'm not a
- 20 lawyer, but I would assume that the -- that the legal
- 21 process would not allow the sole shareholder of the
- 22 company -- sorry, would not allow the company to -- to
- 23 even approach a sale without having the approval of
- 24 the sole shareholder.
- 25 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Is it the case that

- 1 you don't recall Council agreeing to or directing
- 2 Collus Power to release this RFP, but by the very fact
- 3 that it was released you assume that there must've
- 4 been authorization given?
- 5 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I recall we had a
- 6 discussion, and to the best of my recollection, it was
- 7 unanimous agreement to go ahead with an RFP. I don't
- 8 recall any dissension whatsoever, up until this point,
- 9 about selling.
- 10 So -- or about, sorry, about sending
- 11 out an RFP. So at this point Council had always been
- 12 in approval of following through the process because
- 13 the process is not, as I said earlier, it wasn't
- 14 irrevocable, we weren't selling it, we were just
- 15 getting the information back so we could make a
- 16 decision.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: What do you
- 18 remember about how -- how Council signalled its
- 19 unanimous agreement to proceeding with the RFP? Was
- 20 there a show of hands or did -- were people asked to
- 21 stand or sit?
- 22 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Generally in-camera
- 23 the -- there would be a show of hands. As I said, it
- 24 was quite often that -- that would follow up with a
- 25 public declaration to -- to follow through on that,

- 1 but usually it was a show of hands in-camera.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Okay, so I
- 3 understand that usually it was a show of hands in-
- 4 camera and with respect to this particular meeting on
- 5 October 3rd, 2011, in which you learn about the RFP
- 6 that's to be released the next day, do you recall a
- 7 show of hands being taken with respect to whether it
- 8 should go or not.
- 9 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Sorry, I don't
- 10 recall that specific meeting and that specific show of
- 11 hands.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Moving forward in
- 13 time, I'd like to look at paragraph 371 of the
- 14 Foundation Document.

15

16 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- MS. KATE MCGRANN: This paragraph
- 19 describes an exchange on November 14th, 2011. As it
- 20 pertains to you, Mr. Houghton asked you to review a
- 21 draft press release about the bid process.
- He sends you an email with the subject
- 23 line, "A favour." And he asks you to take a look at
- 24 it. We can call up the email in a second. But my
- 25 first question for you is, was this an unusual request

- 1 for you to receive, reviewing a draft press release or
- 2 other communication?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, it wasn't. I
- 4 had done it several times for other members of staff
- 5 previously, including the former planner, Gord
- 6 Russell, and for former planner, Robert Voigt. As a
- 7 matter of fact, I edited his entire urban design
- 8 quidelines manual.
- 9 We -- at that point, the Town did not
- 10 have a communications officer and did not have anybody
- 11 with the experience or the education to do any copy
- 12 editing. And that's basically what I would be asked
- 13 to do, not -- not to look at content, but to make sure
- 14 that -- that the punctuation, the grammar, the style,
- 15 et cetera, were consistent and clear, there were no
- 16 spelling mistakes, that sort of thing.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you remember
- 18 receiving this request for assistance in particular?
- 19 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Not in particular.
- 20 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Okay. I was going
- 21 to ask you if -- if when you received this you thought
- 22 it was unusual or you had any --
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: No.
- 24 MS. KATE MCGRANN: -- had any concerns
- 25 about it?

1 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, I don't --

- 2 didn't. And when --
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you remem --
- 4 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Excuse me. If I
- 5 can say that in a small -- in a small town with small
- 6 council, people bring all sorts of different skills to
- 7 the table, and -- and you try to use those skills to
- 8 the benefit of the community.
- 9 Some people -- the former deputy mayor
- 10 was a contractor. He knew lots of things about
- 11 contacting, about building, about design, about --
- 12 about infrastructure, so the staff would sometimes
- 13 turn to him.
- 14 Former counsel Lloyd was in marketing
- 15 and -- and advertising, so people could talk to him
- 16 about that. Former councillor, Dale West, but big in
- 17 sports. People could talk to him about that.
- I was from media, had an experience as
- 19 a writer, as an editor, so turning to me and asking me
- 20 to help out with something was perfectly natural, and
- 21 -- and it should be the good -- that's the good way
- 22 council should work with its staff if the staff feel
- 23 comfortable about saying can you look -- can you help
- 24 with something because it shows that you're working
- 25 together on things.

- 1 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you remember
- 2 what your response to this request to review the draft
- 3 press release as a favour was?
- 4 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I -- I would have
- 5 just gone through it, made my editing changes, made my
- 6 notes and sent it back.
- 7 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And I'm reacting to
- 8 the fact that you said that you would have done this.
- 9 Do you have a specific recollection of doing that?
- 10 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, and it --
- 11 because it wasn't the -- the first time. And again,
- 12 something that's eight (8) years ago, it's a little
- 13 hard to remember exactly pressing the send button on -
- 14 on a particular piece of email.
- 15 MS. KATE MCGRANN: You can see from
- 16 this paragraph that Mr. Houghton and Mr. Bonwick are
- 17 discussing this press release. Were you aware that it
- 18 was a topic of conversation as between the two (2) of
- 19 them when -- when you were asked to review it?
- 20 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No. And none of
- 21 that was shared with me.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: And more generally,
- 23 stepping back, to your knowledge at the time, were Mr.
- 24 Bonwick and Mr. Houghton discussing the RFP process at
- 25 -- on any level?

1 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I was unaware of

- 2 that.
- 3 MS. KATE MCGRANN: The next update --
- 4 MR. IAN CHADWICK: If -- if I -- if I
- 5 can interrupt here with -- with a comment. Having --
- 6 having read through the Foundation Document and
- 7 reading the stuff and reading the material has come
- 8 out later, I'm aware now that the strategic planning
- 9 team approached different potential partners and spoke
- 10 to them.
- 11 So for the part -- for those people
- 12 that had been spoken to, I don't -- I don't know
- 13 because I wasn't part of those discussions, but I'm
- 14 pretty sure they knew that this process was going
- 15 through and how it was working so that people involved
- 16 in PowerStream or people involved in Hydro One or
- 17 Veridian or any of the others would have known that
- 18 this was the way that -- that council was looking at
- 19 going, would have known how the process worked.
- 20 It's not exactly a secret process to
- 21 send out an RFP, so I -- I don't see why anybody
- 22 wouldn't be talking with these potential partners to
- 23 tell them that it's coming through, that council's
- 24 approved it, that it's going to be coming out because,
- 25 even though we had an in camera meeting, the process

- 1 is going to become public.
- 2 And there was -- the RFPs were sent
- 3 out. And we -- of course, I didn't find this out
- 4 until much later, but the RFPs were only sent out to
- 5 those -- those potential partners. It wasn't broad
- 6 spectrum sent out to everybody in the industry, it was
- 7 only sent out to those.
- 8 So I don't see why they wouldn't have
- 9 talked to them. I don't see why they wouldn't have
- 10 kept them informed so that they could be prepared and
- 11 they could -- they could produce the best RFP because
- 12 it's in the best interest of the Town of Collingwood,
- 13 it's the best interest of the people of Collingwood to
- 14 have the best partner for that utility.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Commissioner,
- 16 if I could just make a nunc pro tunc objection there.
- 17 You know, that's a terrific submission. I'm not sure
- 18 it was evidence responsive to the question.
- 19 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: It
- 20 wasn't responsive to the question, not in the
- 21 slightest.
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: My apologies.
- 23 And...
- 24
- 25 CONTINUED BY MS. KATE MCGRANN:

- 1 MS. KATE MCGRANN: I'd like to turn to
- 2 the next update we see council receiving, which is on
- 3 November 17th, 2011. If we could turn to paragraph
- 4 373 of the Foundation Document.

5

6 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- MS. KATE MCGRANN: So from what we can
- 9 see, after the October 3rd, 2003, in camera update to
- 10 council, the next update is on November 17th, 2000,
- 11 again, ele -- again, in a closed session.
- 12 At this point, council's informed that
- 13 Collus staff were preparing to issue a press release
- 14 announcing public inf -- a public information session
- 15 regarding the RFP process on November 22nd, 2011.
- 16 Do you recall whether you received any
- 17 updates on the RFP either from Collus Power or
- 18 otherwise between October 3rd, 2011, and November
- 19 17th, 2011, other than the draft press release you
- 20 reviewed?
- 21 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Not that I recall.
- 22 I don't recall seeing any particular document between
- 23 those two (2) meetings.
- 24 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And the press
- 25 release and the subsequent public information session

- 1 held on November 22nd, 2011, appear to be the first
- 2 public notice that is given of the RFP process for
- 3 Collus Power.
- 4 Are you aware of an earlier public
- 5 notice given of the fact that an RFP was going to be
- 6 issued or had been issued?
- 7 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I had thought we --
- 8 there was a second meeting, a town hall thing, but I
- 9 don't see record of it, so perhaps I'm conflating it
- 10 with something else. But I do recall the public
- 11 meeting.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Okay. Do you
- 13 recall any public announcement or notice of the RFP
- 14 process or consideration of ownership options for
- 15 Collus Power before the public meeting?
- 16 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I don't recall any
- 17 details. I do know that local media did have -- have
- 18 some stories, that we were going through the process
- 19 and that -- that we were looking at -- at the
- 20 different options, but I don't recall any particular
- 21 details, certainly not -- none of the partners were
- 22 ever named.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: And the media
- 24 pieces that you're referring to there, do you have a
- 25 specific recollection of those being published before

- 1 the press release you reviewed was released?
- 2 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I believe there
- 3 were a couple of stories in the Enterprise bulletin
- 4 and the Collingwood connection. And it may -- excuse
- 5 me, it may have -- you'd -- you'd have to confirm with
- 6 the radio station, but the mayor had a regular radio
- 7 show on -- on the -- The Peak FM, and she may have
- 8 even mentioned it there.
- 9 It wasn't a secretive process that we
- 10 were looking at it. The details may have been in
- 11 camera because of legal issues and confidentiality
- 12 over -- over legal issues to do with the Corporations
- 13 Act, but it wasn't a secret that we were looking at
- 14 those partnerships.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Well, sir, what I'm
- 16 looking for is your recollection. You said, "May
- 17 have," several times in what you just said there. I
- 18 would like to know if you recall that the fact that an
- 19 RFP had been put out for a strategic public --
- 20 strategic partner for Collus partner -- Power had been
- 21 made public before this news release.
- 22 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I don't recall.

23

24 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 1 MS. KATE MCGRANN: The next time we
- 2 see information being brought to council about the RFP
- 3 process for Collus Power is in an in camera meeting on
- 4 December 5th, 2011. I ask that we turn to paragraph
- 5 437 of the foundation document.
- 6 While that's being pulled up, a
- 7 question I have for you is, do you recall receiving
- 8 any updates or information about the Collus Power RFP
- 9 between the public meeting on November 22nd and the
- 10 December 5th, 2011, council meeting?
- 11 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I did not receive
- 12 anything that I recall.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Well, the minutes
- 14 record that you declared a pecuniary interest with
- 15 respect to the in camera discussion because you
- 16 provided consulting services for electricity se --
- 17 sector clients.
- 18 The minutes said that you indicated
- 19 that you would not be participating in the in camera
- 20 discussion until it was known whether your client had
- 21 submitted an RFP for the Collus partnership
- 22 discussion.
- Is that consistent with what you
- 24 remember of that meeting?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, it is.

- 1 MS. KATE MCGRANN: When did you learn
- 2 that PowerStream had submitted a response to the RFP?
- 3 MR. IAN CHADWICK: It was in mid to
- 4 late January of 2012, approximately five (5) to six
- 5 (6) weeks later.
- 6 MS. KATE MCGRANN: How did you learn
- 7 that PowerStream had submitted a bid to the RFP?
- 8 MR. IAN CHADWICK: It was -- we were
- 9 making the announcement that PowerStream was going to
- 10 be the strategic partner.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: And do you recall
- 12 if that was -- it had already been decided absolutely
- 13 that PowerStream was going to be the strategic
- 14 partner, a decision had already been made completely,
- 15 or whether they were a preferred proponent that was
- 16 going to be negotiating with Collus Power?
- 17 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I -- I was not
- 18 present at the in camera meeting, so I can't tell you
- 19 what the decision was. You -- when it came out, it
- 20 appeared to be that they were the chosen partner. Any
- 21 subsequent negotiations I was not aware of.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: During the period
- 23 between October 3rd, when you learned that an RFP was
- 24 going to be released, and mid-January, when you
- 25 learned that PowerStream had submitted an RFP, did you

- 1 think of asking Mr. Bonwick whether PowerStream was a
- 2 participant in the RFP process or whether it's
- 3 something you should have been mindful of in your role
- 4 as councillor?
- 5 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, I didn't -- I
- 6 didn't ask him. And the -- the RFPs, as until mid-
- 7 November -- I think it was November 14th or November
- 8 16th, when they had a deadline to be received.
- 9 Council didn't get anything until the December 5th
- 10 meeting.
- 11 So there was -- there was no
- 12 interaction between council and -- and the process
- 13 after the RFPs were sent out. So, no, I -- I didn't
- 14 think to ask him. And I -- I didn't really want to
- 15 bring that up at that point because there was no
- 16 decision being made on anything.
- 17 MS. KATE MCGRANN: If you were going
- 18 to declare a conflict because one (1) of your clients
- 19 may be participating in the RFP, why wouldn't you take
- 20 the extra step of asking the person who's interfacing
- 21 between you and -- and PowerStream whether this was a
- 22 real conflict you needed to be concerned about?
- 23 Why not arm yourself with the
- 24 information and make an informed decision?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Well, thank you.

- 1 20/20 hindsight might -- might be a wonderful thing to
- 2 have, but, unfortunately, I lack it. From the sending
- 3 out of the RFP, which I considered to be a -- for the
- 4 community benefit.
- 5 And, as I said, until it came up on
- 6 December 5th, there was no opportunity, no reason to
- 7 co -- declare a conflict because the discussions
- 8 didn't come up that I recall at all at council either
- 9 about the RFP or about the -- about the decision to
- 10 sell.
- 11 There was a discussion about the
- 12 process, but I don't -- but that's not specific to any
- 13 company or any business.
- 14 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Okay. After you
- 15 declare a conflict of interest on December 5th, or a
- 16 potential conflict of interest really because you
- 17 didn't know whether your client had --
- 18 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Right.
- 19 MS. KATE MCGRANN: -- submitted it or
- 20 not, at this point, you've already declared a
- 21 conflict. You've indicated that you don't have the
- 22 necessary information to -- to advise how you'll
- 23 proceed going forward. Why not find out then?
- 24 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Because the
- 25 information was confidential. And for me to go in

- 1 another way to find out if it was -- to find out if it
- 2 was submitted or that kind of -- of relationship, what
- 3 I believe violate the -- the council's oath of -- of
- 4 confidentiality.
- 5 And I'm not supposed to find this out
- 6 by another way. If it's made public, then I have
- 7 access to the information. But I'm not supposed to go
- 8 around something else to find out if they're involved
- 9 in it.
- 10 Council made a decision that once that
- 11 decision was made, I had to stay out of it while I
- 12 still had a pecuniary interest.
- MR. PAUL BONWICK: Excuse me, Your
- 14 Honour, if --
- 15 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Yes.
- 16 MR. PAUL BONWICK: -- if I may. I
- 17 just wanted to seek some clarification before I was
- 18 objecting to a comment. I understood Ms. McGrann to
- 19 suggest that Mr. Chadwick was dealing with his client.
- 20 I was -- could you provide clarification? I may have
- 21 misheard that.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: What I was asking
- 23 was why he didn't ask you, the person who was
- 24 interfacing between him and PowerStream, the ultimate
- 25 client, whether or not PowerStream had bid.

- 1 MR. PAUL BONWICK: Thank you. That's
- 2 not how I understood the question to be asked. And
- 3 I'll answer that when I'm up on the stand.
- 4 MR. IAN CHADWICK: If I may add to
- 5 that. Also, that was also their confidential
- 6 information. And -- and that would not be information
- 7 that I think they would want to share with somebody,
- 8 especially somebody who had declared a conflict of
- 9 interest.

10

- 11 CONTINUED BY MS. KATE MCGRANN:
- 12 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Well, sir, what
- 13 would the harm be in asking? I'm sure PowerStream can
- 14 tell you if that was information that wasn't available
- 15 for you.
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Well, as I said,
- 17 that might be wonderful to have 20/20 hindsight to --
- 18 to determine that but, at the time, I did not think it
- 19 was appropriate.

20

21 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Justice Marrocco,
- 24 I'm just looking at the time. I'm moving on to a new
- 25 topic. I'm happy to proceed.

Transcript Date May 1, 2019 182 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: 1 Okav. We'll take ten (10) minutes. 3 --- Upon recessing at 3:06 p.m. --- Upon resuming at 3:16 p.m. 7 CONTINUED BY MS. KATE MCGRANN: 9 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Mr. Chadwick, earlier this afternoon, we were discussing the terms 10 11 of the media scan work you were doing for Mr. Bonwick. 12 You had mentioned that it was understood between the 13 two (2) of you that the work would continue until the 14 end of the year. 15 I'm going to ask that paragraph 11 of summary document 1-5 be pulled up on the screen. 17 18 (BRIEF PAUSE) 19 20 MS. KATE MCGRANN: This paragraph 21 describes that on December 30th, 2011, you sent an invoice and energy sector review to Mr. Bonwick. And 22 in the email that you sent it with, you stated, "Hope

Do you remember sending that email?

I can do more work for you in 2012."

24

- 1 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: I'm going to ask
- 3 that the summary document 1-5 be marked as the next
- 4 Exhibit.
- 5 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: So
- 6 ordered.

- 8 CONTINUED BY MS. KATE MCGRANN:
- 9 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Other than that
- 10 energy sector review work you were doing for Mr.
- 11 Bonwick, what other sources of income did you have as
- 12 at the end of December 2011, beginning of January
- 13 2012?
- 14 MR. IAN CHADWICK: As far as I recall,
- 15 it was just my Council salary, which I believe was
- 16 about eighteen thousand dollars (\$18,000) a year at
- 17 that time.
- 18 MS. KATE MCGRANN: On December 30th,
- 19 as we just looked at, you had said to Mr. Bonwick in
- 20 an email, "Hope I can do more work for you in 2012."
- 21 On January 4th, 2012, you sent him another email,
- 22 asking, "Any other work I can help with?"
- Do you recall if you received a
- 24 response from Mr. Bonwick to your January 4th, 2012
- 25 email?

- 1 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I don't believe I
- 2 did.
- 3 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you recall if
- 4 you began doing work for Mr. Bonwick again in January
- 5 of 2012?
- 6 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Not in January of
- 7 2012.
- 8 MS. KATE MCGRANN: I'm going to turn
- 9 back to the Foundation Document, paragraph 488.
- 10
- 11 (BRIEF PAUSE)
- 12
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: This paragraph
- 14 describes a closure in Council session of a Town
- 15 Council meeting on January 16th, 2012, in which
- 16 Council received a negotiating -- negotiation update
- 17 from Ron Clark of Aird & Berlis with respect to the
- 18 recommended Collus strategic partner.
- 19 Do you remember attending this meeting?
- 20 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I don't remember
- 21 the details of the meeting, but the record shows that
- 22 I was there, so I -- I recall vaguely being at the
- 23 meeting.
- 24 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you recall why
- 25 you didn't declare a conflict and recuse yourself at

- 1 this meeting as you had on December 5th?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, because as I
- 3 read -- as I read the Confl -- the Municipal Conflict
- 4 of Interest Act, since I was no longer working for
- 5 anybody who had any sort of interest, I no longer had
- 6 a direct or indirect pecuniary interest.
- 7 MS. KATE MCGRANN: It's my
- 8 understanding -- and I'm going to take you to the
- 9 paragraph in the Foundation Document that references
- 10 it; it's paragraph 531 -- that you didn't receive
- 11 payment for the work that you had done in December
- 12 2011 until towards the end of January, after January
- 13 24th, 2012.
- 14 Does that accord with your memory?
- 15 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, it does.
- 16 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Did the fact that
- 17 you hadn't yet been paid by Mr. Bonwick form part of
- 18 your consideration of whether or not you were in a
- 19 conflict of interest with respect to the January 16th
- 20 meeting?
- 21 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, I didn't,
- 22 because I had sent him a final document and a final
- 23 invoice for the -- the work done in December, and as
- 24 you can see by the previous note, had said:
- 25 "This is the final one. I'm hoping

186 -- hope I can do some work for you 1 later." 2 3 So as far as I was concerned, I was not working for him. 5 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Did you speak to anyone -- or ask anyone for any advice about your determination that you were not in conflict of interest while you're waiting for payment, but not actively doing work for Mr. Bonwick? 10 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, I didn't. 11 12 (BRIEF PAUSE) 13 14 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And I think you 15 said that you don't have a -- a detailed recollection of the January 16th meeting. What do you remember of that meeting, if anything? 17 18 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I remember we had a 19 presentation which was an update about the decision that had been made in -- in December, and where it was 20 going. I didn't remember the details of it. 21 22 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And was that the first information that you had about the decision that 24 had been made in December at the -- pardon me, in

camera meeting that you didn't attend?

- 1 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, it was.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you remember
- 3 what your reaction was learning of the decision that
- 4 had been made?
- 5 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I think I expressed
- 6 it in the -- in the next meeting, when it came up
- 7 publicly, that I was quite happy to see that -- that
- 8 we had made a decision, and we're moving forward with
- 9 it, because I had been in favour of moving forward all
- 10 the way along.
- 11 Regardless of who was chosen, I had
- 12 thought that it was the right decision to make.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: We're going to turn
- 14 to discussing the next meeting right now. Actually,
- 15 was on January 23rd, 2012 -- wrong, January 24th, my
- 16 mistake, 2012. If we could turn to paragraph 531 of
- 17 the Foundation Document.
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Excuse me, could --
- 19 the number is five (5) --
- 20 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Five hundred and
- 21 thirty-one (531).
- 22 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Five thirty-one
- 23 (531). Thank you.
- 24
- 25 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 1 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And in fact, I'm
- 2 actually going to back us up to paragraph 527.

3

4 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 6 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Five-hundred and
- 7 twenty-seven (527) describes an email exchange that
- 8 you had with Mr. Bonwick, it looks like shortly before
- 9 and just during the -- the Council meeting. This is a
- 10 public Council meeting.
- 11 At 4:53 p.m., on the 23rd, you write
- 12 him, saying, "I'm at Council right now. Can we chat
- 13 tomorrow?" At 5:11 p.m., after the Council meeting
- 14 has commenced, Mr. Bonwick responds to you. And part
- 15 of what he says is:
- 16 "I was going to ask you to speak to
- industry trends and leading the way.
- 18 You likely know more about the
- 19 industry than others at the table."
- 20 Do you remember if you received this
- 21 email from Mr. Bonwick during the Council meeting?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, I did.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: If you go up a
- 24 paragraph to paragraph 526, this outlines a statement
- 25 that you make at the Council meeting at 5:49 p.m.

- 1 Do you remember if you had received the
- 2 email from Mr. Bonwick before you made this statement
- 3 at the Council meeting?
- 4 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, I don't recall
- 5 if I received it before then or afterwards. It was
- 6 generally the practice not to read through emails
- 7 during the Council meeting.
- 8 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Why was that?
- 9 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Just because they
- 10 were distractions, and -- and it was bad protocol to
- 11 be answering -- respond to and answering emails,
- 12 although it wasn't necessarily followed rigorously.
- 13 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Was this a -- a
- 14 personal practice or was this a -- an endeavour that
- 15 was a Council-wide endeavour?
- 16 MR. IAN CHADWICK: It -- it was
- 17 generally -- it was a Council endeavour, and it -- not
- 18 just with that Council; with previous Councils. In
- 19 some cases, people close their laptops during the
- 20 meetings, some kept them open, but generally didn't
- 21 respond to outside emails during the meeting.
- 22 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you know if your
- 23 correspondence with Mr. Bonwick had any impact on
- 24 whether you chose to speak, or what you decided to say
- 25 at this meeting?

- 1 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, it wouldn't,
- 2 because as I said, I had been in favour of the process
- 3 and in favour of making a decision for a strategic
- 4 partner all the way along, and in the last previous
- 5 four (4) months, I'd been following the industry
- 6 trends and -- and in the industry in general through
- 7 doing the -- the news scan. So I could see that it
- 8 was probably a good decision from the industry point
- 9 of view as well, at least from my -- from my
- 10 perspective.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: At this point in
- 12 time, you had been doing work for Mr. Bonwick, or
- 13 providing him with -- with news scans for his client,
- 14 PowerStream, for a number of months, but you're not
- 15 currently working for them. We've seen that you have
- 16 asked for additional work before this meeting.
- 17 Was the prospect of -- of obtaining
- 18 additional work something you considered when you
- 19 decided whether to speak or what to say at this
- 20 meeting?
- 21 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No. I actually
- 22 like to do the work, and -- and there aren't a lot of
- 23 good work opportunities out there for a retired
- 24 editor/writer in a small community, so anybody who
- 25 might be able to provide one would be somebody I would

- 1 like to approach.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: If we could now
- 3 turn to paragraph 531.

4

5 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 7 MS. KATE MCGRANN: This paragraph
- 8 describes an email exchange between you and Mr.
- 9 Bonwick the day after the Council meeting at which the
- 10 PowerStream share sale is approved.
- 11 You email Mr. Bonwick and ask him if he
- 12 still wants to chat. You -- there's a discussion
- 13 about picking up the final check. You mentioned that
- 14 it had been -- it'll be a month, and Mr. Bonwick
- 15 responds:
- "Yes, we should meet. I'd like to
- 17 discuss -- discuss growth strategy
- 18 as well. They are interested in
- 19 expansion that requires more
- 20 monitoring."
- Do you remember this email exchange?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, I do.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Did your interest
- 24 in obtaining additional work at all affect your
- 25 approach to the Collus Power/PowerStream deal?

- 1 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, it didn't.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Can you see how a
- 3 third party, looking in may have questions about how
- 4 your employment -- the fact that you were looking for
- 5 further employment at this time, may have affected the
- 6 decisions that you made about the Collus
- 7 Power/PowerStream deal?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Well, I can't speak
- 9 for any third party or what they might suppose, but
- 10 again, lacking 20/20 hindsight, it might have been
- 11 appropriate to wait a day, perhaps, but nonetheless, I
- 12 like to work. I was looking for work.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: And I'm not asking
- 14 you to -- I'm not asking you to guess what a third
- 15 party would say. I'm saying, could you understand why
- 16 someone looking on this may have concerns or questions
- 17 about whether there was an impact on your decision?
- 18 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I can now, yes.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: And when you say it
- 20 may have been appropriate to wait a day, wait a day to
- 21 do what?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: To contact Mr.
- 23 Bonwick and see if he had more work.
- 24 MS. KATE MCGRANN: What difference do
- 25 you think a day would make?

- 1 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Because this was on
- 2 the same day as the -- the day we had approved the --
- 3 MS. KATE MCGRANN: But it's the day
- 4 after.
- 5 MR. IAN CHADWICK: -- the -- the day
- 6 after?
- 7 MS. KATE MCGRANN: It's the day after.
- 8 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Okay. Then I
- 9 apologize. I take that back. I -- then it was the
- 10 day after, then I wouldn't have waited a day. I
- 11 thought this was during that meeting -- or after that
- 12 meeting, but.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: And again, I guess
- 14 the question is, what -- what difference would a day
- 15 make?
- 16 MR. IAN CHADWICK: It wouldn't. I'm
- 17 sorry. I -- I apologize, then, for mistaking the
- 18 days.
- 19 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And I'm correct
- 20 that you did vote in favour for -- in favour of the
- 21 Collus Power/PowerStream --
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: -- deal, or the
- 24 Collus/PowerStream deal, I should say?
- 25 Am I correct --

1 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Excuse me, if -- if

- 2 I can correct, as I recall, that was not -- that was
- 3 to vote to approve what Council had approved
- 4 previously in camera, was -- so it wasn't to make the
- 5 decision for the sale. It was to approve a Council
- 6 decision that had already been made.
- 7 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Is that distinction
- 8 important to you --
- 9 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes.
- 10 MS. KATE MCGRANN: -- in terms of
- 11 whether or not you would declare a conflict?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, it is, because
- 13 if the -- if the decision had been to approve the sale
- 14 specifically, I would have declared a conflict, but to
- 15 approve a Council decision that's already been made
- 16 was, in my mind, a -- a different kind of vote.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Help me understand
- 18 the difference that you see there.
- 19 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Because all I'm
- 20 doing is ratifying a Council decision, a decision that
- 21 was actually made by eight (8) people previously, and
- 22 made based on their information, based on -- on the
- 23 time they spent with it. All I was doing was agreeing
- 24 that they probably made the right decision.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: And why did that

- 1 address any concerns about conflict of interest you
- 2 had?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Because as I
- 4 understand it, in -- in the Conf -- Municipal Conflict
- 5 of Interest Act. It says if the -- if the member is
- 6 employed, so current tense, not past tense, is -- is
- 7 employed -- at that point, I wasn't employed by
- 8 anybody -- but it also says there are exceptions for -
- 9 for areas where there's a -- a general interest in
- 10 such a thing as a utility, and I believe that those
- 11 applied.
- 12 So that you -- you can vote for
- 13 something such as a utility where there is a general
- 14 interest in the community, where you share an interest
- 15 with all the other electors. And since I wasn't
- 16 employed by anybody aside from the Town, I believe
- 17 that that applied.
- 18 MS. KATE MCGRANN: During your time as
- 19 a Councillor at the 2010 to 2014 Council term, was it
- 20 your understanding that your obligation to identify
- 21 and appropriately address conflicts of interest began
- 22 and ended with the text of the Municipal Conflict of
- 23 Interest Act?
- 24 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes. The law is
- 25 the law. The law supersedes everything else,

- 1 supersedes Code of Conduct, Code of Ethics. It is the
- 2 law and that's the law of the land. It is not up to
- 3 Council to determine or any individual councillor to
- 4 determine whether or not there are other shades of
- 5 that law.
- 6 MS. KATE MCGRANN: What was the basis
- 7 for the understanding that you just explained to us
- 8 there?
- 9 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I believe that the
- 10 provincial law was -- was -- was written to cover all
- 11 -- all contingencies and all aspects of it and that we
- 12 should follow -- we should follow provincial law.
- The law isn't about a shade. It's not
- 14 about the spirit of it. It's about the letter of the
- 15 law. You have to follow the letter of the law.
- The other thing about the Municipal
- 17 Conflict of Interest Act is that unlike -- unlike
- 18 other acts, like unlike the Planning Act, unlike the
- 19 Municipal Act, there's nobody in Town Hall that you
- 20 can go and ask for advice on, about the -- about the
- 21 law. It's really left up to the conscience of the
- 22 individual whether or not you apply it correctly, and
- 23 there is a mechanism afterwards by which people can
- 24 contest it if you made the wrong choice.
- 25 But with the Planning Act I can go to a

- 1 planner and ask all sorts of details about the
- 2 Planning Act, whether I'm a builder, whether I'm a
- 3 councillor. The Municipal Act, I can act -- ask the
- 4 clerk; bylaws, I can ask the clerk; but the -- but the
- 5 Municipal Conflict of Interest Act, they don't give
- 6 advice on.
- 7 MS. KATE MCGRANN: During --
- 8 MR. IAN CHADWICK: You have to go
- 9 outside.
- 10 MS. KATE MCGRANN: During your time --
- 11 okay, so a couple of things, I think. I'm sorry that
- 12 I spoke over you. I thought you were done. I think
- 13 you said you would have to go outside.
- 14 What do you mean, you would have to go
- 15 outside? Who would you go to?
- 16 MR. IAN CHADWICK: You would have to
- 17 go to a municipal lawyer, an independent municipal
- 18 lawyer, one who wasn't employed by the Town, or
- 19 somebody experienced in municipal law. I'm not
- 20 familiar with anybody in the Town of Collingwood that
- 21 has all of that experience.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Did you find that
- 23 the lack of a closely geographically located lawyer
- 24 with that experience was an impediment to you
- 25 obtaining advice or information that you needed?

- 1 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Partly; also the
- 2 cost. When you -- when you're bringing home about
- 3 \$12,000 a year, going to a lawyer who's going to
- 4 charge 4 -- \$600 an hour to give you advice, is also a
- 5 bit of a constraint.
- 6 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Was it the case
- 7 when you were making decisions about how to deal with
- 8 your relationship with PowerStream during this time
- 9 that you felt that that there was advice that you
- 10 needed or could have benefitted from that you couldn't
- 11 obtain?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: In general, having
- 13 a person on Town staff who could provide advice about
- 14 the Municipal Conflict of Interest Act is always
- 15 beneficial, but to be clear -- to clarify your point,
- 16 I never dealt with PowerStream. I never dealt
- 17 directly with PowerStream. I dealt with Mr. Bonwick,
- 18 whose client was PowerStream.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Okay.
- 20 MR. IAN CHADWICK: And my interest
- 21 would only be indirect, not direct.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: During the time
- 23 that you had an indirect relationship through Mr.
- 24 Bonwick with PowerStream, and let's back away from
- 25 that even further, during the time that you were

- 1 dealing with decisions or information brought to
- 2 Council about the Collus Power RFP, all the way
- 3 through to the January 23rd meeting and beyond, was it
- 4 the case that you felt that there was advice or
- 5 information that you needed that you couldn't get
- 6 because you couldn't locate someone to give it to you
- 7 or because you couldn't afford it?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: It was -- it was
- 9 somewhat of both.
- 10 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Did you speak to
- 11 anybody about that need that wasn't being met?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: I had spoken, not
- 13 about this particular incident, but I had spoken in
- 14 the past to the clerk and to a former CAO about
- 15 getting advice on Municipal Conflict of Interest Act,
- 16 and -- and when councils are newly elected, they're
- 17 usually given some basic advice about -- from the
- 18 Town's legal firm or from the clerk, about -- about
- 19 laws and getting advice, and that's just one of -- one
- 20 of those rabbit holes that we fall into.
- 21 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Well, turning back
- 22 to your experience and the decisions that you made
- 23 about how to deal with choices as a councillor in a
- 24 town, I want to make sure that I first of all
- 25 understand you, is it the case that there was

- 1 information or advice that you needed that you felt
- 2 you couldn't access because you couldn't afford it or
- 3 otherwise?
- 4 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I would have liked
- 5 to have had -- had advice at the time from a Town
- 6 staff person who would be well-versed and that could
- 7 give advice without putting themselves into legal
- 8 jeopardy about giving that advice.
- 9 But, of course, the decision is always
- 10 up to the individual. It's up to the individual's
- 11 conscience, and that's a decision I made based on my
- 12 understanding regardless of what advice I had
- 13 received, that was the decision I made, and whether
- 14 it's right or wrong, that was based upon my
- 15 understanding of the situation and on what the
- 16 Municipal Act said.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Did you speak to
- 18 anybody about the fact that there was information or
- 19 advice that you felt that you needed that you couldn't
- 20 get?
- 21 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, I didn't, not
- 22 that I recall speaking --
- 23 MS. KATE MCGRANN: It appears from
- 24 the documents that starting again in February of 2011
- 25 you began working for Mr. Bonwick, again providing

- 1 news scans for his clients. Is that correct?
- 2 MR. IAN CHADWICK: That's correct.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you remember how
- 4 long you continued to do that work for?
- 5 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Till, I believe,
- 6 the end of 2013.
- 7 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And do you remember
- 8 why you stopped doing that work?
- 9 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I believe Mr.
- 10 Bonwick made the decision to stop it, that the clients
- 11 no long -- no longer wanted it. The -- the news scan
- 12 I was doing also was not just about the energy sector,
- 13 by the way. It was about the energy and the mining
- 14 sector, so it expanded to -- and I believe at the time
- 15 he was looking to expand his client base into the
- 16 mining sector, therefore providing information to
- 17 them.
- 18 MS. KATE MCGRANN: I have to correct
- 19 something that I said in my question to you, which
- 20 would then affect your answer.
- 21 I said you began working for him in
- 22 February 2011. I meant February 2012.
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: 2012.
- 24 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Does that change
- 25 anything --

202 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes. That's --1 2 MS. KATE MCGRANN: -- that you said? 3 MR. IAN CHADWICK: -- it was February 2012. 5 MS. KATE MCGRANN: If we could turn to 6 paragraph 23 of Summary Document 1-5. 7 (BRIEF PAUSE) 9 10 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Paragraph 23 11 discusses that on March 2nd, 2013, you sent Mr. Bonwick an email letting him know that Compenso's 13 website still had a page listing for you, and you give 14 him some information about how to remove that page 15 from the Compenso website. 16 Do you remember doing that? 17 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes. 18 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Why did you do 19 that? 20 MR. IAN CHADWICK: As I recall, the -my name and, as I mentioned earlier, a couple of other 21 people's names had been listed on the website as -- as 22 references and as resource people. During the -- that 24 period, there was a considerable amount of abuse on

local blogs and social media about my and other

1 people's relationship with Paul Bonwick, and it was

- 2 becoming abusive and nasty and -- and Mr. Bonwick had
- 3 asked his IT person to take them down, but as I recall
- 4 it just removed the link and didn't remove the page,
- 5 so the page was still available to anybody who went to
- 6 the particular URL, and then I sent him an email
- 7 explaining how the -- the technical aspects of
- 8 removing the page as opposed to just the link.
- 9 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And then if we look
- 10 down at paragraph 24 and 25, it looks from the records
- 11 we've seen that that you continue to provide paid
- 12 services to Compenso through to April 25th, 2014.
- 13 That appears to be the last invoice you send over.
- 14 Is that consistent with what you
- 15 remember?
- 16 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, I believe so.
- 17 MS. KATE MCGRANN: A couple of
- 18 questions about items that come up after the
- 19 transaction is completed. If we could look at
- 20 paragraph 707 in the Foundation Document.

21

22 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 24 MS. KATE MCGRANN: In 2013, looks like
- 25 if -- Council brought KPMG in to do an organization

- 1 review.
- 2 Do you recall that?
- 3 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, I do.
- 4 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Mr. Peever of KPMG
- 5 gave a presentation. It appears that that
- 6 presentation addressed, amongst other things, having
- 7 non-staff members work on the Collingwood Executive
- 8 Management Team. I understand the Executive
- 9 Management Team was a -- a team of people who were
- 10 assisting Mr. Houghton in his role as acting CAO.
- 11 Is that what you understand that team
- 12 did?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes.
- 14 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you remember Mr.
- 15 Peever having comments on the membership of non-staff
- 16 people on that team?
- 17 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, I do.
- 18 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Do you -- this
- 19 paragraph discusses you bringing a motion to have Town
- 20 solicit a legal opinion on the benefits and
- 21 liabilities of having non-Collingwood employees work
- 22 on the Executive Management Team.
- Do you remember bringing that motion?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, I do.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Why did you do

- 1 that?
- 2 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I believe I was
- 3 just doing due diligence as a member of Council. Mr.
- 4 Peever was a consultant but not a lawyer, and his
- 5 recommendation was based upon his -- his experience,
- 6 but I wanted to have a -- a further understanding of
- 7 what the liabilities and/or -- and/or benefits would
- 8 be of having these -- the people who are currently on
- 9 the Executive Management Team continue to be employed.
- 10 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Did you --
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: I shouldn't say
- 12 employed. Continued to be used by the Town. I don't
- 13 believe they were paid separately from that.
- 14 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Did you, yourself,
- 15 have a view on whether or not it was a good idea to
- 16 have non-staff members on the Town Executive
- 17 Management Team?
- 18 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I didn't have a
- 19 particularly personal opinion whether it was good or
- 20 bad, if that's what you're asking, but I believe that
- 21 in order to make a -- a fully informed decision,
- 22 Council had to have all the information available and
- 23 a legal one was necessary for us to make a balanced
- 24 and fully informed decision.
- 25 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And looking ahead

- 1 to paragraph 710 of this document, it appears that
- 2 KPMG sent around a short survey and asked all
- 3 Collingwood councillors to complete the survey. It
- 4 appears that you declined to complete the survey.
- 5 Do you remember that?
- 6 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, I do.
- 7 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And why did you
- 8 declined to complete the survey?
- 9 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Because the survey
- 10 was inadequate to serve the needs of both Council and
- 11 the community, and if you read my email that's
- 12 included in that, I went to great lengths to explain
- 13 why it didn't provide adequate choices or adequate --
- 14 adequate information.
- Doing surveys is a science. It's not -
- 16 not a hobby. It's not something you can do properly
- 17 just casually. The data has to be quantifiable, the
- 18 data has to have all -- the questions have to have all
- 19 of the appropriate choices.
- When that survey was put together,
- 21 Council was not -- it was not asked what kind of
- 22 questions we would like to see, what kind of choices
- 23 we would like to have on it. It was just presented to
- 24 us. And from my experience in -- in -- in dealing
- 25 with -- with data, it was inadequate to provide the

- 1 kind of information and the kind of information
- 2 required for decision-making later on. So I refused
- 3 to answer because it just didn't -- didn't provide
- 4 what I believe we needed to have.
- 5 MS. KATE MCGRANN: What harm did you
- 6 see in filling out the survey that you identify as
- 7 inadequate?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Wrong information,
- 9 partial information, or simply inadequate data is not
- 10 what Council should have, it's not what staff should
- 11 have, it's not what a consultant should have, to make
- 12 a recommendation. You have to have the most complete,
- 13 most comprehensive, and the most solid data.
- 14 MS. KATE MCGRANN: The last thing that
- 15 I want to ask you questions about is the time line
- 16 that you created. You've provided a time line to the
- 17 Inquiry. I've taken a look at it. It makes
- 18 references to a number of documents.
- 19 I'd like to understand what it
- 20 represents and what steps you took to put it together.
- 21 So the first question is, is the time line limited to
- 22 your recollection of the events that you were there
- 23 and present for or does it contain more information
- 24 than that?
- 25 MR. IAN CHADWICK: It contains more

- 1 information but it's based upon my recollection and my
- 2 interpretation of events.
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: In addition to your
- 4 recollection and interpretation of events, what other
- 5 sources of information form the basis for that time
- 6 line?
- 7 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Predominantly they
- 8 are publicly available sources. They are news
- 9 reports, articles that appeared in a paper or on loc -
- 10 on websites of local media. They're industry
- 11 reports, long-term planning. There are -- some of
- 12 them were added that were documents that were provided
- 13 to this Inquiry.
- 14 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Over what period of
- 15 time did you put this time line together?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Originally I wrote
- 17 it probably about two (2) years -- two (2) years ago
- 18 and I had cobbled it together over a period of about a
- 19 month or two (2), originally as a -- as a blog post to
- 20 try to put together everything I remembered about the
- 21 -- the process of the sale.
- 22 MS. KATE MCGRANN: You listed a number
- 23 of different sources there. Does the time line
- 24 include only direct quotes from those sources or does
- 25 it also include your interpretation and analysis of

- 1 the information set out in them?
- 2 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I attempted to
- 3 differentiate the direct quotes by either a -- a pull-
- 4 quote area with a bar or some bullet points to -- that
- 5 were taken directly from reports or from documents
- 6 that I had received.
- 7 MS. KATE MCGRANN: As I've looked at
- 8 it and based on your description to me, the time line
- 9 presents as somewhat of an investigative report.
- 10 Is that a fair characterization of that
- 11 document?
- 12 MR. IAN CHADWICK: As much of an
- 13 investigative report as a one-time reporter might have
- 14 done, yes.
- 15 MS. KATE MCGRANN: Other than the
- 16 formatting that you have done to identify pull quotes
- 17 or block quotes, is a reader of your time line able to
- 18 easily differentiate what information is coming from
- 19 your direct recollection and what information is
- 20 coming from the source documents and your
- 21 interpretation and analysis of the information in
- 22 them?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: I hope so. There
- 24 are footnotes on pretty much every page which identify
- 25 documents, and when there is a direct quote there's

- 1 usually a footnote identifying where the source of
- 2 that is from, and the pull-quotes are stylistically
- 3 differentiated to make it different. I believe if you
- 4 read the introduction, it should note that as well,
- 5 but if it doesn't then I apologize.
- 6 MS. KATE MCGRANN: And so where
- 7 there's a piece of information that's footnoted, is it
- 8 fair to assume that that information comes from the
- 9 source that's footnoted and not from your
- 10 recollection?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, that's true.
- 12
- 13 (BRIEF PAUSE)
- 14
- MS. KATE MCGRANN: Thank you very
- 16 much, Mr. Chadwick. Those are my questions.
- 17 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Thank you.
- 18 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Have
- 19 you -- have you decided on the order of cross-
- 20 examination or do you want a couple of minutes to do
- 21 that, if you haven't?
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Why don't we do
- 23 that, Chief Justice.
- 24
- 25 --- Upon recessing at 3:50 p.m.

1 --- Upon resuming at 3:54 p.m.

- 3 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Commissioner,
- 4 here's how we propose to proceed. I will begin my
- 5 examination. I think it will take the -- if I'm
- 6 guessing forty (40) minutes or just under.
- 7 A number of documents were delivered to
- 8 us relating to this witness today and I may have very
- 9 few questions in the morning for those.
- 10 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Sc
- 11 then we'll take forty (40) minutes of the questioning
- 12 today and don't conclude your cross-examination until
- 13 tomorrow morning.
- 14 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Thank you. And
- 15 frankly, I'm not sure how much -- how much longer my
- 16 voice would hang in there anyways so.
- 17 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: All
- 18 right.
- 19 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: I appreciate
- 20 it.
- 21 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: All
- 22 right. Well, I'm somewhat flexible. Mr. McDowell, if
- 23 it reaches a point where you want to stop, then just
- 24 say so.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Okay.

- 1 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL:
- 2 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: So, let me ask
- 3 you some questions about something that came up
- 4 towards the end of your examination, Mr. Chadwick.
- 5 As a counsellor, you thought that your
- 6 conflict-of-interest obligations were spelled out in
- 7 the Municipal Conflict of Interest Act?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, that's true.
- 9 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Right. And
- 10 just for short, I'll call it the MCIA. And they were
- 11 limited to that and then the limit was effectively
- 12 what your conscience told you in relation to the
- 13 legislation.
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: And you said
- 16 something about the public benefit in relation to
- 17 discussions about conflict of interest.
- 18 And my understanding is whether
- 19 something to be voted on is or isn't -- to benefit the
- 20 public really is nothing to do with the analysis of
- 21 conflict of interest. You agree?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, because under
- 23 the Conflict of Interest Act it does give some
- 24 exceptions as to where -- when you don't have a
- 25 conflict of interest and perhaps I confused the way

- 1 it's written, but it does say that if you have
- 2 interests in common with the electorate, then you
- 3 don't have a conflict.
- 4 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Right, but I
- 5 think that has to do with if, for example, you're
- 6 voting on creating an enormous park at the edge of
- 7 town and your interest is no different than that of
- 8 any other elector, that's always been my understanding
- 9 of that idea.
- 10 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Well, again, sorry,
- 11 I -- I can only apologize that my -- my interpretation
- 12 may not match yours, but that's what I got from
- 13 reading the Act and the Act says very specifically --
- 14 uses of this term is in the employment of somebody.
- 15 It doesn't say "was," so that was my interpretation.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Okay, we'll
- 17 come back to it. Do we have the text of the Act? It's
- 18 one of the documents, I can't remember.
- 19 MR. RYAN BREEDON: It's ALE50204.
- 20 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: ALE50204.

21

22 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 24 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: All right, so
- 25 if we can scroll down so there are definitions here

- 1 and I remember having an in indirect pecuniary
- 2 interest. And then I guess what you were talking
- 3 about is 2B, the member is a partner or a person or is
- 4 in the employment of the person that has a pecuniary
- 5 interest.
- 6 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, sir.
- 7 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: That's in the
- 8 present text, right? Present tense rather, sorry.
- 9 But -- so I just want to understand
- 10 where that came from, and that's where you got that
- 11 understanding.
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, sir.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Okay.
- 14 And could we look at the declaration of
- 15 office, which is TOC555939.

16

17 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 19 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: This is the one
- 20 from Ms. Cooper. You signed a similar one, I assume?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: All right.
- 23 So if we go to the bottom of this
- 24 document. Hang on, scroll up. I just wanted to see
- 25 what one of these looks like. Keep going up, I want

- 1 to see the bottom. There.
- 2 So they make the solemn promise and
- 3 declaration, conscientiously believing it to be true,
- 4 and knowing that it is of the same force and effect as
- 5 if made under oath.
- 6 You see that?
- 7 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, sir.
- 8 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Right. So
- 9 these are obligations that you have to take seriously,
- 10 I take it?
- 11 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, sir.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: They create
- 13 legal obligations?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, sir.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Okay. And one
- 16 of those, you don't have to go through this, but one
- 17 of those is to deal with matters impartially, I take
- 18 it.
- 19 MR. IAN CHADWICK: It -- it may be.
- 20 It's been a long time since I signed one so I can't
- 21 tell you the --
- THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Well,
- 23 just scroll up a bit so that we can find it.
- 24 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: So the first
- 25 one, I will truly, faithfully, and impartially

- 1 exercise this office.
- 2 That's one of them.
- 3 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes.
- 4 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: And then there
- 5 is the disclosure of particular interest, which says
- 6 in accordance with the Municipal Conflict of Interest
- 7 Act. You see that?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes.
- 9 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: All right.
- 10 And I wanted to show you another
- 11 document, and I -- it's probably one that you haven't
- 12 seen, but this is TOC 555940.
- So just for some background, this was
- 14 another municipal inquiry, inquiry into the Municipal
- 15 Act.
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: M-hmm.
- 17 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: By actually the
- 18 predecessor of Associate Chief Justice Marrocco,
- 19 Associate Chief Justice Cunningham.
- 20 And just to speed this up, if we go
- 21 right to page 10, and then scroll up a little bit so
- 22 you get the whole quote, go to page 9, sorry.
- 23 So he's -- he's talking about an old
- 24 case there. And he's talking about Members of Council
- 25 and their obligations. He says optics are important.

1 Have you ever understood that to be the case, optics

- 2 being important?
- 3 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Sorry, if you could
- 4 speak a little bit louder, sir.
- 5 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Optics are
- 6 important?
- 7 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, sir.
- 8 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: You agree with
- 9 that?
- 10 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, sir.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: All right.
- 12 And then he says in the middle of the
- 13 paragraph there:
- 14 "Suffice it to say that members of
- 15 Council and staff are not to use
- their office to promote private
- interests, whether their own, or
- 18 those of relatives or friends."
- 19 You see that?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, I do.
- 21 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: And do you
- 22 agree with that as a legal obligation?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, sir.
- 24 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: And then he
- 25 carries on: "That is not only the common law, but the

- 1 common sense standard by which the conduct of
- 2 municipal representatives ought to be judged."
- 3 So I take it you -- you -- this is the
- 4 first time you've ever seen this decision?
- 5 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, I have,
- 6 haven't seen it before.
- 7 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: All right.
- 8 But that, just so you know where I'm
- 9 going with some of this, at the end of this inquiry on
- 10 behalf of the Town we're going to say that the law is
- 11 not just what's in the MCIA, it's also what's in the
- 12 common law, the -- the law that judges create.
- Do you understand that -- that notion?
- 14 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, sir. I can't
- 15 -- I can't presuppose what's going to be in the
- 16 decision at the end, but I --
- 17 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Me neither.
- 18 MR. IAN CHADWICK: But I do understand
- 19 and I -- I trust that the examination of how Council
- 20 members have access to information and advice about
- 21 the Municipal Conflict of Interest Act might be
- 22 improved.
- 23 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Right. I think
- 24 that that's going to be common ground between us.
- 25 And then if we go down to the following

- 1 page, so page 10, Commissioner Cunningham said it must
- 2 always be an objective test what should a reasonable
- 3 person have done in similar circumstances. And then
- 4 in a final note, he points out that the mayor in that
- 5 instance agreed faithfully and impartially exercised
- 6 this office. She did not simply say she would abide
- 7 by the Municipal Conflict of Interest Act.
- 8 Do you see that?
- 9 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, sir, I see it.
- 10 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: So, correct me
- 11 if I'm wrong, but -- but this notion, the -- the ideas
- 12 set out in this decision, these weren't things in
- 13 which you were briefed as a member of Council when you
- 14 took office?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Not this particular
- 16 text over this decision, no.
- 17 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Okay. Then the
- 18 code of conduct, in the interests of time I won't take
- 19 you through, but did you consider that the code of
- 20 conduct created legal obligations for you?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, sir.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: And in your
- 23 evidence you seem to say well, whatever the code of
- 24 conduct says, you know, what I'm governed by is the
- 25 Act.

- But I want to be fair to you, do you --
- 2 do you think that they each create a legal obligation?
- 3 MR. IAN CHADWICK: The -- the code of
- 4 conduct cannot supersede the Act, if the Act says one
- 5 thing and the code of conduct has any grey area in it
- 6 that is -- that might contravene or -- my perspective
- 7 of course -- might contravene that Act or might give
- 8 you some leeway, I believe you have to go back to the
- 9 Act.
- 10 And -- and in all fairness, I did
- 11 consider this and I did read the Act and I did think
- 12 long and hard about it, but believed I was not in a
- 13 position of conflict. I had no personal gain, I was
- 14 not employed by anybody --
- 15 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: We'll -- we'll
- 16 get to that. We'll get to that.
- But you agree with me that the code of
- 18 conduct can create additional obligations beyond those
- 19 in the Act?
- 20 MR. IAN CHADWICK: It -- it creates a
- 21 moral and ethical obligation, yes.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: But not a legal
- 23 obligation?
- 24 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I'm not a lawyer, I
- 25 have a hard time answering that.

- 1 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Okay, well I
- 2 am, I think the answer is yes, but -- but you're the
- 3 witness, so -- so we'll carrying on from that.
- 4 So to move on quickly through a number
- 5 of these things, because my friend who is the
- 6 commission counsel covered this -- a lot of this very
- 7 carefully, but I wanted to move to CJI580. Let's just
- 8 move down the chain here. So hang on. Whoops, there
- 9 we go.
- 10 How did your meeting with PowerStream
- 11 go? So this is at the end of January. Are they
- 12 interested in further work?
- 13 And then scrolling up again we have Mr.
- 14 Bonwick's response.
- They want me to present a six-month
- 16 plan, including monitoring from provincial government.
- 17 To be clear about this, the "they" in both of those e-
- 18 mails is PowerStream?
- 19 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I believe so, yes.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: And you're
- 21 asking whether PowerStream is interested in other work
- 22 from you. This is in January.
- 23 MR. IAN CHADWICK: End of January,
- 24 yes.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Okay, and this

- 1 is what, four or five days after the -- after the
- 2 vote, is that correct?
- 3 MR. IAN CHADWICK: That's correct.
- 4 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: And Mr. Bonwick
- 5 seems to suggest please keep going until we chat.
- 6 He -- he seems to think you've been
- 7 doing work throughout this period.
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: I can't speak for
- 9 Mr. Bonwick --
- 10 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: No, of course.
- 11 MR. IAN CHADWICK: -- but I certainly
- 12 sent him a final invoice and he gave me a final cheque
- 13 for it, so.
- 14 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: All right.
- So just to put this in perspective, you
- 16 thought that at the December 5th Council meeting you
- 17 had a conflict of interest because at that point you
- 18 did have a pecuniary interest because you were doing
- 19 work for one of the proponents, namely PowerStream,
- 20 correct?
- 21 MR. IAN CHADWICK: One of the
- 22 potential proponents. I -- I had no information that
- 23 -- to that point that PowerStream was involved, but
- 24 the potential that they could have been was why I
- 25 declared a conflict.

1 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Okay. On that

- 2 footing alone, that -- that because -- you know, you
- 3 put it that you thought it might be likely that they
- 4 would be a proponent?
- 5 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I had no idea if
- 6 they were -- that it was -- 'likely' would be your
- 7 words, not mine. The potential that they could be was
- 8 there.
- 9 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Right. And you
- 10 were monitoring the energy sector all the way through
- 11 this, I take it?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: And PowerStream
- 14 if the provider utility in the neighouring
- 15 municipality of Barrie, I take it?
- 16 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Barrie, Vaughan, I
- 17 believe, Richmond Hill. At that point, they were an
- 18 amalgamation of three (3) municipalities, three (3)
- 19 municipal utilities, I believe.
- 20 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Right. But if
- 21 there -- if Barrie is one (1) of them that suggests
- 22 that if, you know, Collingwood is putting its utility
- 23 up for sale, that, you know, somebody reading the
- 24 clippings might think that they'd be a likely bidder?
- 25 MR. IAN CHADWICK: The -- if I may.

- 1 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Sure.
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: When I was doing
- 3 this, I had no idea who would be a bidder. But I did
- 4 realize during the process a lot more about the
- 5 industry, that there were -- that there were several
- 6 larger players in the industry who were much more
- 7 likely to be than some of the smaller utilities.
- 8 For example, it was unlikely that say a
- 9 small utility that had four thousand (4,000) clients
- 10 would be bidding on it, whereas much more likely that
- 11 somebody like Hydro One --
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Right.
- 13 MR. IAN CHADWICK: -- would be bidding
- 14 on it. So to -- to take myself out of the -- out of
- 15 the picture so I didn't have any conflict in the
- 16 decision-making process, I declared a conflict.
- 17 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: All right. So
- 18 you declared a conflict. And we can agree that once
- 19 you resumed doing work for PowerStream, that would be
- 20 in February I take it --
- 21 OBJ MS. BELINDA BAIN: I'm sorry, Your
- 22 Honour, just I do object to the phraseology that Mr.
- 23 Chadwick was going to work for PowerStream. I think
- 24 his evidence has been that he was doing work for
- 25 Compenso.

- 2 CONTINUED BY MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL:
- 3 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Well, you were
- 4 doing work for Compenso which was providing it for
- 5 PowerStream?
- 6 MR. IAN CHADWICK: And for other
- 7 clients, yes, sir.
- 8 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Right, but one
- 9 (1) of them was PowerStream?
- 10 MR. IAN CHADWICK: As far as I
- 11 understand, yes, --
- 12 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: So in that
- 13 sense, you were doing work for PowerStream?
- 14 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I was doing work
- 15 for Compenso.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Right, which
- 17 was being furnished to PowerStream?
- 18 MR. IAN CHADWICK: As I understand,
- 19 yes.
- 20 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: And being paid
- 21 for by PowerStream on occasion?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: I was not paid by
- 23 PowerStream for anything.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: No. But do you
- 25 know whether Mr. Bonwick was being paid by

- 1 PowerStream?
- 2 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I found from the
- 3 Foundation Documents. But aside from the fact that I
- 4 knew he was working for them, I would assume he's not
- 5 working for free, so he would be paid, but the -- the
- 6 nature and the discussion and the amounts he was being
- 7 paid were not known to me.
- 8 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Right. And the
- 9 -- no, I think that's fair. But -- but the idea that
- 10 your work was also being paid for for PowerStream,
- 11 having looked at the Foundation Document, I -- I take
- 12 it from your previous answer that you thought -- you
- 13 think now that that's the case?
- 14 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Sorry, I'm -- I'm a
- 15 little confused.
- 16 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: You now -- you
- 17 now think that PowerStream is paying for your work?
- 18 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No. Mr. Bonwick
- 19 was paying for my work and I invoiced him.
- 20 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Well --
- 21 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I invoiced him
- 22 directly. I didn't -- regardless of what PowerStream
- 23 was paying Mr. Bonwick, he was paying me.
- 24 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Your work
- 25 product, to your knowledge, was being used by

- 1 PowerStream though?
- 2 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yeah, it was being
- 3 -- I read by PowerStream. How it was being used, I
- 4 have no idea.
- 5 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: All right.
- 6 MR. IAN CHADWICK: And I don't know
- 7 who it went to or -- or how it was being used or even
- 8 if it ended up in the -- in the delete bin in -- in
- 9 their email.
- 10 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Right. Well,
- 11 Mr. Bonwick kept paying you for it?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: He did.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: So --
- 14 MR. IAN CHADWICK: As long as I
- 15 invoiced him, yes.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Had value to
- 17 somebody, I take it. Now, when the council meeting
- 18 comes up in January there is work which you have done
- 19 for Mr. Bonwick which is unpaid, right?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yeah. I hadn't
- 21 picked up the cheque. He may have written the cheque
- 22 much earlier. I just didn't get around --
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Oh, that's all
- 24 right.
- 25 MR. IAN CHADWICK: -- to picking it

- 1 up.
- 2 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: But, I mean,
- 3 the -- the point is that some of that work was being
- 4 done for PowerStream. You knew that by then, right?
- 5 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I think you're
- 6 asking the same question, sir. I -- all the work I
- 7 was doing was for Compenso. What -- what he did with
- 8 it and how it was used by anybody else I do not have
- 9 any knowledge of.
- 10 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Once you knew
- 11 that PowerStream was a bidder --
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: -- right, if in
- 14 the month of January you were still doing work for
- 15 PowerStream -- or for Compenso, you would have
- 16 declared a conflict of interest?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, I would have.
- 18 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Right. So the
- 19 situation is you had done work in December, before
- 20 then, but leading up to December. And on that
- 21 footing, you had declared a conflict because
- 22 PowerStream might be a bidder, right?
- 23 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Because there was a
- 24 potential that they could be involved in the bid, yes.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: By January, we

- 1 know -- by the council meeting, we know, obviously,
- 2 they are a bidder?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes.
- 4 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: You haven't
- 5 been paid for the prior work, correct?
- 6 MR. IAN CHADWICK: That's correct, I
- 7 had not -- well, I -- I had not picked up the cheque
- 8 or cashed it.
- 9 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: All right. And
- 10 this --
- 11 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Whether it being
- 12 paid, I can't tell you.
- 13 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: All right. The
- 14 December 20 -- sorry, the January 28th email you're
- 15 looking for other work --
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes, sir.
- 17 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: -- from
- 18 PowerStream?
- 19 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I was aware --
- 20 quite aware at the time that -- that PowerStream had -
- 21 had been a bidder. And it doesn't take -- it
- 22 doesn't take a lot to put --
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: But that's not
- 24 my question. My question is, you were looking for
- 25 work?

- 1 MR. IAN CHADWICK: I was asking if
- 2 PowerStream had more work. I knew that -- Mr. Bonwick
- 3 was very clear --
- 4 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Hang on. Just
- 5 --
- 6 MR. IAN CHADWICK: -- at very
- 7 beginning.
- 8 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Let me just --
- 9 well, the old line, stop interrupting me when I'm
- 10 interrupting you.
- 11
- 12 CONTINUED BY MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL:
- 13 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: But in this
- 14 chain of emails, let's scroll down to your question.
- 15 Your question is, Are they interested -- interested in
- 16 further work.
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes.
- 18 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Is PowerStream
- 19 interested in giving me, Ian Chadwick, further work?
- 20 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No, sir, I'm asking
- 21 Mr. Bonwick if Com -- if -- if PowerStream is going to
- 22 give -- get him to give me more work.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Right. But in
- 24 any event, the originator of the work is going to be
- 25 PowerStream?

- 1 MR. IAN CHADWICK: No. I'm the
- 2 originator of the work. They're only the recipient.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Well, sorry,
- 4 the commissioner of the work is going to be
- 5 PowerStream?
- 6 MR. IAN CHADWICK: From my perspective
- 7 --
- 8 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: The person
- 9 requesting the work is going to be PowerStream?
- 10 MR. IAN CHADWICK: From my
- 11 perspective, the com -- the commission of the work is
- 12 Compenso. And how he gets paid and who commissions it
- 13 from him was not my business.
- 14 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Right. But what
- 15 was your business was you wanted to see whether
- 16 PowerStream was interested in more work that you would
- 17 do?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Yes.
- 19 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Right. So what
- 20 I understand then is that there is a window of time in
- 21 which you don't have a conflict of interest but you
- 22 did have in December and you would have had in
- 23 relation to any council decision in February or going
- 24 forward. Is that fair?
- 25 MR. IAN CHADWICK: If -- if I hadn't

- 1 been working for him? Yes.
- 2 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: But -- and
- 3 again, I appreciate you're not a lawyer. But thinking
- 4 about it, if you are owed money and you are desirous
- 5 of getting further work from PowerStream, is that not
- 6 a kind of pecuniary interest?
- 7 MR. IAN CHADWICK: As you say, I'm not
- 8 a lawyer, so I --
- 9 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Oh, you've said
- 10 it a bunch of times.
- 11 MR. IAN CHADWICK: When I considered
- 12 the choices and what was going on, I had no knowledge
- 13 and no evidence that I would be getting further work.
- 14 Of course, I'm asking for work because I need income.
- 15 I have this curiously old-fashioned belief that I
- 16 should work for a living and pay my way through --
- 17 through the world, so.
- 18 And there's not a lot of employers for
- 19 my skill set in the Town of Collingwood, so, yes, I'm
- 20 looking for work. But I had no knowledge there was
- 21 any coming up when I made that decision. And when I -
- 22 when I did have an evidence of -- of work I declared
- 23 a conflict.
- 24 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: All right.
- 2.5

1 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 3 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: And again, with
- 4 -- and having in mind that optics are important, it
- 5 does seem unfortunate that at a time when you're
- 6 looking to get paid by Mr. Bonwick for work that was
- 7 commissioned by PowerStream Mr. Bonwick is sending you
- 8 talking points to be used in the council meeting?
- 9 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Excuse me, that's
- 10 incorrect. Mr. Bonwick did not send me talking
- 11 points. The email says that he thought I should talk
- 12 about the industry trends in general, and I didn't
- 13 respond to it and it didn't give me any details.
- 14 And when I did make my comment, I spoke
- 15 in generic terms, in very general terms, about the
- 16 industry trend and why I thought it was a good
- 17 decision that council had been making and going
- 18 forward with.
- 19 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: I understand
- 20 that. But at some distance, some years later, that
- 21 does seem to be a bit unfortunate, doesn't it, that
- 22 Mr. Bonwick --
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Well --
- 24 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: -- is sending
- 25 you things that he suggests that you should say on

- 1 behalf of his client seeking approval from council?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: Mr. Bonwick did not
- 3 say anything about his clients whatsoever. He just
- 4 spoke about the industry trends and going forward
- 5 because, as he knew it and as -- as I knew, having
- 6 spent four (4) months doing a news scan of that, I was
- 7 probably better equipped than anybody else at that
- 8 table to talk about industry trends or -- or the
- 9 political pressures.
- 10 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Well, come on.
- 11 Are you telling His Honour here that the reason Mr.
- 12 Bonwick sent you that was just a free floating
- 13 thought? It wasn't connected to the brief he had for
- 14 PowerStream? Is that your evidence?
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: I cannot speak for
- 16 Mr. Bonwick. I can only speak for myself. And the
- 17 comments I made were not about any particular company,
- 18 they were about the process and about the industry in
- 19 general.
- 20 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: And at the time
- 21 that you --
- 22
- 23 (BRIEF PAUSE)
- 24
- 25 CONTINUED BY MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL:

- 1 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: But at the time
- 2 -- one (1) more question about this. At the time that
- 3 you read his email, did you not think that his email
- 4 was being sent to you in his role as an advocate for
- 5 PowerStream?
- 6 MR. IAN CHADWICK: Oh, very -- very
- 7 likely, but that was -- that was his job. It doesn't
- 8 mean it's necessarily going to change my view or
- 9 change my -- my vote.
- MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: No, I
- 11 appreciate that.
- MR. IAN CHADWICK: I made the decision
- 13 that I wasn't in conflict without any consultation
- 14 with -- with Mr. Bonwick or with anybody else.

15

16 (BRIEF PAUSE)

- 18 MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Commissioner,
- 19 given those answers, frankly, given the state of my
- 20 voice, I would propose to conclude there. And, as I
- 21 say, I may have a very few questions in the morning.
- 22 THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: That's
- 23 -- that's fine. Let's just recap about tomorrow
- 24 morning. We're going to start at nine o'clock. And
- 25 we're going to finish at -- at 1:30. When we come

	236
1	back at nine o'clock, Mr. Lloyd is going to be back in
2	the box, and then Mr. Chadwick
3	MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: All right.
4	THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: so
5	everybody's clear what the drill is
6	MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Thanks. I
7	appreciate it.
8	THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO:
9	tomorrow. Tomorrow nine o'clock.
10	MR. WILLIAM MCDOWELL: Do you want to
11	give the witness the caution about his evidence just
12	THE HONOURABLE FRANK MARROCCO: Well,
13	just, Mr. Chadwick, you're still being cross-examined.
14	You should not discuss with anyone the evidence that
15	you've given. It could lead to a misunderstanding
16	about your credibility.
17	MR. IAN CHADWICK: Thank you.
18	
19	(WITNESS RETIRES)
20	
21	Upon adjourning at 4:20 p.m.
22	Certified Correct,
23	
24	
25	Wendy Woodworth, Ms.

INQUINI	Te COULTINGWOO	05-01-2019	rage 237	O1 294
\$	12:1	178:8	132:4	183:13,20
\$10 79:10	13:3,4	184:15	135:10	,21,24
\$12,000	14:2	185:19	137:3	184:5,7,1
198:3	17:15,17	186:16	138:13	5 185:13
	182:2	17th	148:5	187:15 , 16
\$14 79:7	216:21	173:3,10,	195:19	201:22,23
\$15 79:7	219:1	19	2011	202:4
\$18,000	10:00 5:1	18 21:1,2	16:8,9	2013 201:6
183:16	125:5	23:25	27:4 31:6	202:11
	100 99:21		43:16,20,	203:24
\$600 198:4	136:11	1991 127:4	22	2014 128:4
\$90,000		1999 127:9	46:16,24	132:4
26:24	10th	19th 96:2	51:11	135:11
	102:18	99:9	53 : 13	137:3
0	106:6	100:19	54:13	138:13
00 29:11	11 126:24		56:23	148:5
	161:15	1st 1:22	57 : 3	195:19
1	182:15		69:12	203:12
1 5:11	11:10	2	72:19	2019 1:22
11:3,16,2	67 : 12	2 5:10	139:9	
3,24	11:24	85:13 , 14	148:14	209
13:19	67 : 13	90:5 92:2	149:1,25	139:3,8
14:1,5		106:12	155:23 158:19	20th 51:11
17:16,18	12:28	120:3	160:13	211 3:10
33:13	125:14	130:18	161:1	
34:25	12:30	133:19	162:6	214 142:25
40:1,11	101:9,12,	142:9,24 146:23,24	164:9	22nd
41:2	22	170:18	167:5,19	173:15
42:13	126 3:9	173:23	173:3,15,	174:1
66:15	12th 76:23	182:13	18,19	176:9
67:2,6,21	77:2	208:17,19	174:1	23
68:3	81:19		176:4,10	202:6,10
93:12	162:3	2:00 125 : 2	182:21	236 3:14
95:10		2:01	183 : 12	
124:14 128:2	13th 81:24	125:15	185:12	23rd
142:1,13	14 24:1	20 229:14	200:24	5:11,16,2 5 16:8
145:13,20	14th 35:20	20/20	201:22	187:15
146:21,23	46:16,24	179:1	2012 76:23	188:11
149:7,21	54:13	181:17	77 : 3	199:3
178:18	167:19	192:10	81:24	
223:21	178:7	2000	85 : 11	24 203:10
225:9	15 24:1	173 : 10	96:2 99:9	24th
235:2			102:18	185:13
1:30	1-5 4:22 182:16	2002/2003	103:9 106:6,10	187:15
235:25	182:16	127:5	106:6,10	25 11:16
10	202:6	2003 173:9	115:16	27:16
		2010 127:9	177:4	62 : 12
10:21,25 11:21,23	16th 85:11	128:4	182:24	80:15
11.21,20	161:24		- -	
i				I

	ie collinewo	OB 09 01 2019	1 age 250	
203:10	3.1 25:5	400 69:5	584 115:11	11:23
25th	3:06 182:5	434 69:5	585 120:17	12:13,22
203:12	3:16 182:6	436 69:20	586 124:15	14:2
269 46:11	3:50		587 123:16	17:24 33:24
279 51:1	210:25	437 70:18 176:5		106:3
			5th 24:5	112:8
27th 56:23 139:9	3:54 211 : 1	44 86:13	31:6 43:16	113:16,18
141:20	30	446 72:14	53:13	126:19
142:7	11:13,14, 17	473 77:23	57 : 2	146:17
143:2,22	17:10,17	81 : 18	69:12	170:12 194:21
158:11	18:2	480 76:15	162:1	
160:17	302 53:8	482	176:4,10	80 4:6 26:24
164:9		85:4,15	178:9 179:6,15	
288 160:21	30th 182:21	488 184:9	185:1	81 4:7
28th 5:13	183:18	4th 27:4	222:16	82 4:8
16:9	322 54:7	165:2		83 4:9
229:14		183:21,24	6	84 4:10
297 25:16	371 167:13		6 19:21	85 4:11
39:18	373 173:4	5	72:19	86 4:12
299 34:1	3rd 107:15	5 3:6	115:16 177:5	87 4:13
29th 43:25	108:12	152:5		
44:1	161:1,17 162:6	177:4 187:19	6:29 96 : 2	88 4:14
45:7,20 97:18	167:5	5:11	61079	89 4:15
100:18	173:9,18	188:13	29:13	
2B 214:3	177:23	5:49	61382 30:2	9
		188:25	40:17	9 11:6,24
2nd 106:10 107:17	4	50 25:3	7	112:8 216:22
161:25	4 3:3 11:22	51:25	7 11:24	9:00
202:11	143:3	53:2	113:19	125:7,9
	151:23	142:17	151:24	90 4:16
3	152 : 4	500 95:22	7:02	
3 11:23	161:21	502 100:17	100:18	91 4:17
26:3 32:25	190:5 198:4	526 188:24	7:35 71 : 18	92 4:18
38:3,16	234:6		7:37 70 : 2	93 4:19
39:6	4,000	527 188:2,7	707 203:20	94 4:20
68:14	224:9	531 185:10		95 4:21
69:20	4:20	187:16,21	710 206:1	96 4:22
120:15 124:3	236:21	,23 191:3	77 4:3	97 1:18
138:10	4:53	555940	78 4:4	
140:18	188:11	216:12	79 4:5	9th 115:16
143:10	40 149:13	581 107:17		
146:24	211:6,11	582 107:10	8	A&B 86:5
223:18	ĺ	J62 10/:10	8 9:25	
1	1			I

			_	
a.m 5:1	accessible	218:21	188:2	advance
67:12,13	148:19	219:7,25	190:21	90:7
ab 87:12	accord	220:4,7,9	194:21	163:7
	13:20	,11,19	216:17	advancing
abide	185:14	acted	add 82:4	98:17
219:6	accordance	106:2	181:4	adversaria
abilities	216:6	acting	added	1 134:16
107:3		108:5	90:18	
ability	according	113:11,14	208:12	advertisin
102:24	104:25	,22	addition	g 169:15
114:5	122:1	119:12	42:15	advertize
able 29:20	account	120:13	61:20	154:20
30:1	47:4	121:6	208:3	advice
51:22	135:5	123:18,25		85:25
58:24	154:14	204:10	additional	87 : 15
65:16,18	155:16	action	93:10	89:19 , 24
92:17	accounting	30:14,18	190:16,18 191:24	90:14,20
104:6	93:19	39:7	220:18	91:1,12,2
110:18	accounts	129:22		1,24
154:19	93:20	140:21	address	92:9,11,2
164:19		actions	31:21	4
165:10	accuracy 22:22	30:10	137:19	93:10,14,
190:25		37 : 23	154:25	18,19
209:17	accurate	actively	155:10	186:6
absence	13:7,15	186:9	195:1 , 21	196:20
165:1,16	22:14		addressed	197:6,25
absolute	35:21	activity	31:11	198:4,9,1 3
87:12	56:5,10 99:19	129:20	47:13	199:4,15,
absolutely		acts	94:22	17,19
100:4	accustomed	157:10	204:6	200:1,5,7
136:11	149:13	196:18	addresses	,8,12,19
177:12	across	actual	86:10,13	218:20
absurd	25:7	9:23	adequate	advise
28:3	151:8,9	20 : 25	206:13,14	103:24
	156:23	21:4,23	adjourning	104:11
abuse	act 110:17	22:21	236:21	105:10
202:24	120:1	24:2 46:2		179 : 22
abusive	175:13	actually	adjusted 19:10	advised
203:2	185:4	18:11		70:8
accept	195:5,23	20:8 22:2	adjustment	87:14
48:6	196:17,18	38:1 39:1	S	90:3
acceptable	,19,25	40:6 60:2	18:13,22	105:9
60:1	197:2,3,5	62:17	administra	162:13
	198:14 199:15	77:10,24	tion	advises
access	200:16	117:11	76:11	54:14
180:7 200:2	212:7,23	139:1	79:1	
218:20	213:13,17	146:25 160:7,23	80:23	advising
210.20	216:7,15	187:14	100:1,12	85 : 16
	1	10/•14		

	i ie collingwo	02 03 01 2013	1 agc 240	01 231
86:15,24	208:17	03 161:14	202:24	201:20
94:9,23,2	agreed	Alectra	amounts	207:3
5 95:2	38:22	2:7	226:6	221:2
advocate	68:4	2.1	220.0	226:12
235:4	114:19	aligned	analysis	answered
235:4		89:7,10	47 : 5	
affect	116:12	90:10	208:25	67:17,23
138:3	144:20	93:4,7	209:21	answering
164:4	219:5	94:12	212:20	118:18
191:24	agreeing	allow	analyzatio	189:11
201:20	87:21		n 93:22	220:25
affected	166:1	165:21,22	n 95:22	answers
	194:23	Almas 96:4	analyze	
192:5		114:24	23:9	235:19
affidavit	agreement	132:19	analyzed	anybody
87:21	75:8 82:7	133:3,5	21:21	26:5,10,1
90:6	143:24	alone	25:12	1 32:20
Affirmed	152:11,21	223:2		36:10
3:8 126:1	,24	223.2	analyzing	37:1,4
	153:20	already	13:21	59:19
afford	164:10	28:24	14:4	64:20
199:7	166:7,19	37 : 11	and/or	104:9
200:2	agreements	58:21 , 23	205:7	109:11
afternoon	85 : 17	80 : 7		114:11
96:16	ahead 69:1	98:20	angry	115:3
97:3	73:17	116:4	106:2	133:23
126:4,6	125:21	123:9,12	announce	154:9
182:10	165:6	132:17	51:23	162:9
. 64 1 -	166:7	177:12,14	121:14	168:10
afterwards	205:25	179:20	122:2	171:21
146:20		194:6,15	announced	185:5
189:5	Ahh 20:18	am 59:13	16:24	190:24
196:23	Aird	102:24	57:1	195:8,16
agenda	75:16,20,	125:5	69:15	197:20
111:13,15	25	127:12	123:24	199:11
,16 146:1	84:4,5,22	193:25	123.24	200:18
147:4	,23 85:2	221:2	announceme	203:5
agendas	87:13,20		nt 174:13	220:14
145:19,20	89:1,14,2	amalgamati	177:9	228:8
, ·	2	on 223:18	announcing	234:7
aggressive	94:21,22	among 10:4	173:14	235:14
110:20	95:3,4,19	120:22		anyone
162:22	184:17	142:15	annual	15:11,13
ago 9:25		amongst	159:12	83:23
17:24	alarming	204:6	answer	106:15
19:23	56:14		19:4	114:25
33:24	ALE0000178	amount	32:23	186:6
62:12	4:14	17:14	59:21	236:14
113:16	ALE50204	21:3	74:13	
146:17	213:19,20	152:4,9	107:8	anything
170:12		153:1,9	123:14	18:16,18,
	ALE5133.00		181:3	19 19:13
i	1	Ī	I	I

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOC	D 05-01-2019	Page 241	of 294
24:16	apparent	108:5	234:1	102:20,25
26:17	30:12	116:2	approve	aside
36:9 , 19	apparently	138:22	78:1	135 : 17
44:15	133:22	appreciate	145:23	159:3,12
55:11	133:22	33:3	165:12	162:25
56:14	appear	101:25	194:3,5,1	195:16
59:1	134:17			
68:18	146:18,19	211:19	3 , 15	226:3
73:22	174:1	232:3	approved	aspect
89:13	APPEARANCE	235:11	80:22	68 : 22
105:14	s 2:1	236:7	81:2	93:12
106:24	3 2.1	appreciati	131:18	aspects
140:12	appeared	ng 55:3	171:24	85:24
141:6,17	12:17		191:10	93:13
144:23	156:11	appreciati	193:2	196:11
147:2	177:20	ve 32:24	194:3	203:7
155:18	208:9	42:12		203:7
156:11	appears	approach	approximat	assemble
159:2	24:22	61:4 63:3	ely 177:4	144:20
164:6	30:9	97 : 2	April	assessment
165:11		129:7	106:10	48:24
	41:23	165:23	107:15,17	49:11,23
176:12	46:7 49:2	191:1,25	108:12	147:22
178:9,16	51:18		115:16	14/.22
186:17	55:16	approached	203:12	assigned
201:25	59:14	128:25	27.17	84:24
225:23	76:21	171:9	area 37:17	154:25
234:3	100:20	appropriat	43:14	161:6
anyway	116:1	e 28:20	66:25 209:4	assist
63:1	123:23	34:18		30 : 2
anyways	139:14	67 : 16	220:5	32 : 19
211:16	145:19	73 : 25	areas	60:3
	200:23	74:7	62:18	61:19
anywhere	203:13	99:25	195:9	122:24
151:23	204:5	104:24	aren't	
apart	206:1,4	105:19	103:25	assistance
39:10	appetite	130:10	134:8	25 : 19
	99:16	162:2	190:22	26:17
apologies	apples	163:20		27:20 , 23
94:6	18:24	181:19	arm 178:23	32:12
149:14	18:24	192:11,20	arm's	34:22
172:22	apples-to	206:19	159:15	35:1,11
apologize	18:23			42:11 , 15
6:11	applied	appropriat	arranges	43:18
138:19	195:11,17	ely	157 : 13	168:18
139:1	· .	195:21	articles	assisted
193:9,17	applies	approval	127:21	43:17
210:5	63:7	131:19	208:9	60:22
213:11	apply	145:21	articulate	
apologized	196:22	165:9,15,	d 47:23	assisting
103:10	appointed	17 , 23		44:6 65:7
103.10	appointed	166:12	ASAP	118:24
1	1			

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	05-01-2019	Page 242	OI 294
204:10	49:25	154:8	bar 209:4	203:2
assists	attending	181:14	Barrie	beforehand
46:19	99:8	203:5	25 : 18	140:22
71:7	129:7	205:22	26:2,4,12	Beggs
Associate	135:18	208:8	,18	26:1,16,2
1:7 2:4	184:19	aware 30:9	28:22,24	4
216:18,19	attention	59:6	29:21	_
	141:20	83:23	32:14,16	begin
Associatio		85:14	33:11	126:7
n 127:15	August	122:15	36:13	211:4
assume	43:20	124:21	37 : 2	beginning
58:22	148:18	132:23	38:14	28:15
75 : 22	149:25	133:15	39:11	44:16
108:20	155:22,23	138:14,17	40:1 43:4	70:1
149:21	158:19	158:7	44:3 62:2	160:17
157 : 4	authori	170:17	223:15,16	183:12
165:20	79:25	171 : 8	,21	230:7
166:3	authority	174:4	base	behalf
210:8	52:23	177:21	201:15	75 : 25
214:20		229:19,20	based	89:22
226:4	authorizat	away 65:9	17:10	99:1
assumed	ion 78:25	105:17	18:2 39:3	218:10
60:25	83:3 99:24	145:10	53:14	234:1
assuming	164:10	198:24	76:21	behind
32 : 8	166:4	axle 130:3	194:22	154:22
83:20			200:11,14	
108:2	authorize	———	205:5	belabour
149:18	78:25	back-and-	208:1	156:16
164:16	99:24	forth	209:8	belief
	authorized	31:2	basic	232:15
assumption 16:22	144:20		199:17	believe
10:22	164:13	background		8:8 13:25
attaching	authorizin	216:13	basically	16:14
47:4	g 78:23	back-	31:10	19:20
attachment	79:11,25	office	88:20	23:8
102:9	80:1,8,21	54:18	168:12	43:12
attempted	81:1	bad 65:11	basis	44:1
82:2	83:10	189:10	61:11	45 : 15
209:2	avail	205:20	88:11	51:20
	28:25	Bain 2:8	91:2	57 : 6
attempting		224:21	196:6	73:25
136:13	available		208:5	74:2
attend	67:25	balance	Bay 48:23	87:14,16
135:19	68:7,17,2	64:8,12	become	88:1 95:7
186:25	1,23	65:17	54:19	97:8
attended	96:15 114:15	balanced	172:1	98:21
77:10	125:1	205:23		102:8
attendees	140:5	bang 56:6	becoming	109:19
accendees	141:25	g 00.0	113:22	113:10
	111.20			122:24

INQUINI	Te COLLINGWOO	05 01 2019	Page 243	01 294
139:24	198:10	224:3	208:19	57:3,10,2
144:14	Bentz 44:2	228:11,22	blogs	1,24
150:7		229:2,21	148:20	58 : 17
151:16	Berlis	bidders	202:25	59 : 10
154:17	75:16,20,	18:14		61:20 , 21
162:7,9	25	55:16	blow	64:2,11,1
175:2	84:4,5,22	67:7 68:7	32:6,12	6
180:3	, 23 85 : 2		blowing	70:2,13,2
183:15	87:13 , 20	bidder's	32:22	1
184:1	89:1,14,2	67 : 6		71:1,17,1
195:10,16	3	bidding	Blue 28:2	8,19 72:4
196:9	94:21,23	161:3	board	81:24
201:5,9,1	95:3,4,20	163:2	55 : 22	96:12
4 203:16	184:17	224:10,13	73:1	97:5,15,2
205:2,13,	best 17:24		74:22	2
20 207:4	18:1 19:4	bids 16:11	85:19	98:13 , 17
210:3	23:1 56:6	22:7	139:22,25	100:17 , 23
220:8	88:6,8	biggest	143:11	102:18
221:19	105:1	87 : 2	144:15	103:6,9,2
223:17,19	120:10	billed	161:25	2,24
believed	136:3	152:8	boardroom	104:17
20:11	139:20		8:7	105:9 , 23
37:3	166:6	bills 28:1		118:1,4,6
43:2,8,11	172:11,12	bin 227:8	Bonwick	,9,16,23
44:7	,13,14	bit 21:9	2:10	119:3,10
66:16		23:22	26:15	120:25
87:3	better	23:22 30:5,7	27 : 4	149:4,5,1
220:12	87:11		29:3,16	1 150:5,6
	89:3	67:18 68:20	30:10,13,	100.10
believes	123:19	70:9	16 31:7,9	T O T • T O
97:1	234:7	71:3,20	32:3,11,1	155:24
believing	betterment	99:2	9	156:22
215:3	141:7	117:21	33:5,17,2	100.19
Belina 2:8	beyond	136:2,21	1 34:7,22	159:21
bellia 2.0	31:15	142:23	35:7 36:1	162:16,18
BELINDA	199:3	146:14	41:8,10,1	170:16 , 24
224:21	220:18	149:15	9 42:10	178:1
beneficial		159:14	43:16,23	180:13 , 16
198:15	bid 18:23	162:21	44:6,20,2	181:1
	53:14	198:5	3 45:3	182:11 , 22
benefit	163:4	215:23	46:7	183:11,19
58:13,17	167:21	216:21	47:3,20	,24 184:4
102:15	177:7	217:4	49:4	185:17
169:8	180:25	233:21	50:22	186:9
179:4	228:24		51:7,12,1	188:8,14,
212:16,19	bidder	Blackstone	7 52:2,8	21
benefits	33:8	151:17	53:3,13	189:2,23
204:20	51 : 15	block	54:4,13,1	190:12
205:7	67 : 21	209:17	4,17	191:9,11,
benefitted	68 : 3		55:4,10,1	14 192:23
	223:24	blog	5 , 20	198:17,24

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	05-01-2019	Page 244	OI 294
200:25	54:10	178:15	128:12,20	78:11
201:10	69:8 , 22	bringing	bus 104:16	81:1
202:12	71:11	63:10	107:3	128:16
203:1,2	72:16	198:2		197:4
222:4,9	76:17	204:19,23	business	
225:25	85:6		11:12	
226:18,23	95:24	broad	25:18	calculated
227:11,19	101:3	148:22	29:24	25:10
230:2,21	102:6,12	172:5	32:15	23.10
233:6,7,1	107:12,24	brought	33:1	camera
0,22	115:13	74 : 25	36:13	69:13
234:2,12,	117:13,18	111:5,11	60:3	70:5,6,10
16 235:14	120:19	129:17	62:2,5	,20,22
Danisi alata	126:8	159:13	87:7,8	71:3,21
Bonwick's	139:6	176:2	90:1	73:2
45:15	143:19	199:1	126:25	77:10
59:6	148:1	203:25	127:8	108:13,14
118:11	167:16		139:22	, 15 , 25
148:7	173:6	Brunswick	159:12	109:1,16,
155:6,21	175 : 24	148:15,17	160:4	18
221:14	181 : 21	buck 56:7	163:16	110:1,5,1
bottom	182 : 18	budgets	179:13	5 , 23
102:16	184:11	128:13	231:13,15	111:3
214:23	186:12		businesses	112:6
215:1	187:25	builder	61:21	131:16
bought	188:4	197:2	62:23	135:24
65:17	191:5	building		136:5
	202:8	169:11	busy	137:4,21
box 236:2	203:22	bullet	114:3,21	138:8
break 67:2	210:13	48:19	button	139:10
124:25	213:22		170:13	142:14
breaking	214:17	49:10,19 161:19	buy 64:12	143:3,22
130:2	233:1	209:4	_	144:24
	234:13,23		buyer's	145:6,12
Breedon	235:16	bulletin	140:16	167:4
2:19	briefed	126:18	buy-in	171:25
213:19	88:12,21	175:3	52 : 21	173:9
Brian 44:2	219:13	bullying	buying	175:11
brief 8:13		133:6,11,	64:8,10	176:3,15,
19:18	briefly	21	•	19 177:18
20:22	124:6	bunch	bylaw 28:4	186:25
34:3	bring	63:19	75:6	194:4
39:21	19:16	73:17	78:1,23,2	candidate
40:4,9,14	28:1	232:10	5	120:10
,20 41:5	63:19		79:11,25	CAO 44:4
46:13	73:3	bureaucrac	80:1,8,21	75:21
47:9	96:19	ies	83:3,10	82:2 , 7
50:6,12,1	125:18	157 : 11	96:3	96:17,22
8 51:3	129:9,10	bureaucrac	99:24	98:15
52:15	149:15	У	121:7	108:4,6,1
53:10	169:6	-	bylaws	6 111:5

INQUINI	TE COLLINGWOO	05-01-2019	raye 245	01 294
113:5,7,1	130:5	162:11	152:8,13,	191:22
1,14,22	131:20	164:6	23	192:1,8,1
114:6	163:1,21	174:21	153:4,8,1	8 , 22
116:2,13	165:25	222:11	4,21	193:1,5,8
119:4,12,	198:6	Certificat	154:15	,16,22
19,25	199:4,25	e 3:14	155:4,11,	194:1,9,1
120:2,4,6	216:24		14,25	2,19
, 9	217:1	Certified	156:9,18,	195:3,24
121:6,13,	226:13	236:22	21	196:9
15,21	cases	cetera	157:9,21	197:8,16
122:3,10	151 : 9	121:17	158:12,17	
123:7,12,	189:19	146:4	, 25	20
18,19,25		168:15	159:23	199:8,12
131:2,3,5	cashed	Chadwick	160:18	200:4,21
132:12	229:8	3:8	161:10,22	201:2,5,9
143:12	casually	124:25	162:7,20	,23
145:16	206:17	125:1,24	163:11,14	
164:23	catch 12:6	126:1,5,6	164:1,15	7 , 20
199:14		,10,16	165:3,19	203:16
204:10	categories	127:4,9,1	166:5,22	204:3,13,
CAO's 76:3	7:22,25	2,18	167:9	17,24
119:7	16:25	128:1,8,2	168:3,19,	205:2,11,
124:23	20:3	2 129:16	23	18
capacity	category	130:14,20	169:1,4	206:6,9
97:23	6:8 10:18	, 25	170:4,10,	207:8,25
	11:10,19	131:13,23	20	208:7,16
capitals	12:11	132:7,11,	171:1,4	209:2,12, 23
124:16	13:19,25	25 133:9	172:22 173:21	210:11,16
capped	14:1,19,2	135:7,15	174:7,16	,17
124:18	0 15:2	136:1,9	175:2,22	212:4,8,1
caps	20:5	137:6,22	176:11,25	
122:16	42:18	138:9,17,	177:3,8,1	•
	cause 82:2	24 139:20	7	214:6,12,
careers	118:7	140:11	178:5,25	21
11:20	151:24	141:1,13	179:18,24	
carefully	caution	142:8	180:19	14,19
221:7	236:11	143:17	181:4,16	216:3,8,1
carries	CBC 126:20	144:5,13,	182:9	6
217:25	CBC 120:20	22	183:1,14	217:3,7,1
a a move i na	centred	145:5,25	184:1,6,2	0,20,23
carrying 221:3	161:19	146:9,13,	0	218:5,14,
	CEO 128:2	16	185:2,15,	18
cars 130:2	aamamani a 1	147:10,16	21	219:9,15,
case 12:17	ceremonial	,24	186:10,18	21
34 : 25	81:5 100:9	148:9,13 149:2,5,1	187:1,5,1	220:3,20,
42:14		149:2,3,1	8 , 22	24
59 : 15	certain	150:2,6,1	188:22	221:19,23
76 : 8	41:21	5	189:4,9,1	222:3,8,1
89:25	certainly	151:15 , 21	6	1,21
101:15	149:11	101.10,21	190:1,21	223:5,12,

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	D 05-01-2019	Page 246	of 294
16,25	16:3 33:7	Chief 1:7	85:11	176:20
224:2,13,	44:13	210:23	184:17	179:17
23	123:22	216:18,19	clause	180:19,25
225:6,10,	201:24	chiefs		190:13
14,18,22	235:8,9		80:1,7,9	198:18
226:2,14,	changed	148:15	clear	201:15
18,21	44:15	choice	17:20	234:1
227:2,6,1	62:12	141:18	35:10	clients
2,14,20,2	02.12	142:12	42:25	57:11
5	changes	196:24	48:8 82:9	59:6
228:5,12,	54 : 15	choices	96:22	60:19
17,23	140:21	199:23	97:18	150:16
229:3,6,1	148:23	206:13,19	98:15	151:11,13
1,16,19	150:19,20	,22	99:6	155:21
230:1,6,1	151:1	232 : 12	114:18	158:21
7,19,20	170:5		117:6	176:17
231:1,6,1	changing	chose	120:6	178:18
0,18,25	15:16	189:24	151:16	201:1,10
232:7,11	18:19	chosen	168:15	224:9
233:9,23	characteri	177:20	198:15	225:7
234:2,15		187:11	221:17	234:3
235:6,12	zation	circles	230:3	
236:2,13,	209:10	159:25	236:5	clippings
17	charge		clearly	223:24
chain	117:8	circumstan	47:23	close
26:22	198:4	ce 63:21	Clearview	65 : 19
30:8	charged	64:22	28:2	107:18
41:8,19,2	152:19	circumstan		189:19
1,23 71:7	ah amai na	ces 219:3	clerk	closed
86:20	charging 152:25	city 26:2	75:21	69:11
90:19		37:2	79:1,11	173:11
102:16	charity	39:11	96:17	
221:8	129:9	44:3	99:25	closely
230:14	chastising		100:10	197:23
chains	137:23	CJI580	114:2	closer
26:13	chat 33:19	221:7	120:2 132:12	97:11
	188:12	clarificat		149:15
chair	191:12	ion 53:18	145:14,16 164:23	closing
66:13,16	222:5	134:2	197:4	96:9
73:24		180:17,20	197:4	
111:3	check	clarifies		closure
139:24	191:13	24:10	clerk's	184:14
challengin	Chenoweth		63:13	co 179:7
g 134:21	2:16	clarify	76:12	cobbled
Chambers	91:19	90:24	78:12	208:18
1:17	92:1,5	198:15	80:18	
	cheque	clarifying	100:1,6	code 196:1
chance	222:12	17:7	114:3	219:18,19
147:1	227:21	Clark	client	,23
change	229:7	84:10,25	56:6 72:6	220:3,5,1
1	,	,		l

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	D 05-01-2019	Page 24/	of 294
Col 146:12	86:4,16,1	169:23	s 231:12	s 128:15
Coll 25:25	8,24,25	coming	committee	comp 60:8
collate	87:5,25	74:6	48:24	companies
152:1	88:19	83:10	49:11,23	27:24
	89:10 90:9	94:25	73:24	53:21
collation	90:9	97 : 12	146:23	148:24
150:8	93:3,22	125:1	Committee'	155:24
collect	93.3,22	150:21	s 52:20	156:8,10
103:11	95:7	151:1		157:1,20
collection	115:7,8	155:20	common	158:1
24:23	138:15	171:23,24	89:15	
	139:11,15	209:18,20	132:13	company
collective	,19,23	232:21	213:2	18:18 64:14
61:24	143:11	commenced	217:25	87:18
Collingwoo	144:3,7,1	188:14	218:1,12, 24	148:7
d	5,20	commencing		162:22
1:2,16,19	147:15,23	5:1	communicat	163:15
2:18 26:1	158:15,24		e 131:11	165:22
27 : 24	159:13	comment	communicat	179:13
28:23	160:12,15	47:6	ion 160:7	234:17
48:1,3	161:1,3,2	85:23	168:2	
60 : 20	5 165:4	86:13		comparison
62 : 18	166:2	93:12,24	communicat	18:24
87 : 5	173:13,17	99:2	ions	Compenso
88:22	174:3,15	131:8 133:10	126:15 127:18	126:15
90:10	175:20	134:1	148:7	148:7
104:21	176:3,8,2	141:10	154:13	154:13
115:9	1 177:16	171:5	168:10	202:15
116:14	184:18	180:18		203:12
172:12,13	191:25	233:14	communitie	224:25
175:4	192:6		s 10:20	225:4,15
197:20	193:21	comments	community	228:7,15
204:7	199:2	53:19	35 : 15	231:12
206:3 223:22	Collus/	86:11	60:24	Compenso's
232:19	PowerStre	142:13	62:4,5	202:12
	am 193:24	204:15 234:17	66:5,6	competing
Collus	com 230:21		128:10,14	91:10
2:21	231:11	commission	,17,20	
11:12		221:6	129:6,8,1	competitiv
12:12	comes 34:5	231:11	4 137:8	e 12:11
36:20	79:5	commission	138:3,16	15:4 47:5
45:10,18	80:1,9	ed 233:7	141:7	competitor
47:24 57:4	87:10	commission	164:4	s 52:25
57 : 4 68:17	111:3	er 172:15	169:8	complete
69:14	210:8	211:3	179:4	5:24
70:19	227:18	211:3	190:24	21:23
73:1	comfortabl	231:4	195:14	134:7
74:22	e 88:23	235:18	206:11	206:3,4,8
77:7	118:24		community'	207:12
• .		commission		

~ -	1			
completed	156:12	confidenti	21,23,25	200:11
57:14	concerned	al 60:9	213:3	212:12
203:19	56:13	64:6	216:6	conscienti
completely	137:11	68:22	218:21	ously
135:25	150:20	135:25	219:7	215:3
136:6	178:22	136:6,11,	220:13	
142:20	186:3	14 137:20	222:17,25	consensus
177:14		138:7,14	224:15,16	143:24
	concerning	154:10	,18	consequenc
complex	53:14	179:25	228:16,21	es 133:15
64:22	concerns	181:5	231:21	consider
complicate	31:11	confidenti	232:23	58:3,8
d 63:18	57:9	ality	235:13	158:22
component	59:11	175 : 11	conflict-	162:17
20:10	74:25	180:4	of-	163:6
25:6	87:19		interest	219:19
49:11	102:21	confirm	212:6	220:11
	129:24	5:19		
components	134:14	17:23	conflicts	considerab
5:12,13	137:19	22:5,13,2	195:21	le 202:24
13:11,14	168:24	4 31:20	confrontat	considerat
16:11	192:16	51:6	ional	ion
18:14	195:1	83:12	134:17,18	119:11
19:10	conclude	175:5	confrontin	174:14
25:1	211:12	confirmed	g 134:20	185:18
37:13	235:20	22:13	_	considerat
161:7	conclusion	Confl	confused	ions 25:4
comprehens	97:12	185:3	212:25	119:4
ive	98:22,23		226:15	
207:13	·	conflate	confusing	considered
comprised	concrete	142:9	6:2 21:9	114:25
143:11	144:8	conflating	23:22	133:11
	conduct	174:9	confusion	179:3
computer	196:1	conflict	82:16	190:18
17:13	218:1	94:17		232:11
con 92:10	219:18,20	163:9	congratula	considerin
concept	,24	178:18,22	te 66:1	g 33:11
48:25	220:4,5,1	179:7,15,	conjunctio	73 : 16
	8	16,21	n 76:3	consistent
concern	Conf 195:4	181:8	connected	11:15
72:22		184:25	234:13	88:11
87:2,13	conference	185:3 , 19		143:15
88:3	77:1	186:7	connection	168:15
		101 11 11	43:3	
89:16,22	confide	194:11,14	155	1/6:23
90:2	confide 136:13	194:11,14	175:4	176:23 203:14
90:2 91:20		195:1,4,2 2 196:17	175:4 connection	203:14
90:2 91:20 98:8	136:13 confidence	195:1,4,2 2 196:17 197:5		203:14 constraint
90:2 91:20 98:8 134:12	136:13	195:1,4,2 2 196:17 197:5 198:14	connection s 28:9	203:14 constraint 198:5
90:2 91:20 98:8 134:12 137:5,13,	136:13 confidence 37:24	195:1,4,2 2 196:17 197:5 198:14 199:15	connection s 28:9 conscience	203:14 constraint 198:5 consultant
90:2 91:20 98:8 134:12	136:13 confidence 37:24 39:2,9	195:1,4,2 2 196:17 197:5 198:14	connection s 28:9	203:14 constraint 198:5

	TE COTTINGMO	OD 05 01 2013	rage 249	
58:7	196:24	contravene	6:17,19,2	86:4,15,2
97:23	context	220:6 , 7	3 16:4	3 93:3,25
98:2	63:10	control	168:11	94:9,22
205:4	85:10	51:25	cordial	cost 12:12
207:11		142:18,19	34:20	65:15,19
consultant	contingenc	·	132:7	93:21
s 25:12	ies	conversati		198:2
44:25	196:11	on	Corporatio	
	continue	33:18,20	n 2:8,22	could've
consultati	5:16	73:17	Corporatio	114:12
on 235:13	56:16	81:19	ns 175:12	council
consulting	88:14	83:8		1:17
156:2,4,7	141:21	90:12	correct 5:19	20:12
,17,21	155:1	118:16,18	6:4,20	23:23
157:2,3	182:13	,21,23	7:7 9:11	24:5 28:7
176:16	203:11	119:2	10:22	45:9,17
contact	205:9	170:18	12:3,13,1	51:21
26:19	continued	conversati	4,20,23	52 : 22
28:20	3:6 5:3	ons 46:1	13:16	57 : 5
105:24	39:16	61:24	14:2 20:9	60:15,18
130:11	56:20	77:6 , 9	23:10	61:4,10
192:22	69:3	79:17	27 : 5	62:7,16,2
	92:21	106:11,20	35:22	5 63:22
contacted	102:1	convince	60:5	64:18,24,
28:12,24	172:25	113:25	97 : 25	25
29:3	181:11	118:6,13	107:22	65:9,23
149:6,9	182:8	119:6	121:18	66:3,8
150:7	183:8	120:11	127:25	69:11,13,
contacting	201:4		128:1	17 70:4
169:11	205:12	cooled	148:10	72:20
contacts	225:2	106:18	164:2	78:3,24
156:22	230:12	Cooper	193:19,25	79:8,13,1
antain	234:25	2:12	194:2	9 80:2,10,1
contain 85:18	continuing	10:25	201:1,2,1	6,25
207:23	97:20	76:20	8 219:10	81:4,8
		77:2	222:2,3,2	83:10
contains	contract	81:19	0 229:5,6	88:12
207:25	58:21,23 59:2	85:16	236:22	96:7,9
contemplat	79:10	86:2	correctly	99:18
ed 100:21	104:23,25	96:4,12	137:11	100:8,15
139:19	153:19,24	102:17	196:22	104:17,23
contemplat	154:6	103:6 105:9,11	correspond	106:8,16,
ing 122:6		214:20	ence 95:5	21
	contractor		189:23	107:18,20
content	169:10	cooperativ		108:4,13,
168:13	contracts	e 53:22	correspond	15,17,23
CONTENTS	156:23	copied	ent	109:6,15,
3:1	contrary	131:4,6	126:20	18 , 25
contest	82:6	·	Corrine	110:5
		copy	84:11,13	111:1,18
	I		•	I

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	D 05-01-2019	Page 250	of 294
112:11	176:2,10	113:18,19	courses	22:18
114:15,25	178:9 , 12	128:19,22	149:17	37:10
116:3,9	179:8	130:16		78:14
119:18	180:10	131:21	cover	
123:9,10,	183:15	206:3	65:19	cross-
21 126:14	184:14,15		196:10	examinati
128:4,5,7	,16	councils	covered	on 3:10
, 8	188:9,10,	135:18	145:7	211:12
129:17,21	12,13,21,	199:16	221:6	212:1
130:15	25	council's	CPS0006920	cross-
131:9,11,	189:3,7,1	76:10	4:15	examined
14 132:4	7,18	80:21		236:13
134:4,12,	191:9	171:23	CPS6920	
17,25	194:3,5,1	173:12	8:11	cultural
135:3,11,	5,20	180:3	19:16	13:2
12,14,24	195:19	Councils	create	cumulation
136:5,18,	196:3	189:18	144:17	8:4
24	199:2	109:10	148:14	Cunningham
137:2,5,7	203:25	Council's	215:12	216:19
,19	205:3,22	141:2	218:12	210:19
138:20	206:10,21	Council-	220:2,18	
139:9,11,	207:10	wide	•	curious
15,21	216:24	189:15	created	133:17
141:16	217:15		207:16	curiously
142:16,21	218:19	counsel	219:20	232:15
143:3,12,	219:13	2:3,5,10,	creates	
25	222:16	14 169:14	220:20	current
144:2,3,1	227:17	221:6	creating	195:6
1,17,20	229:1	counsellor	141:15	currently
145:1,8,1	231:23	212:5	144:14	127:11,12
9,22	233:8,17	country	159:3	190:15
146:22	234:1	151:9	213:6	205:8
147:19		131.9		curve
148:4	councillor	county	credential	107:6
155:15	128:21,24	27 : 17	s 154:22	
158:14	130:13	28:6,7,9	155 : 7	customer
159:1,7,8	132:4	couple	credibilit	10:18
,10,13	133:13	137:23	y 236:16	31:16
160:11	134:3	160:22	_	cut 28:18
161:2,17	147:8	175:3	criteria	111:10
162:1,2,9	169:16	197:11	161:5	
,13	178:4	202:21	criticism	
164:11,13	195:19	203:17	133:4	Dale
165:1,3,6	196:3	210:20	critique	169:16
,9,12,15,	197:3		133:7	
17	199:23	course		Dan 26:1
166:1,11,	councillor	172:3	critiquing	29:24
18	s 61:23	200:9	134:10	31:25
169:6,22	62:3	220:7	cross	danger
171:18	106:21	222:10	210:19	130:2
173:2,10	112:8	232:14		
			crossed	Danny

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO)D 05-01-2019	Page 251	OI 294
26:16,24	192:7	228:19,20	163:25	55:6,7,11
'	193:23,24	229:14	207:2	63:14
data 24:25	198:7	231:22	224:16	76 : 12
206:17,18	199:23			78:12
,25	215:17	decide	decisions	100:1,6
207:9,13		109:6	131:11	104:1,4,5
date 47:18	dealing	decided	163:22	114:3
51:6	25 : 19	104:24	192:6	121:14
82:11	30:21	106:9	198:7	122:2
97:9	33:12	108:18	199:1,22	131:1,4,6
data 6.1	38:20	177:12	declaratio	,25
dates 6:1	63:7,11	189:24	n 166:25	132:11,15
106:12	64:22	190:19	214:14	,16
David 86:6	65 : 10	210:19	215:3	
day 31:6	109:11			depend
72:20	112:16	decision	declare	88 : 25
100:18	132:10	97:8	163:8	151:21
108:13	180:19	107:21	178:18	depended
161:21	199:1	108:22,24	179:7,15	136:17
164:20	206:24	109:14	184:25	
167:6	deals	110:6	194:11	depends
191:9	57 : 13	112:6,7	declared	32 : 15
192:11,20	61:21	120:7	176:14	58 : 4
,25	137:15	143:23	179:20	deputy
193:2,3,5		144:11	181:8	32:8 59:8
,7,10,14	dealt	159:2	194:14	70:4
	29:23	164:3,5,1	222:25	96:25
days 34:6	60:18,20	0 165:5	224:16,18	169:9
115:16	130:10	166:16	228:16,21	describe
193:18	133:20	177:14,19	232:22	128:5
222:1	198:16,17	178:16,24	declined	
deadline	Dean 14:7	179:9	206:4,8	described
178:8	96:5	180:10,11		47:12
deal 38:15	139:25	186:19,23	definitely	77 : 25
61:14,15	December	187:3,8,1	43:11	127:2
64:9	24:5	2 190:3,8	definition	129:13
65:19,24	43:22	192:17	s 213:25	142:5
73:14,15	57:1,2	194:5,6,1	delete	describes
74:4,11	69:12	3,15,20,2 4	227 : 8	139:9
85:24	72 : 19	_	221:8	160:25
93:13	161:25	200:9,11, 13 201:10	deliberate	161:3
95:4	162:1,3	205:21,24	ly 136:13	167:19
97:13	176:4,10	218:4,16	delivered	182:21
98:25	178:9	219:12,16	211:7	184:14
102:25	179:6,15	231:23		188:7
103:2	182:21	231:23	demonstrat	191:8
104:2	183:12,18	232:21	ed 48:20	describing
111:19	185:1,11,	235:17	Dennis	8:16 22:5
130:4,24	23		54 : 15	
132:13,14	186:20,24	decision-	department	descriptio
191:25	222:16	making	54:25	n 4:2
			J4.4J	157:16
1				

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	05-01-2019	Page 252	OI 294
209:8	141:6	directing	37:8	111:6
design	192:24	166:1	disclosed	113:1,4
168:7	193:14	direction	67 : 7	129:21
169:11	194:18	49:1		135:1,2
	different	88:14	disclosure	143:6
designated	8:23	96:22	24:2	166:6
130:22	27 : 18	98:15	216:5	176:15,20
desirous	38:7	99:6	discuss	, 22
232:4	62:1,11	117:6	15:8,12	179:11
desperatio	63:10,21	130:16	73:13	191:12
n 32:18	92:2	131:17	102:21	226:6
	109:6	143:24	104:6	discussion
detail	119:21	144:24	139:24	s 75:6
112:5	129:16	145:2,3,1	191:17	78:8 97:6
detailed	133:19	5	236:14	106:11
159:15	140:2	164:11,16	discussed	144:6
186:15	149:25	165:1,6	7:13,17	171:13
4-4-1-	156:5,6,2	·	21:14	179:7
details	4,25	directions	24:6	212:17
145:10	157:3,4	131:12,22	44:10	
159:18	169:6	directly	78:9	dissect
174:17,21	171:9	83:5	108:16	56:3,9
175:10	174:20	105:24	112:22,24	dissected
184:21	194:16	121:2	113:21,23	8:5
186:21	208:23	130:6	135:23	dissension
197:1	210:3	131:2,22	136:5	166:8
233:13	213:7	132:14	137:4,7	
determinat		133:5	142:15	distance
ion	differenti	147:17		233:20
112:9,11	ate	198:17	discusses	distaste
186:7	209:3,18	209:5	143:10	72:23
determine	differenti	226:22	202:11	73:10
110:11	ated	director	204:19	distinctio
143:7	210:3	62:10	discussing	n 194:7
181:18	differentl	130:3	21 : 12	11 194:7
196:3,4	y 60:21		96:4	distractio
·	_	Directors	170:17,24	ns 189:10
determined	diligence	139:22	182:10	distributi
58:23	134:4	directory	187:14	on 12:11
98:20	205:3	129:25	discussion	15:4
99:23	dinners	dis 37:8	7:9,12	
developed	135:21		9:18,20	divest
44:19	160:5	disagreed	10:4 72:6	63:15
developer	direct	80:12	73:2	divide
70:3,15	145:11	disappoint	74:22	134:22
1	185:6	ed 135:8	79:7,24	DM 32:5,8
device	198:21		82:6	
163:17	208:24	discharges	83:12,14,	Doc 4:22
difference	208.24		24	document
33:15	25	disclose	109:9,10	8:11
133:10,12	۷ ک			
1				

INQUIRI	re COLLINGWOO	05-01-2019	Page 253	OI 294
19:12,16,	139:13	doubt	198:8,22,	168:12
22 25:16	141:23	60 : 21	25 202:23	170:5
34:1	200:24	75 : 21	224:4	editor
39:19	207:18	83:14		126:18
42:4	208:12	107:5	E	169:19
46:11	209:5,20,	108:25	EARL 3:5	
47:7,12	25 211:7	110:19		editor/
51:1 53:8	213:18	dozen	earlier	writer
54:8 69:6	226:3	126:17,21	31:24	190:24
72:14	dollars		42:21	editorials
77:23	183:16	draft	84:3	148:20
79:19		47:12	90:12	150:9
85:4	domain	85:17	99:22	education
107:10	154:7,8	147:3	166:13	126:8
117:11,16	done 22:19	167:21	174:4	168:11
120:17	25:14	168:1	182:10	
139:4	33:3 35:9	170:2	202:21	Edwin 2:16
142:24	38:20	173:19	227:22	effect
160:21	60:7	drafted	early	165:15
161:14	61:12,13,	34:12	48:12	215:4
165:18	18	drawing	127:4	effectivel
167:14	62:9,10,2	26:7	easier	
171:6	5 63:13		105:4	y 212:11
173:4,22	79:13	drill		efficientl
176:5	80:16,23	236:5	easily	y 57:14
182:16	81:3,14	driving	154:8 209:18	eight 9:25
183:3	87 : 23	88:9	209:10	11:23
184:9	93:21	due 134:3	easy	12:13,22
185:9,22	94:18	205:3	103:25	14:1
187:17	114:12,17		Ed	17:23
202:6	118:19	during	96:14,17	33:24
203:20	131:13,16	32:6	108:5	106:3
209:11	132:2	61:18	112:21,23	112:8
214:24	133:23	127:2	113:10,21	113:16,18
216:11	157:1	128:4,7	,24	126:19
226:11	168:4	132:3,4 133:17	114:13	146:17
	170:8 185:11,23	135:17	116:12	161:11
documentat	197:12	137:1,2	118:6,13,	170:12
ions	209:14,16	138:13	24	194:21
78:20	219:3	139:9	119:6,23	eighteen
100:11	227:18	147:19	120:10	183:16
documents	228:4,19	148:5	122:24	
13:22	·	154:12	123:3	either
18:22	door	160:8	124:19	10:9 90:7
24:22	125:19	177:22	127:24	96:19
46:6	dot 93:19	188:9,21	edge 213:6	131:14 147:12
61:19	dotted	189:7,19,	edited	164:3,23
68:2	22:18	21 193:11	168:7	173:17
75:4 , 12	78:14	195:18		179:8
78:4 86:5	, 🗸 • ± 1	197:7,10	editing	1//.0
1		•		

INQUIN	i ie comminemo	OD 00 01 2019	1 age 254	01 234
209:3	235:14	153:20	91:13	213:6
elaborate	email	154:14,25	195:6,7,1	ensure
56:2	26:16,22	155:9,15,	6 197:18	38:19
	29:5,6,12	16	205:9,12	85:21
elaborates	,14,19	167:22,24	220:14	89:23
54:17	30:8,13,1	170:14	employees	146:6
ele 173:11	7,20	182:23,25	11:20	
elected	31:5,7,9,	183:20,21	62 : 20	entered
62:3,16	14	, 25	204:21	16:5
128:9	33:17,23	188:7,21		Enterprise
199:16	34:8,15	189:2	<pre>employers 232:18</pre>	126:18
	37:20,23	191:8,11,	232:10	175:3
election	38:6	21 202:12	employment	entire
140:18,19	39:23	203:6	106:9	88:10
elector	40:2,17	206:11	152 : 19	128:10
213:8	41:8,19	227:9	192:4,5	168:7
electorate	47:4	229:14	213:14	
213:2	51:7,8	233:11	214:4	entities
	54:13	235:3	enamored	87:22 115:9
electors	64:15,18	e-mail	48:25	113:9
195:15	68:23	55:4 64:6	endeavour	entitled
electricit	70:3,12	160:8	189:14 , 15	47:5
y 176:16	71:5,18	emailed	,17	envelope
electronic	72:19	31 : 7		16:16
6:15	73:6 74:9		energy	22:16
	86:20	e-mailed	148:21,23	envelopes
eleven	90:19	64:4	,24	21:16
126:24	92:23	emailing	150:10,13	23:5
else 11:16	94:2,7	51 : 12	,16,23,25	
14:20	95:8	63 : 25	151:5 , 17	environmen
15:13	97:23	64:24	156:22	t 53:23
27:16	98:13,23	70:21	157:5 158:20,21	envisioned
28:23	99:10	71:17	150:20,21	157 : 18
37:4,15	100:17,22	emails	182:22	161:3
43:10,22	102:9,16, 17	30:17	183:10	equally
46:2	103:5,9,1	31:2 34:6	201:12,13	60:16
68:18	6	41:12	223:10	63:7
83:23	104:8,18	65:1 72:2		
89:13	105:8,15	77:11	engage	equipment
104:9	115:15,17	85 : 16	61:23	26:7
114:8,11,	,22	96:12	82:24	equipped
25 116:2	116:20	134:23	engaged	234:7
124:8	117:21	189:6,11,	82:8,14,2	Eric 54:14
156:14 157:6,8	118:4,21,	21 230:14	1	
174:10	22 120:22	emphasize	engineerin	especially
180:8	121:2	124:22	g 78:17	106:21
195:25	122:2,8,1	emphasized	_	136:10
228:8	4	53:24	engineers	149:18 181:8
234:7	134:11,15		78:18	
	,22	employed	enormous	establishi
1	I			

	I IC CODDINGWO	OD 00 01 2013	- 1 age 255	<u> </u>
ng 143:10	43:10	129:9,19,	Exhibit	82:16
estate	46:1	25 131:15	4:2 183:4	206:12
89:17	66:23	134:24	Exhibits	explained
137:15,17	195:25	146:21	3:3 4:1	44:5,17
	208:20	213:5		45:7,20
estimated	evidence	224:8	existing	100:14
152:24	61:20	examples	48:8	140:1
et 121:17	77:25	55 : 15	53:20	196:7
146:4	78:5 91:3	59 : 5	expand	explaining
168:15	99:14	Excel 20:8	154:2,17	9:21
ethical	132:19,23		201:15	203:7
220:21	133:8	except	expanded	
ethics	135:23	13:5,19	201:14	explanatio
138:1	136:4	14:1,5	expansion	n 19:9
196:1	172:18	42:18	191:19	68 : 20
	219:23	59:18		explode
evaluation	224:24	exceptions	expect	103:3
161:5	232:13,22	195:8	45:21	explorator
event	234:14	212:24	145:2	y 141:14
25:18,23	236:11,14	excerpt	expected	163:16,17
49:24	exact	51 : 8	53 : 4	·
129:10,19	65:24		55 : 20	explore
230:24	exactly	exchange	82:10 , 12	94:17
events	14:15	93:1	expecting	explored
129:8	28:14	167:19	105:14	141:18
135:9,19	35:5 45:6	188:7		express
207:22	56:4	191:8,21	experience	133:12
208:2,4	66:22	excuse	10:18	
·	68:10	37 : 14	28:6	expressed
everybody	105:18	89:3	42:19	103:1
7:22,25	133:23	163:11	81:15	187:5
8:1,5	170:13	169:4	126:9,13,	expression
119:22	171:20	175 : 4	25 127:2	143:9
150:20		180:13	128:25	expropriat
157:6,8	examinatio	187 : 18	132:14	ion 66:9
172:6	n 210:20	194:1	135:5	10n 66:9
everybody'	211:5	233:9	149:12,16	extra
s 9:7	212:4	executive	,18,20,22	178:20
236:5	218:19	7:4	168:11	extract
everyone	Examinatio	204:7,8,2	169:18	94:7
11:2,16	n-in-	2	197:21,24	
20:4	chief	205:9,16	199:22	
61:17	3:6,9 5:3		205:5	
	126:3	exercise 146:6	206:24	facilitate
everything	examined	146:6 149:25	experience	s 157:12
8:7 21:23	142:2	163:25	d 197:19	fact
22:14		216:1	expert	21:15,19
23:24	example		86:6	39:3 72:4
29:24	53:20	exercised		88:6,7,20
41:23	63:23,24	219:5	explain	95 : 3,5

INQUINI	TE COLLINGWOO	05 01 2019	rage 230	O1 294
97:10	119:18	207:6	finest	188:6
146:7	136:12	fin 23:4	89:2	fixed
164:16	favour	final	finish	152:9
166:2	80:5	48:19	56 : 18	153:10
168:7	167:23	49:10	235:25	flag 87:25
170:8	170:3	52:22	finished	_
174:5	187:9	96:3	15:25	flags
175:18	190:2,3	147:4,6,9	52:8	87 : 24
185:16	193:20	185:22,25		flexible
188:1	February	191:13	firm	211:22
192:4 200:18	200:24	219:4	87:13,20,	floating
226:3	201:22	222:12	22 88:2	234:12
	202:3		95:12	
Fagen	224:20	finalize 98:25	199:18	flower
54:14	231:23		firms 89:2	73:13
fair 27:22	feedback	finally	137:17	FM 175:7
37:5 45:4	55:17	116:21,25	first	focused
68:14,16		120:23	10:16,18	49:25
86:1 89:7	feel 36:8	financial	38:9 42:5	
90:21	39:10	5 : 13	49:19	focusing
91:22	103:1,2	13:11	62 : 15	24:6
92:9,25	114:5	16:11	68:9 , 12	fool
93:15	164:2	17:8	107:4	136:24
154:24	169:22	18:3,13	113:21	footing
159:10	felt 38:7	19:9	133:9	223:2
209:10	42 : 25	20:5,25	139:14,18	228:21
210:8	58:5 60:1	21:20	142:25	footnote
220:1	67:17	22:7,9	143:5	210:1
226:9 231:24	73:15,16	23:7	148:15	
	87:9	24:25	150:24	footnoted
fairly	88:23	25:6	154:3	210:7,9
149:13	120:11 126:13	37:13 85:23	157:1,12,	footnotes
162:22	163:22	93:13	24 167:25 170:11	209:24
fairness	198:9	161:6	170:11	force
220:10	199:4		186:23	23:16
faithfully	200:1,19	financials	199:24	36:11
215:25	·	16:15	207:21	55 : 25
219:5	figure	21:12,14	215:24	59 : 17
fall	56:4	23:5,23	218:4	88:9
199:20	figured	findings	first-hand	141:15
	84:22	161:24	32:6	142:3
fallen	fill	fine 22:25		215:4
94:24	113:11	27:1	fit 13:3	forced
familiar	114:18	29 : 25	five 152:5	140:21
136:7	filled	40:25	177:4	forget
197:20	6:3,6	106:19	187:19,20	101 ge C
family	13:11	112:5	,22 222:1	
90:1		125:8	Five-	forgetting
115:4,6	filling	235:23	hundred	147:2
1			=======================================	

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	D 05-01-2019	Page 25/	OI 294
form	41:13,23	101:21	26:9	55 : 20 , 23
131:19	70:2	124:9,12,	27 : 15	·
185 : 17	117:25	24	103:10	gathers
208:5	120:24	125:10,17	104:6	79:2
		172:19	105:13	general
formalize	forwarding	180:15		54 : 21
75:12	64:1	182:1	Fryer 2:14	123:3
format	forwards	183 : 5	11:7 13:6	190:6
145:9	33:18	210:18	21:19	195:9,13
147:3,4,6	foundation	211:10,17	72:22	198:12
, 9	25:16	,21	73:2,10,1	233:12 , 15
formation	34:1	215:22	2 74:12	234:19
144:12	46:11	235:22	143:12	generally
	47:12	236:4,8,1	fudging	48:15
formatting	51:1 53:8	2	18:18,21	78:11
209:16	54:7 69:6		full 13:18	103:11
formed	72:14	frankly	15:3	104:19
43:20	77:23	114:2	29:12	146:9
	85:4	211:15	71:7	157:6,8
former	107:10	235:19		166:22
145:16	120:17	Frederick	fully	170:22
164:23	139:4	2:16	88:12	189:6,17,
168:5,6	142:23	91:19	124:20	20
169:9,14,	160:21	92:1 , 5	133:14	
16 199:14	167:14	free 226:5	205:21,24	generic
forte	171:6	234:12	fun 135:17	131:18
35:11	173:4		£	145:9
forth	176:5	friend	functions	233:15
74:25	184:9	28:23	66:16	genesis
	185:9	32:14	furnished	90:12
forty	187:17	36:13	225:17	goographi a
149:13	203:20	37 : 3	future	<pre>geographic 43:3,14</pre>
211:6,11	226:3,11	38:16	38:19	,
forward	·	39:6	43:5	geographic
41:19	fourth	118:11	162:24	ally
73:8	68:13	119:20		197:23
98:24	franchise	221:5		George
110:13	126:23,24	friends		2:12
113:13	127:6	118:7,11	gain	90:24
118:3	Frank 1:7	136:12	220:13	91:7,16
122:19	37:14,19,	160:3	Gajos 2:21	·
123:3	22	217:18	Garbutt	Georgian
144:4,7	38:5,25	friend's	12:2	48:23
155:1	39:5,13	25 : 25		gets 56:6
167:12	56:17		gather	61:14
179:23	67:1,4,9	front 27:3	44:20	76:11
187:8,9	68:8,11,2	81:5	gathered	101:22
231:24	5	129:4	22:12	129:20,21
233:18	91:5,14,2	130:1	79:3	231:12
234:4	5	149:14	154:7	getting
forwarded	92:3,7,18	frustrated	gathering	27:1
	J2.J, /, ±0		gachering	∠ / • ⊥

	. IC CODDINGWO		1 age 250	
36:15	155:16	128:25	hands	229:4
57:13	go-ahead	ground	166:20,23	having
62:13	164:18	65 : 5	167:1,3,7	26:6
65:15	1-	218:24	,11	83:12,23
66:1,7	goals		handwritin	106:22
91:22,23	58:21,24	group	g 131 : 9	108:3
93:10,21	59:1	127:14	_	119:24
137:12,16	golf	149:19,20	hang	129:1,6
144:6	135:16	155:3	211:16	133:10
166:15	159:24	groups	214:24	136:17
199:15,19	golfing	58:8	221:8	154:16
232:5,13	160:6	129:7	230:4	165:23
given 5:23		growing	happen	171:5,6
25:12	gone 62:9	11:12	45 : 1	198:12
105:2,3	89:17		96:24	204:6,15,
107:15	170:5	growth	happened	21 205:8
108:10	Google	191:17		214:1
115:17	152:1	guess 14:4	9:1,4 23:9	226:11
121:3		26:7		233:4
131:17	Gord 168:5	65 : 12	24:17	234:5
132:24	governed	82 : 15	39:12	
144:15,23	219:24	94:13	74:8	head 94:25
145:2	government	123:14	76 : 6 , 7	104:3
149:16	150:23	137:10	happens	131:4,6
154:13	152:15	192:14	61:25	132:15,17
161:16	156:23	193:13	104:11	heading
164:18	157:10,11	214:2	happy	49:16
166:4	221:16		14:17	53:19
174:2,5		guesses	37 : 17	69:11
199:17	grammar	137:9	38:15	108:8
235:19	168:14	guessing	39:11	143:4
236:15	grants	29:9	65:14	heads
	65 : 17	211:6	103:13	104:5
giving	amont.	guidelines	181:25	121:15
47:1	great 31:18	168:8	187:7	122:3
62:23	35:12,13			131:1
99:6	76:13	guy 33:1	hard	132:11
114:17	101:17	guy's 74:4	6:18,23	
126:24	104:20		16:4	hear 153:7
157:14	107:1,3	Н	170:13	heard
200:8	206:12	habit	220:12,25	70:20
230:19		65 : 12	harm	132:18
glad	greater		181:13	135:22
116:21,25	51:21	hall 1:16	207:5	136:4
120:23	128:9	174:8	haven't	159:7
Glicksman	green	196:19	38:22	hearing
51:8,13	148:23	hand 7:1	103:1	nearing 87:6
81:25	150:23,25	121:4	210:21	
100:19	·	handed	216:11	139:18
	grey 220:5	6:24 7:8	218:6	141:9
gmail 47:4	grocery	0:24 /:0	210.0	hearings
1				1

	TE COLLINGWOO		rage 239	
132:22	34:12	home	182:23	121:1,5
he'd	35 : 13	89:20,25	183 : 20	122:8
116:12	56:1,4,7	106:24	186:1	123:16,24
124:1	58:21	198:2	209:23	127:24
	74:5,6	honest	hoped	139:10
held 1:15	85 : 17	21:9	122 : 2	141:24
148:16	92:4,8,10	98:11		143:2,6,1
174:1	100:20	90:11	hoping	2 167:20
help	119:7	honestly	32 : 19	170:16,24
27:10,11,	156:24	44:23	105:10	204:10
14 31:15	157:1 , 12	Honour	124:4	Houghton's
34:19,22	216:23,24	67:16 , 20	185:25	47:4,6
35:15	226:4	124:6	horizon	·
36:1,16	hesitant	180:14	12 : 17	hour 198:4
37:4	110:2	224:22	52 : 25	hours
48:17		234:11	53 : 4	151:24
62:4	high		151 : 1	152:5
66:4,6,11	18:6,10	honourable	horn	house
,17	37 : 24	18:17	32:6,12,2	129:4
115:18	39:2,9	37:14,19,	2	130:1
119:8	higher	22	۷	
123:1	38:12	38:5,25	host	HR 103:25
132:1	highly	39:5,13 56:17	126 : 22	104:1,2,4
169:20,23	54 : 20	67:1,4,9	Hotel	112:17
183:22		68:8,11,2	63:19,24	133:23
194:17	Hill	5		hub 48:1
helped	223:17	91:5,14,2	Houghton 2:16 11:1	huge 107:5
28:3,7	hindsight	5	12:2,4,6,	_
35:14	179:1	92:3,7,18	22 13:18	Hume 79:10
36:17	181:17	101:21	14:5,9,18	hundred
38:23	192:10	124:9,12,	,21 15:9	123:4
60:21	hired	24	47:14	187:20
	123:10	125:10,17	73:8,14	Hurontario
helping 37:2	140:1	172:19	74:9	1:18
46:23	148:14	180:15	76:4,21	
57:13		182:1	77 : 2	hydro
62:1,2	hobby	183:5	81:20	18:23
66:5	206:16	210:18	96:2 , 13	21:1
	Hogg 7:6,9	211:10,17	108:5	26:4,12,1
helps	hold	,21	112:21,24	8
68:24	26:4,23	215:22	113:1,10,	28:22,24
Henderson	29:20	235:22	13,21	29:22
31:5,8	32:19	236:4,8,1	114:13,19	32:15,16
32:4	73:24	2	,24	33:12 36:13
33:18	74:3	hope 55:22	115:18,22	36:13
34:15	holds	61:15,17	116:1,12	47:22,23
here's	69:11	76:2,6	117:22	48:4,10,1
211:4		86 : 10	118:12	7
	holes	90:3	119:11	49:1,3,5,
he's	199:20	121:13	120:10,22	12 171:16
26:9,19				12 1/1.10

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWO	JD 05-01-2019	Page 260	of 294
224:11	160:18	,23	232:7,11	53 : 14
	161:10,22	202:1,3,1	233:9,23	140:3
	162:7,20	7,20	234:2,15	219:11
I	163:11,14	203:16	235:6,12	
Ian 3:8	164:1,15	204:3,13,	236:17	identical
125:24	165:3,19			86:18 , 25
126:1,6,1	· ·	17,24	ice 62:17	87 : 25
0,16	166:5,22	205:2,11,	63:3,4	88:18
127:4,9,1	167:9	18	129:5	identified
2,18	168:3,19,	206:6,9	I'd 6:25	99:10
128:1,8,2	23	207:8,25	27:21	
2 129:16	169:1,4	208:7,16		identifies
130:14,20	170:4,10,	209:2,12,	42:24	161:20
, 25	20	23	58:2 94:2	identify
131:13,23	171:1,4	210:11,17	142:25	8:22
132:7,11,	172 : 22	212:8,14,	149:6	154:20
25 133:9	173:21	22 213:10	151:24	195:20
135:7,15	174:7,16	214:6,12,	152 : 3	
136:1,9	175:2,22	21	161:14	207:6
137:6,22	176:11,25	215:7,11,	167:13	209:16,24
138:9,17,	177:3,8,1	14,19	173:1	identifyin
24 139:20	7	216:3,8,1	190:5	g 155:21
	178:5,25	6	191:16	210:1
140:11	179:18,24	217:3,7,1	207:19	
141:1,13	181:4,16	0,20,23	idea 9:2	I'11 10:13
142:8	183:1,14	218:5,14,	41:17	36:24
143:17	184:1,6,2	18	55:25	50:3 91:4
144:5,13,	0	219:9,15,		94:13
22	185:2,15,	213.3,13,	56:11	101:23
145:5,25	21	220:3,20,	58:4,25	109:5
146:9,13,		24	60:2	122:25
16	186:10,18		72:24	125:9,21
147:10,16	187:1,5,1	221:19,23	73:11	139:1
,24	8,22	222:3,8,1	74:13,20	149:15
148:9,13	188:22	1,21	98 : 7	160:23
149:2,5,1	189:4,9,1	223:5,12,	100:7,13	181:3
0	6	16,25	110:22,25	212:10
150:2,6,1	190:1,21	224:2,13	113:13	I'm
5	191:22	225:6,10,	119:15	5:16,19
151:15,21	192:1,8,1	14,18,22	122:12	9:24
152:8,13,	8,22	226:2,14,	144:8	
23	193:1,5,8	18,21	154:1,17	10:10
153:4,8,1	,16,22	227:2,6,1	158:2	14:17,22
4,21	194:1,9,1	2,14,20,2	159:8	15:23,24
154 : 15	2,19	5	163:4	16:16,22
155:4,11,	195:3,24	228:5,12,	164:7	17:24
14,25	196:9	17,23	205:15	18:20,21
156:9,18,	197:8,16	229:3,6,1	213:9	19:4
21	198:1,12,	1,16,19	223:5	21:10
157:9,21	20	230:1,6,1	224:3	22 : 23
· ·	199:8,12	7,19,20	226:9	23:1
158:12,17	200:4,21	231:1,6,1	227:4	24:5,11,1
, 25	201:2,5,9	0,18,25		2,15,16
159:23	, -, -	, , -	ideas	

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	D 05-01-2019	Page 261	of 294
25:20	172:17	216:25	53:19	28:12
30:23	174:9	217:2,6	86:4,19	36:1
32:8	175:15	233:4	104:9,14,	39:24
37:17	180:5,7		18 105:23	42:11
38:4	181:3,13,	impressed	148:22	61:9,11,2
40:23	24,25	38:2	206:12	3 64:24
45:25	182:15	impression		65:17
46:5,23	183:2	49:22	including	130:15
52:8	184:8	improper	10:25	131:21
55 : 24	185:8,25	<pre>improper 91:3</pre>	103:8,21	138:2
56:12	188:1,12	91.5	118:12	196:3,22
59:4	192:13,14	improved	168:5	200:10
61:13	,15	218:22	221:16	
62:24	193:16,19	inadequate	income	individual
66:24	194:19	206:10,25	183:11	ly 9:23
67:23	197:2,11,	207:7,9	232:14	individual
68:4,16	19	·	incorrect	s 31:21
69:10	211:5,15,	inappropri		45:9,17
74:12	22 218:8	ate 73:20	136:20 233:10	49:16
77:12	219:11,24	104:9	233:10	99:10
83:11,16	220:24	105:21	incurring	157 : 11
87:7,25	224:21	106:1	10:25	
88:25	226:14	inauspicio	independen	individual
89:8	230:9,20	us 125:18	t 87:15	's 31:11
91:16,17	231:1	in-between	89:19,24	200:10
92:12	232:7,14,	146:24	90:14,18	industries
95:13	19	140:24	91:1,12,1	156 : 24
97:9		Inc 148:7	5,23	industry
103:3	imagine	in-camera	92:15	48:22
107:2	18:18	56:24	197:17	127:21
108:2,3,1	immediatel	113:16		150:19
7	y 26:23	116:11	in-depth	162:23
110:2,3,1	29:23	158:13	48:21	172:6
6,24	113:24	160:17	indicated	188:17,19
113:2,3	impact	161:1	176:18	190:5,6,8
119:6	189:23	162:1	179:21	208:10
122:15	192:17	163:7	indicates	224:5,6
124:5,7,8		166:22	123:20	233:12,16
128:2,24	impartiall	167:1	162:2	234:4,8,1
136:9	У	incident		8
138:9	215:17,25		indication	
140:11	219:5	43:19	18:21	inf 173:14
141:19	impediment	199:13	143:24	influence
142:13,22	197:24	include	144:3	10:8
149:13,18		45:9,16	indirect	42 : 19
153:22	implying	78:1	185:6	influenced
161:12	92:10	99:16	198:21,23	9:3
164:16	important	103:22	214:1	
165:16,19	43:4	158:9,22	individual	informatio
170:7	66:14	208:24,25	9:8,12	n 22:12
171:8,13	194:8	included	27:10	44:21
			2 / • 10	

INQUIR	I TE COTTINGMO(05-01-2019	rage 202	OI ZJI
46:6	194:22	218:9	197:5	123:19
49:3,5,10	197:25	insecurity	198:14,20	147:2
50:22	199:1,5	124:19	199:15	interject
51:14,17	200:1,18		212:7,17,	37:18
52:3 , 9	201:16	instance	21,23,25	
53:4,16	202:14	12:12	213:7	interpreta
54:4,16	205:22	14:7	214:2,5	tion 90:8
55:10,15,	206:14	17 : 15	216:5,6	208:2,4,2
16,19,23	207:1,8,9	18:22	218:21	5 209:21
56:12	, 23	21:1	219:7	213:11,15
57:3,10,2	208:1,5	43:16	222:17,18	interprete
0,24	209:1,18,	51:19	228:16	d 140:24
58:6,11,1	19,21	57:22	231:21	
2,13,14,1	210:7,8	63:7 79:6	232 : 6	<pre>interrupt 171:5</pre>
8	218:20	219:5	interested	1/1:5
59:8,10,1	222:22	instances	64 : 1	interrupti
7 60:3,8	informed	59:9	143:13	ng
62:23	85 : 12	66:19	149:6	230:9,10
67:18,22,	116:9	instructio	191:18	introducti
24 68:6	130:17	ns 75:25	221:12,21	on 43:25
78:20	132:17	131:12,21	230:15,19	
79:2	133:14		231:16	210:4
100:24	150:18	int 128:10	Interestin	
129:13,15	172:10	integrity	g 42:24	investigat
130:6,12,	173:12	48:21	_	e 139:12
23	178:24	intended	interests	investigat
134:5,9,1	205:21,24		10:19	ive
4 135:23	·	130:12	86:17 , 25	ive 209:9,13
4 135:23 136:4,14,	infrastruc	130:12 intention	86:17,25 88:6,8,17	209:9,13
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25	infrastruc ture	130:12	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19	209:9,13 invited
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12,	infrastruc ture 169:12	130:12 intention	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10	209:9,13 invited 135:19
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20	infrastruc ture 169:12 initial	130:12 intention 114:22	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1	infrastruc ture 169:12	<pre>intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12</pre>	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15	infrastruc ture 169:12 initial	<pre>130:12 intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest</pre>	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15 154:6	<pre>infrastruc ture 169:12 initial 90:19</pre>	<pre>intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest 47:17,19</pre>	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6 94:11	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23 203:13
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15 154:6 156:2	<pre>infrastruc ture 169:12 initial 90:19 initially 15:16</pre>	130:12 intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest 47:17,19 59:7	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6 94:11 98:18,20	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23 203:13 222:12
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15 154:6 156:2 157:15	<pre>infrastruc ture 169:12 initial 90:19 initially 15:16 initiated</pre>	130:12 intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest 47:17,19 59:7 60:23	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6 94:11 98:18,20 128:10	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23 203:13 222:12 invoiced
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15 154:6 156:2 157:15 159:4,11,	<pre>infrastruc ture 169:12 initial 90:19 initially 15:16 initiated 110:11</pre>	130:12 intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest 47:17,19 59:7 60:23 95:7	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6 94:11 98:18,20 128:10 129:24	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23 203:13 222:12 invoiced 226:19,21
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15 154:6 156:2 157:15 159:4,11, 16	<pre>infrastruc ture 169:12 initial 90:19 initially 15:16 initiated 110:11 initiative</pre>	130:12 intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest 47:17,19 59:7 60:23 95:7 129:20	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6 94:11 98:18,20 128:10 129:24 213:2	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23 203:13 222:12 invoiced
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15 154:6 156:2 157:15 159:4,11,	<pre>infrastruc ture 169:12 initial 90:19 initially 15:16 initiated 110:11</pre>	130:12 intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest 47:17,19 59:7 60:23 95:7	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6 94:11 98:18,20 128:10 129:24 213:2 217:17	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23 203:13 222:12 invoiced 226:19,21
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15 154:6 156:2 157:15 159:4,11, 16 160:15,19	<pre>infrastruc ture 169:12 initial 90:19 initially 15:16 initiated 110:11 initiative</pre>	130:12 intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest 47:17,19 59:7 60:23 95:7 129:20 143:8,9	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6 94:11 98:18,20 128:10 129:24 213:2 217:17 219:18	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23 203:13 222:12 invoiced 226:19,21 227:15
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15 154:6 156:2 157:15 159:4,11, 16 160:15,19 161:18	<pre>infrastruc ture 169:12 initial 90:19 initially 15:16 initiated 110:11 initiative 88:11</pre>	130:12 intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest 47:17,19 59:7 60:23 95:7 129:20 143:8,9 172:12,13	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6 94:11 98:18,20 128:10 129:24 213:2 217:17 219:18 interfacin	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23 203:13 222:12 invoiced 226:19,21 227:15 involve 144:16
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15 154:6 156:2 157:15 159:4,11, 16 160:15,19 161:18 162:5,10	<pre>infrastruc ture 169:12 initial 90:19 initially 15:16 initiated 110:11 initiative 88:11 in-person 147:13</pre>	130:12 intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest 47:17,19 59:7 60:23 95:7 129:20 143:8,9 172:12,13 176:14	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6 94:11 98:18,20 128:10 129:24 213:2 217:17 219:18 interfacin g 178:20	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23 203:13 222:12 invoiced 226:19,21 227:15 involve 144:16 involved
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15 154:6 156:2 157:15 159:4,11, 16 160:15,19 161:18 162:5,10 163:17,24	<pre>infrastruc ture 169:12 initial 90:19 initially 15:16 initiated 110:11 initiative 88:11 in-person</pre>	130:12 intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest 47:17,19 59:7 60:23 95:7 129:20 143:8,9 172:12,13 176:14 179:15,16	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6 94:11 98:18,20 128:10 129:24 213:2 217:17 219:18 interfacin	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23 203:13 222:12 invoiced 226:19,21 227:15 involve 144:16 involved 21:19
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15 154:6 156:2 157:15 159:4,11, 16 160:15,19 161:18 162:5,10 163:17,24 166:15	<pre>infrastruc ture 169:12 initial 90:19 initially 15:16 initiated 110:11 initiative 88:11 in-person 147:13 input 53:15</pre>	130:12 intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest 47:17,19 59:7 60:23 95:7 129:20 143:8,9 172:12,13 176:14 179:15,16 180:12	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6 94:11 98:18,20 128:10 129:24 213:2 217:17 219:18 interfacin g 178:20	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23 203:13 222:12 invoiced 226:19,21 227:15 involve 144:16 involved 21:19 27:17
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15 154:6 156:2 157:15 159:4,11, 16 160:15,19 161:18 162:5,10 163:17,24 166:15 173:14,25	<pre>infrastruc ture 169:12 initial 90:19 initially 15:16 initiated 110:11 initiative 88:11 in-person 147:13 input 53:15 inquiry</pre>	130:12 intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest 47:17,19 59:7 60:23 95:7 129:20 143:8,9 172:12,13 176:14 179:15,16 180:12 181:9 185:4,5,6 ,19 186:8	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6 94:11 98:18,20 128:10 129:24 213:2 217:17 219:18 interfacin g 178:20 180:24	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23 203:13 222:12 invoiced 226:19,21 227:15 involve 144:16 involved 21:19 27:17 32:25
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15 154:6 156:2 157:15 159:4,11, 16 160:15,19 161:18 162:5,10 163:17,24 166:15 173:14,25 176:2,8	<pre>infrastruc ture 169:12 initial 90:19 initially 15:16 initiated 110:11 initiative 88:11 in-person 147:13 input 53:15 inquiry 1:3 2:3,4</pre>	130:12 intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest 47:17,19 59:7 60:23 95:7 129:20 143:8,9 172:12,13 176:14 179:15,16 180:12 181:9 185:4,5,6	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6 94:11 98:18,20 128:10 129:24 213:2 217:17 219:18 interfacin g 178:20 180:24 interim	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23 203:13 222:12 invoiced 226:19,21 227:15 involve 144:16 involved 21:19 27:17 32:25 38:11,13
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15 154:6 156:2 157:15 159:4,11, 16 160:15,19 161:18 162:5,10 163:17,24 166:15 173:14,25 176:2,8 178:24	<pre>infrastruc ture 169:12 initial 90:19 initially 15:16 initiated 110:11 initiative 88:11 in-person 147:13 input 53:15 inquiry 1:3 2:3,4 207:17</pre>	130:12 intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest 47:17,19 59:7 60:23 95:7 129:20 143:8,9 172:12,13 176:14 179:15,16 180:12 181:9 185:4,5,6 ,19 186:8	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6 94:11 98:18,20 128:10 129:24 213:2 217:17 219:18 interfacin g 178:20 180:24 interim 112:19	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23 203:13 222:12 invoiced 226:19,21 227:15 involve 144:16 involved 21:19 27:17 32:25 38:11,13 43:14
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15 154:6 156:2 157:15 159:4,11, 16 160:15,19 161:18 162:5,10 163:17,24 166:15 173:14,25 176:2,8 178:24 179:22,25	<pre>infrastruc ture 169:12 initial 90:19 initially 15:16 initiated 110:11 initiative 88:11 in-person 147:13 input 53:15 inquiry 1:3 2:3,4 207:17 208:13</pre>	130:12 intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest 47:17,19 59:7 60:23 95:7 129:20 143:8,9 172:12,13 176:14 179:15,16 180:12 181:9 185:4,5,6 ,19 186:8 191:23 195:1,5,9 ,14,21,23	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6 94:11 98:18,20 128:10 129:24 213:2 217:17 219:18 interfacin g 178:20 180:24 interim 112:19 116:13	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23 203:13 222:12 invoiced 226:19,21 227:15 involve 144:16 involved 21:19 27:17 32:25 38:11,13 43:14 44:6
4 135:23 136:4,14, 17,20,25 137:3,12, 15,20 138:3,7,1 5 139:15 154:6 156:2 157:15 159:4,11, 16 160:15,19 161:18 162:5,10 163:17,24 166:15 173:14,25 176:2,8 178:24 179:22,25 180:7	<pre>infrastruc ture 169:12 initial 90:19 initially 15:16 initiated 110:11 initiative 88:11 in-person 147:13 input 53:15 inquiry 1:3 2:3,4 207:17</pre>	130:12 intention 114:22 interactio n 178:12 interest 47:17,19 59:7 60:23 95:7 129:20 143:8,9 172:12,13 176:14 179:15,16 180:12 181:9 185:4,5,6 ,19 186:8 191:23 195:1,5,9	86:17,25 88:6,8,17 ,19 89:6,10 90:10 91:10 93:4,6 94:11 98:18,20 128:10 129:24 213:2 217:17 219:18 interfacin g 178:20 180:24 interim 112:19 116:13 119:4,7	209:9,13 invited 135:19 invoice 182:22 185:23 203:13 222:12 invoiced 226:19,21 227:15 involve 144:16 involved 21:19 27:17 32:25 38:11,13 43:14

	10 00LLINGNO	OD 05 01 2013		01 234
75:21,23	89:14	105:23	0,22	6 , 21
78:7	91:17,20	147:17,18	6:5,9,13,	39:16,17,
87:19	94:15	149:12,14	18,22	23
95:1 97:5	105:24	,16 160:2	7:1,5,8,1	40:6,11,1
98:2	111:4,10	207 : 17	6,23	6 , 22
122:17	112:17	209:7	8:10,15,1	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
123:1	122:25	2001	9	,18,22
124:16,21	134:13		9:9,12,15	
151:5	138:6		10:1,3,10	
156:20	164:11	Jane 89:4	,13,23	44:9,18
162:18	173:13	January	11:4,7,9,	· ·
163:1		76:23	18,25	,22
171:15,16	issued	77 : 2		i i
· ·	161:4	81:23,24	12:5,8,16	5,22
180:8	174:6	85 : 11	,21,24	·
222:23	issues	96:2 99:9	13:1,9,17	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
228:24	26:6	100:18,19	,24	49:7,9,14
involves	85:13,14	177:4	14:11,14,	
135:2	103:25	183:12,21	16,25	50:9,15,2
irony	103:23	,24	15:2,7,12	
94:19	104:2	184:4,6,1	,15,19,22	
	100:22,24	5	,25	52:5,7,12
Irrespecti	122:18,25	185:12,19	16:2,7,19	i i
ve 52:20	129:1,3,9	186:16	17:1,6,19	
irrevocabl		187:15	, 25	54:3,6,12
e 164:4	,11	199:3	18:12,20	55:9,14
166:14	133:15		19:1,6,15	
	134:22	221:11,22	,20,25	21 57:8
i's 22:17	147:8	,23	20:3,16,1	
78:13	150:9	227:18	9 21:5	59:4,13,2
93:20	175:11,12	228:14,25	22:4,10,2	
isn't	It'd 22:15	229:14	3	60:6,11,1
13:11	items 82:5	Jeff 44:2	23:2,12,1	
35:11	145:20	jeopardy	8	61:1,8,16
36:25	146:6	200:8	24:4,9,15	63:2,6,23
73:25	203:18		,21	64:17 , 21
100:2		jets	25:9,15,2	65:22
196:13	it'll	106:18	2	66:24
212:19	191:14	job 44:17	27:2,9,22	69:3,4,10
	I've	66:4	28:11 , 17	,19,24
isolated	27:17,20	76:13	29:2,7,10	70:17 , 24
36:12	28:1	105:5	30:1,4,23	71:6,9,13
issue	35:14	114:12	31:4,19,2	,16,24
26:25	38:20,24	121:4	3 32:2,10	72:3,13,1
28:16	42:3	123:18	33:2,6,16	8 73:5,9
36:13	56:14	147:7	, 25	74:8,14,1
39:25	59:2	156:12	34:5,11,1	7 , 21
52:21	79:13	235:7	4,24	75:2,10,1
53:18	80:2		35:6,17,2	5,17,24
59:23	89:17	John 2:4	0,24	76:5,14,1
79:5,14	90:4	3:6	36:5,21	9,25
82:25	94:24	5:3,4,7,2	37:5,11,1	77:5,13,1
	74.24			
			<u> </u>	i

INQUIRY re COLLINGWOOD	05-01-2019	Page 264 of 294
------------------------	------------	-----------------

	ic confindation)D 05 01 2013	1 age 204	O1 234
9,22	117:3,10,	126:3,4,7	164:8,25	22
79:15	15,20,24	, 12	165:14,25	199:10,21
80:4,11	118:3,15,	127:1,6,1	166:17	200:17,23
81:6,11,1	20	0,16,23	167:2,12,	201:3,7,1
7,22	119:1,9,1	128:3,18	18	8 , 24
82:18,23	6	129:12	168:17,20	202:2,5,1
83:4,11,1	120:16,21	130:5,18,	,24 169:3	0,18
6,20,22	121:9,12,	21	170:1,7,1	203:9,17,
84:2,10,1	19 , 24	131:7,20	5 , 22	24
3,15,19	122:5,13,	132:3,9,1	171 : 3	204:4,14,
85:3,8	21	8 133:2	172 : 25	18 , 25
86:22	123:2,5,1	135:4,10,	173:1,8,2	205:10 , 14
88:4	5	22 136:3	4	, 25 206:7
89:5,9,12	124:5,11	137:1,18	174:12,23	207:5 , 14
90:11,16	125:6	138:5,12,	175 : 15	208:3,14,
91:4	join 56:22	19,25	176:1,13	22
92:16,21,	_	139:8	177:1,6,1	209:7,15
22 94:4	Ju 81:22	140:4,23	1,22	210:6,15
95:14,17,	judged	141:8,19	178:17	Kennedy
21 96:1	218:2	142:22	179:14,19	84:13
97:14,21	judges	143:21	180:22	
98:1,8,12	218:12	144:10,19	181:11,12	kids 62:19
99:4,7,13	210:12	145:1,18	, 23	Kim 44:4
100:16	JUDICIAL	146:5,10,	182:8,9,2	80:7 , 24
101:5,8,1	1:3	15	0	83:9,14
1,14,18	July	147:5,11,	183:2,8,9	100:5
102:1,2,8	81:19,23	20	,18	102:3,22
,14	150 : 7	148:3,11,	184:3,8,1	106:24
103:15,20		25	3,24	107:2,21
104:13	June 43:25 44:1	149:3,8,2	185:7 , 16	109:6
105:7,20		3	186:5,14,	110:6
106:5,8,1	45:7,20	150:3,11	22	120:8
5	56:23 97:18	151:12,18	187:2,13,	kinds
107:9,14	139:9	152:6,10,	20	62:21
108:7,12,	141:20	18	188:1,6,2	145:17
22	142:7	153:2,6,1	3	157 : 17
109:4,14,	143:2,22	1,16	189:8,13,	
17,21	158:11	154:11,24	22 190:11	KMPG 140:6
110:3,10,	160:16	155:8,12,	191:2,7,2	knew
24	164:8	20	3	26:11,14
111:7,9,1		156:4,15,	192:2,13,	27:15,16,
4,20,23	Justice	19	19,24	17 64:11
112:2,10,	1:7	157:7,16	193:3,7,1	118:7
14,23	181:23	158:10,13	3,19,23	157 : 23
113:6,12,	210:23	,18 150.20	194:7,10,	162:21
20	216:18,19	159:20	17 , 25	169:10
114:14,23		160:10,20	195:18	171:14
115:5,10, 15,25	K	161:12,23 162:12	196:6 197:7,10,	226:4
116:8,15,	Kate 2:3		197:7,10, 22	228:4,10
116:8,15,	3:9	163:6,13, 21	198:6 , 19 ,	230:2
1 J	125:23	∠ ⊥	190.0,19,	
i l				

Page 265	οſ	294
----------	----	-----

	1			
234:5	language	197:19	learned	159:15
knowledge	34:7	217 : 25	57 : 5	lengths
48:21	laptops	218:10,12	177:23,25	206:12
78:24	189:19	laws	learning	Leo 77:11
81:16		199:19	107:5	
87:23	large 8:6	1	187 : 3	81:20
138:12	larger	lawyer 82:4		84:8
170:23	129:4		least 9:16	87:12 89:3
226:25	154:18	87:8,9,11 ,16	26:18 33:1 46:7	93:24
228:9	224:6	88:1,25		94:20,22
232:12,20	last 6:25	89:3,16,1	51:15 52:24	95:9,15
known	24:24	8 92:6	131:18	96:19,22
34:18	114:10	94:15	131:18	98:15
116:2	149:13	97:6 98:4	152:14	99:6
158:1	190:4	165:20	190:9	
160:2	203:13	197:17,18		Leo's
171:17,19	207:14	,23 198:3	leave	94 : 25
176:20		205:4	101:9	less 15:3
226:7	last-	200:4	led 75:3	51 : 25
	minute	232:3,8		150:24
KPMG 7:19	82:5	·	leeway	
8:5,8	late 61:14	lawyers	220:8	let's
9:5,20	82:11	65:4	leg 95:12	32:13,25 33:19
16:14,24	150:7	78 : 16	legal 65:4	80:24
18:13,17,	177:4	84:4,24	75:13,18,	198:24
22 19:4,8	later	87:18	20 87:15	221:7
22:13	22:21	LDC 162:22	89:19,24	230:14
75:22	105:16	LDCs	91:1,12,2	
140:2,10,	106:3	140:20	4	200,20
12 146:11	134:9	151:2	93:18,23	letter
147:14	139:2		165:20	34:23
203:25	159:19	le 35:8	175:11,12	38:9,18
204:4	161:11	lead	199:18	196:14,15
206:2	171:8	236:15	200:7	letters
KPMG's	172:4	1	204:20	35:9,11,1
147:22	177:5	<pre>leading 9:20</pre>	205:23	3,16 56:3
	186:2	9:20 57:25	215:13	letting
L	207:2	188:17	217:22	118:8
lack 81:15	233:20	228:20	219:20	202:12
102:23,24	1.4		220:2,22	
179:2	latest	leads 93:2	legislated	level
197:23	85:17	99:7	140:20	37 : 24
	law	leaks		39:2,9
lacking	87:13,20,	138:14	legislatio	82:8,10,1
192:10	22 88:2		n 120:5	4,16
lady 85:1	89:2	leaning	212:13	118:12
laid	95:12	57 : 17	Lehman	170 : 25
157:17	195:24,25	learn	44:3	levels
	196:2,5,1	167:5		143:7
land 196:2	0,12,13,1	177:1,6	length 152 : 20	liabilitie
	5,21		102.20	

	. Te COLLINGWOC	05-01-2019	raye 200	01 234
s 204:21	list 3:3	1	49:6,8,13	95:16,19
205:7	4:1	14:3,13,1	,18	97:7,17,2
liaison	131:10	5 , 23	50:8,14,2	5
128:19,20	listed	15:1,6,10	0,24 51:9	98:5,10,1
157:10	155:5	,14,18,20	52:4,6,11	9
	202:22	,24	53 : 6	99:5,11,2
liaisons	202:22	16:1,6,13	54:2,5	0 100:25
128:11		,21	55:8,13,2	101:7,10,
life 160:2	listing	17:3,10,2	1 57:6,23	12,16,19,
lifestyle	202:13	2	58:2,15,2	
128:13	little 6:2	18:4,15,2	0	103:7,17,
	14:4 21:9	5	59:12 , 16	
lighten	23:22	19:3,11,2	60:5,10,1	
70:9	26:3	4	3,17	106:7,14,
71:2,20	63:21	20:2,11,1	61:6,12,2	
72:5	65:15	8,24 21:8	5 63:5,9	108:1,11,
lightened	67:18	22:8,11,2	64:3,19	20,24
72:10,11	68:20	5	65:2,25	109:8,16,
likely	99:2	23:8,15,2	67:3,8,15	· ·
48:6	117:21	0	68:10,15	110:8,14
144:24	125:2	24:8,10,1	69:18	111:2,8,1
157:22	133:17	9	70:4,14,2	
188:18	136:21	25:8,11,2	3	5
223:3,6,2	142:23	1,24 27:7,12,2	71:4,8,15 ,23	112:4,13, 15
4	146:14	5	,23 72:1,9	113:2,9,1
224:7,10	159:10,14	28:14,21	73:4,7,12	
235:7	162:21	29:5,8,18	74:10,16,	
limit	170:12	30:3,19	19,24	115:2,7,2
212:11	216:21 217:4	31:1,13,2	75:9,13,1	
	226:15	2,24	6 , 19	116:3,10,
limited		32:9,13	76:2,9,24	
38:17	living	33:4,9,22	77:4,8,17	·
76:11	232:16	34:10,13,	,21 78:9	118:2,5,1
109:2	Lloyd 3:5	17	79 : 23	7 , 22
207:21	5:5,6,18,	35:2,8,19	80:6,14	119:5,13,
212:11	21	,22	81:10,13,	20
line 25:1	6:1,7,11,	36:4,7,23	21	121:7,11,
167:23	16,20,24	37:9	82:15 , 20	18 , 22
207:15,16	7:3,7,11,	38:4,8	83:1,7,13	122:1,11,
,21	18	39:4,8	,19,21,25	20,23
208:6,15,	8:3,18,25	40:25	84:7,12,1	123:4,8
23	9:11,14,1	41:11,16,	4,17,21	124:2,7,1
209:8,17	9	20,25	86:21	8
230:9	10:2,6,12	42:3,8,21	87 : 2	125:4,8,1
lines	,22	43:24	88:16	1 169:14
145:10	11:2,5,8,	44:14,22	89:8,11,1	236:1
link	15,22	45:6,11,1	5	load 102:4
104:22	12:3,7,14	9,24	90:15,22	lobbied
203:4,8	,19,23,25	46:9,20	93:11	62:8 74:1
	13:7,15,2	47:2	94:19	02.0 /4.1
1	i l			

T4:6	INQUINI	TE COLLINGWOO	00 01 2013	rage 207	O1 294
Table	lobby	Longo's	128:13	38:5 , 25	,13,23
Total	73:22	76:22	manage	39:5 , 13	11:4,7,9,
loc 208:9	74:6	84:20	-	56 : 17	18 , 25
local 60:3 150:24 53:19 5 13:19,9;	100 200.0		127.20	67:1,4,9	12:5,8,16
local 60:3	100 208:9	_	management	68:8,11,2	,21,24
126:17,20	local 60:3		53:19		13:1,9,17
174:17 55:1 204:8,9,2 92:3,7,18 16,25 142:18,19 2 101:21 15:27,7 124:9,12 15:18 127:7 124:9,12 16:27, 15:19 17:11,6, 16:27 17:11,6 16:27, 17:10 16:27, 17:10 16:27, 17:10 16:27, 17:10 16:27, 17:10 16:27, 17:10 16:27, 17:10 16:27, 17:10 16:27, 17:10 16:27, 17:10 16:27, 17:10 16:27, 17:10 16:27, 17:10 17:11,6, 17:10 17:11,6, 17:10 17:11,6, 17:10 17:11,6, 17:10 17:11,6, 17:10 17:11,6, 17:10 17:11,6, 17:10 17:11,6, 17:10 17:11,6, 17:10 17:11,6, 17:10 17:11,6, 17:10 17:11,6, 17:10 17:11,6, 17:10 17:11,6, 17:10 17:11,6, 17:10 17:11,6, 17:10 18:12, 17:10,17 18:12, 17:10,17 18:12, 17:10,17 18:12, 17:10 17:10,17 18:12, 17:10 17:10,17 18:12, 17:10 17:10,17 18:12, 17:10 17:10,17 18:12, 17:10 17:10,17 18:12, 17:10 17:10,17 18:12, 17:10 18:1	126:17,20	208:11	114:12	91:5,14,2	
174:17	,23 127:5	lose 43:1	116:6		14:11,14,
202:25	174:17	55 : 1	204:8,9,2	92:3,7,18	
locally lot 10:24 205:9,17 124:9,12, 7.15,19; 7.25 10cate 27:18,23 88:15 180:15 7.25 10cated 197:23 105:4 136:5,22,23 125:19 7.25 10cgerhead 157:1,3,4 86:10 159:24 106:5 216:18 23:2,12 123:25 123:25 124:1 229:22 221:6 123:25 123:11 21:11 21:15 125:20 227:14 169:10 169:22 182:11 22:10 125:22 182:11 125:20 125:22 182:11 125:20 125:20 120:12 120:13 120:14 120:15 10cm 120:12 120:12 120:12 120:13 120:14 120:15 120:14 120:15 120:14 120:15 120:14 120:15	202:25	142:18,19	2		15:2,7,12
locally	208:10	loss 51·24	205:9,17		
151:8	locally		managing	24	
locate	_		= =	125:10,17	16:2,7,19
199:6				172 : 19	17:1,6,19
located		·		180 : 15	, 25
105:4	199:6			181 : 23	18:12 , 20
197:23	located		88:15	182:1	19:1,6,15
locked 156:22,23	197:23		manual	183:5	,20,25
125:19	loakod		168:8	210:18	20:3,16,1
loggerhead 157:1,3,4 102:18 103:9 215:22 3 3 215:22 3 3 216:18 23:2,12 3 22:4,10 3 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2		· ·	March	211:10,17	9 21:5
103; 103; 103; 215; 22 3 23;		· ·		, 21	22:4,10,2
10ng				215:22	3
long	s 66:10			216:18	23:2,12,1
123:25	long			235:22	8
124:1	123:25			236:4,8,1	24:4,9,15
152:11,24	124:1			2	l '
201:4,11	152:11,24			Marron	25:9,15,2
10ts 27:20 46:1 169:10 marked 21:17 match 29:2,7, 30:1,4,19 121:21 136:2 217:4 183:3 material 33:2,6, 125:2 185:4,5 201:11 211:15 lunch 125:2 low 125:2 low 125:2 lunch 125:3 materials 33:2,6,7,11 31:4,19 33:2,6,7,11 33:2,6,7,11 33:10 34:5,11 4,24 35:6,17 34:5,11 4,24 35:6,17 35:6,17 36:5,21	201:4,11				2
220:12	215:20		<u>.</u>		27:2,9,22
169:10	220:12		32:4		28:11 , 17
longer louder 221:17 30:1,4,7 121:21 136:2 217:4 183:3 material 31:4,19 125:2 low market 147:18 33:2,6, 185:4,5 18:6,10 137:8 171:7 25 201:11 lunch 137:8 147:13,21 34:5,11 21:15 lunch 140:16 147:13,21 35:6,17 Longo marketing Mather 2:4 0,24 77:2,6,9, machine 169:14 3:6 36:5,21 84:8 26:2 12:18 0,22 6,21 85:12,13, 16 15:3 18,22 23 86:12,23 127:22 42:18 6:5,9,13, 39:16,12 88:5 mails Marrocco 8:10,15,1 40:6,11 90:12 21:18 1:7 9:9,12,15 42:1,7,6 91:8,20 main 129:1 37:14,19, 9:9,12,15 42:1,7,6	227:14	169:10	marked		29:2,7,10
121:21	longer	louder	21:17		30:1,4,23
122:10 217:4 183:3 material 332:2, 125:2 low 18:6,10 93:16 171:7 33:2,6,3 201:11 lunch 137:8 materials 4,24 211:15 125:2 marketing Mather 2:4 35:6,17 Longo Mather 2:4 0,24 77:2,6,9, Machine 3:6 36:5,21 11 81:20 machine 5:3,4,7,2 37:5,11 84:8 26:2 12:18 0,22 6,21 85:12,13, 13:19 6:5,9,13, 39:16,12 16 magazines 15:3 18,22 23 86:12,23 127:22 42:18 6,23 40:6,11 88:5 mails Marrocco 8:10,15,1 41:1,7,2 90:12 main 129:1 37:14,19, 9:9,12,15 42:1,7,8	_	136:2	60:8 64:6	213:12	31:4,19,2
125:2 low 18:6,10 93:16 171:7 33:2,6,7 201:11 lunch 137:8 147:18 34:5,11 211:15 lunch 140:16 147:13,21 35:6,17 Longo marketing Mather 2:4 0,24 77:2,6,9, Machine 3:6 36:5,21 11 81:20 machine 5:3,4,7,2 37:5,11 84:8 26:2 12:18 0,22 6,21 85:12,13, 13:19 6:5,9,13, 39:16,12 16 magazines 15:3 18,22 23 86:12,23 127:22 42:18 6,23 40:6,11 88:5 mails 6,23 6,22 89:4,6 221:18 1:7 9 18,22 90:12 37:14,19, 9:9,12,15 42:1,7,8 91:8,20 main 129:1 37:14,19, 9:9,12,15 42:1,7,8		217:4	183:3	material	
185:4,5 18:6,10 93:16 171:7 34:5,11 201:11 1unch 137:8 147:13,21 4,24 21:15 125:2 Mather 2:4 0,24 77:2,6,9, Machine 169:14 3:6 36:5,21 84:8 26:2 12:18 0,22 6,21 85:12,13, 16 15:3 18,22 23 86:12,23 127:22 42:18 7:1,5,8,1 40:6,11 88:5 mails Marrocco 8:10,15,1 41:1,7,3 90:12 9:9,12,15 42:1,7,9 9:9,12,15 42:1,7,9		low	market	147:18	33:2,6,16
137:8			93:16	171 : 7	
211:15 lunch 140:16 147:13,21 4,24 Longo marketing Mather 2:4 0,24 77:2,6,9, M 169:14 3:6 36:5,21 84:8 machine 26:2 12:18 0,22 6,21 85:12,13, magazines 15:3 18,22 23 86:12,23 127:22 42:18 7:1,5,8,1 40:6,11 88:5 mails Marrocco 8:10,15,1 41:1,7,2 90:12 main 129:1 37:14,19, 9:9,12,15 42:1,7,9	•	·	137:8	materials	
Longo M marketing Mather 2:4 0,24 77:2,6,9, M 169:14 3:6 36:5,21 81:8 5:3,4,7,2 37:5,11 85:12,13, 16 0,22 6,21 86:12,23 127:22 42:18 18,22 23 88:5 mails 42:18 6,23 6,23 6,22 89:4,6 221:18 8:10,15,1 41:1,7,2 90:12 91:8,20 737:14,19,2 9:9,12,15 42:1,7,2			140:16	147:13,21	·
77:2,6,9, 11 81:20 84:8 85:12,13, 16 86:12,23 89:4,6 90:12 91:8,20 169:14 3:6 5:3,4,7,2 0,22 6,21 6:5,9,13, 18,22 7:1,5,8,1 40:6,11 8arrocco 1:7 9:9,12,15 9:9,12,15	Longo	125:2	marketing	Mather 2:1	· · ·
M machine marks 5:3,4,7,2 37:5,11 84:8 26:2 12:18 0,22 6,21 85:12,13, 16 13:19 15:3 18,22 86:12,23 127:22 42:18 7:1,5,8,1 40:6,11 88:5 mails 6,23 6,22 89:4,6 221:18 8:10,15,1 41:1,7,5 90:12 37:14,19, 9:9,12,15 42:1,7,5	_		_		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
84:8 26:2 12:18 0,22 6,21 85:12,13, 16 13:19 18,22 23 86:12,23 127:22 42:18 7:1,5,8,1 40:6,11 88:5 mails Marrocco 8:10,15,1 41:1,7,1 90:12 21:18 1:7 9 18,22 91:8,20 37:14,19, 9:9,12,15 42:1,7,1		M			•
85:12,13, 16 magazines 13:19 15:3 18,22 23 42:18 88:5 89:4,6 90:12 91:8,20 main 129:1 26:2 12:18 13:19 15:3 7:1,5,8,1 40:6,11 6,23 8:10,15,1 9:9,12,15 9:9,12,15		machine			l ''
16 magazines 15:13 18,22 23 42:18 88:5 mails 42:18 6,23 89:4,6 90:12 91:8,20 main 129:1 17:14,19, 9:9,12,15 42:1,7,15		26:2		· ·	·
86:12,23		magazines			l ' '
88:5 89:4,6 90:12 91:8,20 mails Marrocco 1:7 9 1:7 9:9,12,15 42:18 6,23 8:10,15,1 9:9,12,15 41:1,7,1		_			
89:4,6 90:12 91:8,20	·		42:18		l ' '
90:12 91:8,20 main 129:1 1:7 9:9,12,15 9:9,12,15 42:1,7,9			Marrocco	· ·	· ·
91:8,20 main 129:1 37:14,19, 9:9,12,15 42:1,7,	•	221:18	1:7		l ' '
		main 129:1	37:14,19,		
	•	maintain	22		l ''
				, , , , , ,	

	TC COHHINGWO	OD 05 01 2013		O1 234
44:9,18	3,15,19	122:5,13,	maybe	220:15,22
45:2,8,13	85:3,8	21	26:12	221:1,20,
,22	86:22	123:2,5,1	60:23	25
46:4,10,1	88:4	5	68:21	222:4,10,
5,22	89:5,9,12	124:5,11	73 : 16	14
47:3,11	90:11,16	125:6	85:8 87:6	223:1,9,1
49:7,9,14	91:4	matrimonia	94:13	3 , 20
, 19	92:16,21,	1 89:20	mayor 32:8	224:1,12,
50:9,15,2	22 94:4		44:3,4	17
1,25	95:14,17,	matter	59:9 70:4	225:2,3,8
51:5,10	21 96:1	59:7	76:20	,12,16,20
52:5,7,12	97:14,21	64:23	78:21	,24
, 17	98:1,8,12	109:1	79:4,12	226:8,16,
53:7,12	99:4,7,13	111:17,19	86:2	20,24
54:3,6,12	100:16	129:23	96:4,12,1	227:5,10,
55:9,14	101:5,8,1	168:7	4,19,24,2	13,16,23
56:15,20,	1,14,18	mattered	5 99:24	228:2,10,
21 57:8	102:1,2,8	72:10	103:8,11,	13,18,25
58:1,9,16	,14	matters	21 105:16	229:4,9,1
59:4,13,2	103:15,20	61:10	111:4	3,17,23
4	104:13		113:17	230:4,8,1
60:6,11,1	105:7,20	215:17	134:24	2,13,18,2
4	106:5,8,1	may 1:22	137:23	3
61:1,8,16	5	30:1 40:1	169:9	231:3,8,1
63:2,6,23	107:9,14	55 : 16	175:6	4,19
64:17,21	108:7,12,	72:4 76:7	219:4	232:2,9,2
65 : 22	22	86:18,25		4
66:24	109:4,14,	87 : 25	mayors	233:3,19,
69:3,4,10	17,21	93:4	133:19,20	24
,19,24	110:3,10,	94:21	McDowell	234:10,20
70:17,24	24	95:11	2:18 3:10	, 25
71:6,9,13	111:7,9,1	120:8	172:15	235:1,10,
,16,24	4,20,23	124:6	210:22	18
72:3,13,1	112:2,10,	139:21	211:3,14,	236:3,6,1
8 73:5,9	14,23	141:22	19,22,25	0
74:8,14,1	113:6,12,	142:6	212:1,2,9	McFadden
7,21	20	158:22	, 15	12:1 86:6
75:2,10,1	114:14,23	162:18	213:4,16,	McGrann
5,17,24	115:5,10,	175:4,5,7	20,24	2:3 3:9
76:5,14,1	15,25	,10,16	214:7,13,	125:23
9,25	116:8,15,	178:19	19,22	126:3,4,7
77:5,13,1	19	180:16,20	215:8,12,	,12
9,22	117:3,10,	181:4	15,24	127:1,6,1
79:15	15,20,24	192:3,5,1	216:4,9,1	0,16,23
80:4,11	118:3,15,	6,20	7	128:3,18
81:6,11,1	20	211:8 213:12	217:5,8,1	129:12
7,22	119:1,9,1	213:12	1,21,24	130:5,18,
82:18,23 83:4,11,1		223:25	218:7,17,	21
6,20,22	120:16,21 121:9,12,	223:25	23	131:7,20
84:2,10,1	19,24	235:21	219:10,17	132:3,9,1
04.2,10,1	19,24	Z3J.Z1	,22	
Ì	Ī	Ī	Ī	i

	IIVQUII(I	ie collinewoe	00-01-2019	rage 209	01 234
Γ	8 133:2	172 : 25	18 , 25	208:10	117:7
	135:4,10,	173:1,8,2	205:10,14	meet	129:18
	22 136:3	4	,25 206:7	102:19	131:14
	137:1,18	174:12,23	207:5,14	143:13	134:20
	138:5,12,	175:15	208:3,14,	143:13	136:22
	19,25	176:1 , 13	22		139:9,21
	139:8	177:1,6,1	209:7,15	meeting	140:5,8
	140:4,23	1,22	210:6,15	5:12,16,2	141:20,22
	141:8,19	178 : 17	MCIA	4 , 25	142:6,7
	142:22	179:14,19	212:10	6:2 , 25	143:23
	143:21	180:18,22	218:11	7:2,10	145:4
	144:10,19	181:11 , 12		9:17 15:8	146:19 , 20
	145:1,18	, 23	mean 6:6	16:8,10,1	,22,23
	146:5,10,	182:8,9,2	28:17	2,17,20	158:14
	15	0	71:1	17:2,4,5	160:17
	147:5,11,	183:2,8,9	73:10	21:7,11,1	162:6
	20	, 18	82:18	3 22:6,9	163:10 , 12
	148:3,11,	184:3,8,1	111:9	23:4,6,13	, 23
	25	3,24	117:4	,14,16	164:9,14
	149:3,8,2	185:7 , 16	140:25	24:5	167:4,10
	3	186:5,14,	156:5,15	43:25	171:25
	150:3,11	22	157:3	44:1,5,10	174:8,11,
	151:12 , 18	187:2,13,	197:14	45 : 7	15
	152:6,10,	20	228:2	46:18,25	176:3,9,1
	18	188:1,6,2	235:8	66:3	0,24
	153:2,6,1	3	meant	69:11,13,	177:18
	1,16	189:8,13,	81:23	17	178:10
	154:11,24	22 190:11	122:22	70:1,7,19	184:15 , 19
	155:8,12,	191:2,7,2	130:8	71:19	,21,23
	20	3	201:22	72:20	185:1,20
	156:4,15,	192:2,13,	mo 2 311 mo 3	73:1	186:16,17
	19	19,24	measures 137:25	74:22	, 25
	157:7,16	193:3,7,1		77:9,10,1	187:6,14
	158:10,13	3,19,23	mechanism	4 96:16	188:9,10,
	,18	194:7,10,	196:23	97:6,18	13,21,25
	159:20	17 , 25	media 81:5	98:14	189:3,7,2
	160:10,20	195:18	126:17,21	99:9,14,1	1 , 25
	161:12,23	196:6	127:1,5,1	5	190:16,20
	162:12	197:7,10,	9	100:19,21	191:9
	163:6,13,	22	136:16,19	,24	193:11,12
	21	198:6,19,	145:7	105:16,25	199:3
	164:8,25	22	148:16,20	106:8	221:10
	165:14,25	199:10,21	149:12	107:18,20	222:16
	166:17	200:17,23	150:3	108:13,15	227:17
	167:2,12,	201:3,7,1	153 : 25	,18,21,23	229:1
	18	8,24	154:17	109:9,15,	233:8
	168:17,20	202:2,5,1	160:3	18 , 25	meetings
	,24 169:3	0,18	169:18	110:6	5:9 , 10
	170:1,7,1	203:9,17,	174:17,23	111:3	24:9
	5,22	24	182:11	113:16 116:10,11	59:18
	171:3	204:4,14,	202:25	110:10,11	98:3

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	05-01-2019	Page 2/0	of 294
109:1	216:24	2:7	19:23	223:10
110:15	217:14		109:2	4.3.
135:24	218:20	micro-	110:1,22	month
136:5		managing	143:22	146:22
137:4,5,2	membership	65:12 , 13	145:3,17,	152:9
1 138:8	204:15	mid 177:3	21,23	191:14
142:9	memo	178:6	146:1,2,7	208:19
145:19,21	47:5,13,2	middle	,8,18,25	228:14
,24	1 48:7	82:3	147:9	months
157:12	49:2	82:3 217:12	164:9,22	31:16
173:23	53:13	21/:12	176:13,18	120:15
189:20		mid-	182:2	124:3
	memory	January	210:20	159:6
member	9:3,24	177:24	211:6,11	190:5,14
18:1	21:20	Mike 47:22	•	234:6
58:18	141:21		mired 65:3	 70.11
61:10	142:4	million	misheard	mood 70:11
65:23	143:15	17:15,16,	180:21	71:22
111:18	185:14	17,18		72:5
128:4,7	mentioned	21:2	miss	moral
129:25	14:4	23:25	135:17	220:21
130:7	42:16	79:7 , 10	mistake	morality
132:15	84:25	mind 24:12	187:16	138:1
134:4,12	96:14	37:7,10	mistakes	
138:21	114:24	43:9	168:16	morning
195:5	155:9	45:14,15		5:4 , 6
205:3	175:8	59:23	mistaking	38:1
214:3	182:12	72 : 4	193:17	125:5
219:13	191:13	87 : 11	misunderst	126:20
members	202:21	112:12	anding	211:9,13
8:21	mentioning	156:20	236:15	235:21,24
10:4,8	137:24	194:16		mostly
60:15,18	137.24	233:4	model	132:12
61:3,9	mentions		48:5,16	137:13,14
62:7,16,2	143:8	mindful	moment	,
4 64:24	merits	52:24	40:12	motion
96:23	79 : 9	178:3	50 : 3	96:15
128:8		mine 28:24	Moncton	110:13,21
130:8	message	32:14	148:16	131:16
131:22	34:8	36:13		145:9
134:24,25	messages	37 : 3	Monday	204:19,23
135:12	130:9	223:7	66 : 3	motions
136:12	met 78:6	minimum	money	110:16
137:24	128:15	152:5	58 : 25	Mountain
142:16	199:11	132:3	232:4	63:19,24
143:11		mining		64:5
144:16	M-hm 150:2	201:13,16	monies	
145:22	158:12,17	minute	17:14	Mountains
168:4	M-hmm	32:14	monitoring	28:2
204:7	216:16	91:6	191:20	mouth
205:16	Michael		221:16	95:10
	HIGHAET	minutes		

INQUIRI	re COLLINGWOO	05-01-2019	Page 2/1	OI 294
move 32:21	219:7	81:7	nine	66:22
66:24	223:19	89:23	11:6,24	80:15,20
98:24	municipali	179:22	112:7	99:21
107:18	ties 28:8	205:23	235:24	normal
108:14			236:1,9	125:3
124:8	81:16	negative		
142:23	154:2	138:4	Nine's	131:2,24
144:4,7	223:18	negotiate	125:8	normally
155:1	municipali	48:11	nobody	80:8
221:4,7,8	ty 27:13	negotiatin	26:10	131:17
	28:4	g 177:16	32:16	132:2
moved 108:15	107:4	184:16	151:4	135:18
108:13	120:4		155:18	north
moving	223:15	negotiatio	196:19	64:5,10,1
37:15	must've	n 184:16	nobody's	5 65:18
64:16	166:3	negotiatio	26 : 21	note 42:14
65:8 70:5		ns		
167:12	myself	75:7 , 11	Nolan	86:17
181:24	20:9 44:3	177:21	54:15	185:24
187:8,9	77:11	neighourin	100:20	210:4
Mueller	106:18	q 223:14	non 37:12	219:4
47 : 22	133:18	g 223:14	non-	noted
Muncaster	224:14	neither	Collingwo	146:7
14:7	234:16	156:10	od 204:21	notes
72:19,22		158:1		76 : 22
73:6	N	218:17	none 33:9	86:14
74:3,9,11	namely	newly	49:6	125:19
,15,18	222:19	199:16	87:23	170:6
75:1 96:5	nasty	news 65:21	170:20	nothing
139:25	203:2	127:19	174:21	42:22
140:10	Nations	148:19	nonetheles	68:12
141:9	148:15	149:24	s 192:11	91:11
	154:3	150:9,13	nonfinanci	135:15
municipal	157:1,12,	151:19,22	al 161:6	136:10
52:22	24	158:6,20		141:1
62:3		175:21	non-	164:6
76:10	natural	190:7,13	financial	212:20
110:17	169:20	201:1,11	5:11,23	
120:1 127:14	nature	208:8	8:21	notice
185:3	151:2	234:6	10:11	107:15
195:4,22	226:6		13:14	108:10
196:16,19	necessaril	newspaper 126:18	20:1	115:17
197:3,5,1	y 94:1	120:10	nonprofit	174:2,5,1 3
7,19	135:24	newswire	127:14	
198:14	136:6	158:9	non-staff	noticing
199:15	189:12	night	204:7,15	147:1
200:16	235:8	112:13,17	205:16	notion
212:7				218:13
216:6,14	necessary	nights 66:3	norm 31:15	219:11
218:2,21	26:8	00:3	62:22	Norrombas
	80:13		63:1	November

INCOLNI IC COMMINONOOD OU COLU COLU	INOUIRY re	COLLINGWOOD	05-01-2019	Page 272 of 294
-------------------------------------	------------	-------------	------------	-----------------

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWO	OD 05-01-2019	Page 272	of 294
5:11,13,1	212:6	161:1,17,	12:8	130:18
6 , 25	215:9,13	21 162:6	13:9 , 17	141:19
16:8,9	216:25	163:12	15:6	154:24
27:8	219:20	165:2	17:6,25	165:14
54:13	220:18	167:5	18:25	167:2
161:24		173:9,18	19:15	168:20
167:19	obtain	177:23	22:10,16	174:12
173:3,10,	198:11		24:8	179:14
15,18	obtaining	offer	25:15,22	182:1
174:1	190:17	54:18,21	31:23	193:8
176:9	191:24	123:3	32:10	197:11
178:7	197:25	153:23,24	33:16	198:19
	-1	offered	34:24	211:25
np 2:21	obvious	47 : 25	40:23	213:16
numerous	18:6	115:18	41:25	214:13
35:14	72:23	164:7	42:7	214.13
152:1	73:10			
	obviously	offering	43:15	219:17
nunc	7:19 9:2	24:1	45:8,22	221:1,25
172:16	17:16	offers	46:4,9	223:1
	26:15	123:6	47:2	old 216:23
0	27:17	office	49:7,14	230:9
oath 5:19	29:20		50:8,14,2	old-
107:7	38:10	76:3	0 51:9	fashioned
180:3	90:2	133:23 214:15	52:12	232:15
215:5	111:4		54:6	
OBJ 224:21	112:6	216:1	56:21	onboard
OBU 224.21	115:24	217:16	61:2,5	73:3 74:5
object	157:14	219:6,14	71:15,23	ones
224:22	229:1	officer	73:9 75:9	14:6,22,2
objecting	occasion	168:10	76:24	3 18:6
180:18	225:21	officially	81:17 82:23	41:21
objection		121:3,6,2	83:16	71:17
172:16	occur 38:6	3,25	93:11	One's
1/2:10	occurred	122:9	95:21	18:23
objective	22:6	123:24	98:1	48:17
88:10	100:21			49:3,12
219:2	occurring	officials	101:18,24 102:14	
objectives	99:15	62 : 4	102:14	one-time
58:21		oh 27:25	110:10,24	209:13
ممدد المد	o'clock	49:15	111:14	ongoing
obligated	235:24	52 : 6	112:10,18	82:6
87:15	236:1,9	111 : 25	113:6	119:3
obligation	October	139:1	116:8	online
89:22	27:4,8	146:12	117:10,15	96:20
195:20	31:6	157:9	,23	151:25
217 : 22	35:20	227:23	121:19	158:6
220:2,21,	43:16	232:9	122:13	
23	53:13	235:6	125:9,11	Ontario
obligation	159:5	okay 8:10	127:23	1:19 21:1
s 88:1	160:13,17	11:10	129:12	47 : 22
- •••	<u>'</u>		127.12	89:2

	<u> </u>	00 01 2013	- J I	01 254
126:20	options	200:3		paperwork
127:14	114:15,17	ought	P	79:12
150:23	115:1	146:6	p.m 70:2	80:23
open 22:15	139:16	218:2	100:18	paperwork'
43:9	140:1,2,1		125:14,15	s 78:16
102:9	5,22	ourselves	182:5,6	81:2
109:10	141:4,16,	6:3	188:11,13	
117:11,15	17,25	136:24	, 25	paragraph
128:23	147:23	outcome	210:25	25:16
129:6,7,1	174:14,20	38:23	211:1	27 : 2
8 131:14	order	outgoing	236:21	29:12,15
189:20	18:23	162:22	pa 69:20	34:1
	60:6 73:3		_	39:18
opened	136:19	outlines	package	46:11
16:16,24	205:21	141:25	5:23	51:1,18
17:5	210:19	188:24	146:1	53:8 54:7
18:5,9		outside	page 3:2	69:5,20,2
21:15,17	ordered	27 : 13	4:2 10:16	4 70:18
23:5	183:6	115:4	12:9	72:14
operate	organizati	131:18	14:9,10	76:15,19
27:24	on 37:25	135:13	20:8	77:23
opinion	39:2,10,1	137:4,20	202:13,14	81:18
89:1 95:4	2 127:25	138:7	203:4,5,8	85:4,9,15
100:5	203:25	157 : 15	209:24	86:13
133:10,12		159:21	216:21,22	95 : 22
204:20	organizati	189:21	219:1	96:12
205:19	ons 27:18	197:9,13,	paid 62:20	100:17
	38:22	15	185:17	107:10,16
opportunit	orient		203:11	108:9
ies	46:23	overhead	205:11	115:11
139:12	originally	7:21,24	225:20,22	116:20
190:23	9:1 16:4	8:6	,25	120:17
opportunit	154:17	overlap	226:5,7,1	121:10
y 32:6,12	208:16,19	14:21	0	123:16
48:10		overview	229:5,12	124:15
96:21	originator	126:8	231:12	139:3,8
105:2,3	230:24		233:6	142:25
179:6	231:2	owed 232:4		160:21,25
	others	owned 64:5	paint	167:13,18
opposed	12:1	87 : 5	66:21	170:16
203:8	14:10	owner 90:1	palatabili	173:3
optics	67:25		ty 51:20	176:4
66:20	68:5,24	owners	Pam 7:5	182:15,20
216:25	155:17	64:4	21:18	184:9,13
217:1,5	171:17	ownership		185:9,10
233:4	188:19	53:2	paper	187:16
option	otherwise	139:16	6 : 17 , 18	188:2,24
48:11	12:17	147:23	208:9	191:3,7
139:17	164:18	174:14	papers	202:6,10
142:2,20	173:18		99:25	203:10,20
, ,				204:19
	1		[

	TE COLLINGWO	OD 03-01-2013	Page 2/4	01 294
206:1	234:17	176:21	39:21	185:11
217:13	particular	partnershi	40:4,9,14	186:8
paragraphs	ly 48:23	ps 175:14	,20 41:5	Peak 175:7
160:23	135:20	_	46:13	
	141:10	part-time	47:9	pecuniary
pardon	154:10	127:13	50:6,12,1	176:14
6:12	205:19	party	8 51:3	180:12
74:16		192:3,9,1	52 : 15	185:6
111:22 186:24	particular	5	53:10	214:1,4 222:18
180:24	s 107:7	pass 99:23	54:10	232:18
park 62:9	parties	130:23	69:8,22	232:0
213:6	64:1,25		71:11	Peever
parks	90:5	passed	72:16	204:4,15
62:18	135:16	78:25	76:17	205:4
Davile La	140:18	79:11	85:6	people
Park's	Partly	80:21	95:24	10:24
62:20	35:2	129:22	101:3	13:5
partial	198:1	passing	102:6,12	27:13,20,
207:9		129:23	107:12,24	23 28:1
partially	partner	131:15	115:13	35:14
86:13	43:8	past 38:21	117:13,18	38:13
94:21	57:1,2,19	49:23	120:19	58:10 , 12
	84:8	53:15	139:6 143:19	63 : 20
participan	158:16,23	80:3 81:3	143:19	75 : 20
t 178:2	159:9,17	195:6	167:16	78 : 7
participat	160:12,16 162:14	199:14	173:6	129:8
ed 77:15			175:24	130:11
participat	172:14 175:20	path	181:21	136:11,15
ing	177:10,14	164:12	182:18	137:11
77:1,6	,20	Patrick	184:11	146:2,3
176:19	184:18	2:21	186:12	149:14,19
178:19	190:4	Paul 2:10	187:25	154:19,20
	214:3	26:14	188:4	, 21
particular		33:4	191:5	155:5,6
132:20	partners	102:20	202:8	156:6,25
137:5	143:7,14	104:10	203:22	157:4,12,
138:6	159:8	105:23	210:13	13,15,24
139:16	171:9,22	118:10	213:22	166:20
142:1 150:13	172:5 174:21	148:6	214:17	169:6,9,1
153:12,17	1/4:21	160:2	233:1	5 , 17
,22 167:4	partnershi	180:13,16	234:23	171:11,15
168:18,19	p 43:2	181:1	235:16	, 16
170:14	51:14	203:1	pay 232:16	172:13
173:22	56:25	Paul's		189:19
174:20	67:5	29:18	paying	194:21 196:23
199:13	70:19		226:17,19	202:23
203:6	72:23	PAUSE 8:13	,23	202:23
216:5	73:11	19:18	227:11	204:9,16
219:15	139:17	20:22	payment	
	142:2,11	34:3	25:3	people's
	1			

	. TO COMMINGWO			
202:22	person	phoned	208:11	118:25
203:1	28:20	105:17	plans	119:9
Pepino	38:3	phrase	51:15	121:5,20,
89:4	54:24	140:13,14		22 122:5
	55:5,6,10		platform	123:23
per 34:8	60:4 64:8	phraseolog	48:14	142:14
perceived	68:12,13	y 224:22	play	143:5,10
51:24	73:21	physical	135:16	152 : 15
134:16	74:5	6:10 , 14	159:24	154 : 12
percent	96:20	picked	players	155:14
17:11	104:19	227 : 21	224:6	156:16
25:3	119:17	229:7		159:1
51:25	130:10		please	161:19
53:2	149:21	picking	15:23	162:12,20
99:21	156:25	191:13	31:9	163:20
123:4	178:20	227 : 25	47:16	164:5
136:11	180:23	picture	119:8	166:8,11
142:17	198:13	224:15	126:9	168:9
	200:6	pictured	136:2	173:12
perfect	203:3	142:24	153:15	178:15
160:24	214:3,4	142:24	161:15	179:20
perfectly	219:3	piece	222:5	190:8,11
169:20	231:8	63:8,11,1	pleased	195:7
performanc	personal	2 170:14	31:25	198:15
e 108:16	89:18	210:7	38:10,12	211:23
	106:24	pieces	PM 96:2	222:17,23
perhaps	108:25	161:17		223:17
10:15	111:17	174:24	point 9:18	228:3
37:6	155:15	pissed	11:13	points
60:22	189:14	102:24	13:12 19:7	47:16,19
100:5	205:19			50:2,4
137:23 174:9	220:13	plan	32:23 33:6	56:2
192:11	personally	113:5,7,8	35:25	143:4
212:25	87:9	,10	36:18	209:4
		139:23	44:8	219:4
period	personnel 109:1	144:4	46:19	233:8,11
27:6	111:17,19	150:25	47:14	policies
43:20	·	159:12	49:10,20	128:16
46:17	perspectiv	221:16	56:22,23	polite
61:18	e 51:22	planner	74:13	35:3
104:2	190:10	168:5,6	87:3	38:18
128:5	220:6	197:1	94:14	
132:4	222:15	planning	97:4 , 16	political
137:2	231:6,11	89:3	98 : 21	82:8,14,1
148:5	pertains	141:15	105:13	6 148:23
160:9	167:20	144:8	110:22	150:20
177:22	phone	162:10	112:22	151:1
202:24	30:25	171:8	114:4	234:9
208:14,18 222:7	61:14	196:18,25	115:3,25	Politicall
222:1		197:2	116:5,7	y 126:22
1	1			l

INQUIRI	TE COLLINGWOO	D 03-01-2019	rage 270	01 294
politician	111:23	193:21	, 13 , 25	57:1,2
82:24	112:1	PowerPoint	178:1 , 21	69 : 16
83:23	142:6	16:5	180:24,25	72 : 7
politician	143:8	10.5	181 : 13	142:12
s 82:21	possibly	PowerStrea	190:14	177:15
S 82:21	113:16,17	m 2:21	191:10	premature
popped	150:17	10:21,24	198:8,16,	136:19
158:6	155:16	11:14,21	17 , 18 , 24	
populated		12:13,22	221:10,18	preparatio
20:4,6,10	post	13:4,18	,21	n 143:8
25:7	208:19	14:12,19	222:19,23	prepare
	potential	15:3	223:13	143:14
portion	33:8	25:19	224:19,23	
143:22	36:20	26:15	225:5,9,1	prepared
163:8	46:18,25	27:10,11	3,17,21,2	136:22
165:8	55:12	28:20	3	172:10
posed	57:4,18	29:21	226:1,10,	preparing
91:8,11,1	143:6	30:9,18	17 , 22	173:13
8	147:22	31:5,8,11	227:1,3	preppered
poses	159:7	,21	228:4,11,	69:16
90:25	163:8	32:4,17,2	15 , 22	
	171:9,22	0	229:18,20	present
posited	172:5	33:3,7,13	230:2,18,	148:14
90:25	179:16	34:16,20	21 , 25	155:2
position	222:22,24	36:2,10,1	231:5,9,1	177:18
48:18	223:7	4 37:25	6 232:5	207:23
60:16	228:24	38:7,13,1	233:7	214:8
114:4,18,	pothole	4 41:9	234:14	221:15
20 116:13	129:3	42:11,13,	235:5	presentati
118:7	130:1	18,20,23	PowerStrea	on 15:19
119:7,12		43:3,8,13	m's 30:14	48:14
120:14	power 26:8	,18,21,23 44:24	32 : 11	49:3,12
123:12	36:15	47:5,13	42:15	50 : 23
124:1,20,	38:14,17	53:14	43:1	56 : 24
23 153:23	138:15	54:14,16	55 : 22	67 : 6
220:13	143:11 147:15,23	56:25	98:2,18,2	139:10
positive	158:15,24	57:17 , 22	0	141:24
49:22	160:12,15	59:2,15	practice	143:2,16
66:6	161:1,4	69:15	59 : 15	146:11
88:24	166:2	72 : 7	132:13	147:12,13
Positively	173:17	73:14	189:6,14	,21
31:22	174:3,15	81:25	·	158:14
	175:20	97:9,12,1	predecesso	161:2,13
possibilit	176:3,8	5,19,24	r 216:18	186:19
ies 43:5	177:16	98:6 99:1	predicated	204:5,6
possibilit	199:2	151:16	48:15	presentati
y 113:22		162:17,19	Predominan	ons
possible	Power/	,21	tly 208:7	47:1 , 18
77:15	PowerStre	171:16	_	presented
109:21	am 191:25 192:7	177:2,7,9	<pre>preferred 43:21</pre>	8:8 17:14

			<u>-</u>	
20:12	171:14	208:17	product	47:1
21:4,6	209:24	216:11	226:25	222:19,22
22:1	prevent	234:7	profession	proposal
23:7,23	136:19	problem	al 132:8	53:1
49:1 67:7		26:20	135:11	54:17
134:6	previous	29:23		
139:22	66:8 83:2	95:18	160:1	propose
141:18	99:21	108:3	profile	211:4
147:12	100:22	109:24	47:19	235:20
159:2,19	108:9	119:24	progressed	proposed
161:25	123:10	137:5	44:11	85:18
206:23	185:24			144:4
presenter	189:18	problems	project	
48:20	190:4	82:3 , 11	31:16	proposes
	226:12	proceed	84:24	142:1
presenting	previously	98:14	154:5	prospect
16:14	3:5 35:9	125:20	160:12	190:17
136:25	36:8	143:25	projection	protocol
presently	87:6,7	179:23	7:21 , 24	131:2
48:4	124:3	181 : 25	8:15	189:10
54:25	168:5	211:4	promise	
	194:4,21		215:2	provide
presents	· ·	proceeding		49:4,9
209:9	<pre>prices 22:2</pre>	166:19	promote	50:21
preset	22:2	process	217:16	52:2,8
59:1	prior	5 : 17	prompted	53:3,20,2
press	5:23,24	77 : 25	103:16	1 54:3,23
121:15	15:7	131:24	nronor	55:9 57:3
122:3,6	145:21,24	161:3	proper 134:11	60:2 85:9
167:21	229:5	163:2,16	134:11	96:21
168:1	private	165:21	properly	98:15
170:3,17	53:21	166:12,13	206:16	100:23
173:13,19	135:1	167:21	property	128:11
,24 175:1	154:10	170:24	63:8,12,1	131:21
	217:16	171:14,19	3,16	136:18
pressing		,20,25	64:4,5,6,	180:20
170:13	pro 172:16	173 : 15	8,9,10,13	190:25
pressures	proactive	174:2,14,	65:18 , 20	198:13
234:9	141:2,3,4	18 175:9	66:7	203:11
presuppose	probably	176:3	137:15	206:13,25
218:15	16:22	178:2,12		207:3
	17:11	179:12	proponent	provided
pretty	27:7	190:2	43:22	8:2 48:9
11:15	30:20	208:21	64:12	58:11
18:10,17	58:22	224:4,16	69:16	59:9
22:15	62:19,20	234:18	72:8	88:13
26:9	152:3	processes	177:15	131:19
104:7	155:15	128:16	223:4	134:14
115:8	162:25	produce	proponents	136:17
138:11	190:8	172:11	14:16	160:19
160:8	194:24	1/2:11	46:18	161:18

INQUINI	TE COLLINGWOO	05-01-2013	rage 276	01 294
162:5,8,1	157:19 , 22	putting	10:14	175:6
0 176:16	166:25	149:7	24:6	radio's
207:16	172:1	200:7	25:17	126:20
208:12	173:14,25	223:22	59 : 25	
provider	174:2,4,1		75 : 3	raise
223:14	0,13,15	Q	102:3	89:14
	175:19 , 21	qualificat	124:7	133:22
provides	176:9	_	130:19	134:22
32:5	180:6	ions	134:8	147:9
157:13,15	188:10	114:11	192:3,16	raised
161:1	212:16,20	qualifies	203:18	35:3
providing	· ·	120:3	206:18,22	91:21
19:8	publically	quantifiab	207:15	110:25
51:13,17	142:15	le 206:17	210:16	129:2,18,
53:1	148:19	10 200.17	211:9	20
55:15	publicly	question	212:3	133:16,19
57:10	97:9	16:2	235:21	,24
75:25	187:7	28:19		
190:13	208:8	37:17	question's	raising
200:25	published	43:17	108:8	94:15
200:25	174:25	45:4,12	quickly	ran 126:23
201:16		46:21,23	32:1,21	
223:4	PUC 115:8	61:2	114:17	range
province	pull	67:2,17,2	120:9	148:22
48:6 89:4	29:11,13	1 90:25	221:4	ranked
107:4	47:7 71:7	91:2,7,9,		17:13,17,
140:20	77:24	17 92:14	quite 31:25	18
151:8	209:3,16	93:8 98:6		ranking
156:23	·	99:8	63:14	6:7,8
provincial	pulled	109:5	111:25	18:2
140:17	40:2	115:21	114:2	
196:10,12	176:6	124:15	145:5,8	rankings
221:16	182:16	134:10	146:18	6:14
	pull-	138:20	166:24	rash 22:15
provision	quotes	167:25	187:7	120:8
11:11	210:2	172:18,20	229:20	
78:2		176:7	quote	rate 12:11
99:17	punctuatio	181:2	209:4,25	15:4
public	n 168:14	193:14	216:22	152:19
66:13,16	punitive	201:19	quoted	153:10
70:6	137:25	207:21	153 : 1	rates
71:18	purchase	228:6		142:19
97:10	48:16	229:24	quotes	152 : 25
115:8	75:8	230:14,15	208:24	rather
131:18		235:2	209:3,16,	29:8
134:6,15,	purpose	questionin	17	51:24
19 135:19	16:10	questionin g 9:22		54:22
137:16	pursuing	9 9:22	R	61:24
139:23	61:10	92:10 211:11	rabbit	66:2
154:7,8	puts		199:20	105:6
156:2,5	100:10	questions	radio	130:17
	100.10	5:15,17		100.17
1			Ī	i

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	05-01-2019	Page 2/9	OI 294
134:15	real 89:17	42:14	154 : 23	158:14
141:3	137:15,17	43:4	155:5 , 9	160:14
214:8	178:22	80:12	160:14,18	168:21
			161:8	173:16
ratifying	reality	recall 7:2	162:4	178 : 8
194:20	54:19	15:15	164:13,15	183:23
rationale	realize	16:12	166:1,5,8	184 : 16
47:25	162:24	17:1,20,2	167:6,10	188:20
rattle	224:4	3 18:12	173:16,21	189:1,5
26:13	really	19:7,8	,22	200:13
	32 : 23	23:6,12,1	174:10,13	209:6
re 78:6	43:7	9 25:23	,16,20	
79:18	84:21	28:11	175:18,22	receiving
147:18	98:22	29:3	176:7,12	70:12
reached	101:25	30:15,18,	177:11	85:25
25:18	101:23	24 37:7	179:8	90:21
35:25		41:9	183:14,23	92:9,25
42:10,12,	103:1 107:6	69:17	184:3,22,	93:15
13		70:21	24 189:4	129:13
	114:2,9	71:25	194:2	139:1
reaches	116:6	72:3 73:5	200:22	146:11
211:23	137:25	75:10	202:20	147:12,13
reaching	156:1	76 : 25	203:3	,17,21
28:13	159:10,13	77:5,16	204:2	160:11
29:15	, 15	78:7		161:8
reacting	178:14	79:16	recalled	163:24
170:7	179:16 196:21	80:4,5	99:14	168:18
	212:20	81:18	recalling	173:2
reaction		82:13	7 : 23	176:7
86:23	reamed	83:12	recap	recessing
133:8	103:21	86:19	235 : 23	67 : 12
187:3	reaming	103:16		125:14
reactive	103:8	112:3,24,	receive	182:5
141:3		25 113:8	41:8	210:25
reader	reason 23:21	115:20,21	92:22	recipient
209:17		116:16,17	168:1	55 : 4
	36:22,24, 25 37:1	119:3 122:21	176:11	231:2
reading	59:19	131:2	185:10	
22:17	100:4,8	135:20	received	recipients
98:22	105:3	137:14,22	49:11	130:8
108:2	153:12 , 17	,23	54 : 22	recognizin
171:7	,22	138:25	55 : 17	g 48:2
213:13	155:12	139:18	57 : 21	recollecti
223:23	179:6	141:13	58 : 18	on 9:9
reads	234:11	142:5	85:25	13:6,20
120:1		144:22	90:13,20	18:1
ready	reasonable	146:10	91:21	22:6,24
125:20	97:1	147:11,16	92:9,11,2	30:24
	219:2	,18,21	4 93:14	31:12,20
re-affirm	reasons	150:16	142:21	42:2
37:24	34:25	151:3	143:16	70:25
		_ 0 0		, 0 . 2 0

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	D 05-01-2019	Page 280	of 294
83:17	recuse	reflects	157:20,22	118:14
99:16	163:9,23	8:20	relationsh	119:8,23
110:4,25	184:25	refused	ip	120:12
135:8	red 87:24	207:2	132:5,20,	124:22
139:21			24 159:21	reluctantl
140:7	reduced	regard	160:4	y 114:19
144:6,11	153:12,19	52:23	180:2	120:13
166:6	reducing	regarding	198:8,23	
170:9	140:19	75 : 7	203:1	relying
174:25	redundant	173:15		95:14,16
175:16	138:20	regardless	relationsh	remain
186:15		187:11	ips	52 : 24
207:22	reference	200:12	135:12,16	remem
208:1,4	140:6	226:22	relatives	169:3
209:19	referenced		217:18	
210:10	29:15	region	relaying	remember
recollecti	references	48:18,24	49:3	7:12,21
ons 19:2	72:18	regional		9:2 10:3
24:17	76:20	47:24	release	15:18
77:20	185:9	48:1	121:16	16:13,23
	202:23	regular	122:3,7	18:8,16
recommend	202:23	108:15	164:14,19	19:12,13
54:20		175:6	165:1,17	20:7,9,13
recommenda	referred		166:2	21:6,18
tion	77:14	regularly	167:21	22:1
131:15	85 : 12	145:21	168:1	33:22,23
205:5	91:9	relate	170:3,17	42:5
207:12	107:19	47:17	173:13,19	45:24
recommenda	133:6	57 : 21	, 25	62:15 70:12,15,
tions	referring	related	175:1 , 21	23 72:2
145:11	20:20	57 : 22	released	74:10
recommende	55:5	59:7,24	44:19	79:21,23,
	61:19	127:21,22	136:20	24 83:13
d 184:18	71:25	131:4	150 : 24	84:7
record	174:24	158:23	159:5	98:23
10:17	refers		161:21	99:6,8,11
102:15	81:25	relates	162:14	101:23
143:23		39:24	164:17	103:5,7,1
174:9	reflect	relating	166:3	3 111:14
176:14	8:1	211:8	167:6	112:5,21
184:21	164:10	relation	175:1	113:12,20
recorded	reflected	55:11	177:24	,25
21:18	9:17	212:12,16	relevant	118:17
records	145:3	231:23	57 : 11	138:5,13
203:10	164:21		126:13	140:10,12
	reflecting	relations	131:5	,13,14,23
recruit	30:17	148:16	reluctance	141:8
119:23		153:25	52 : 21	142:10
recruiting	reflective	154:18		144:2,19
119:22	8:4	156:2,5	reluctant	146:17
			113:24	

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	D 05-01-2019	Page 281	OI 294
154:14,15	99:17	167 : 25	202:23	170:2
,16	129:22	168:18		177 : 2
166:18	134:13	170:2	resources	183:24
168:17	147:22		11:11	221:14
170:1,13	209:9,13	requested	respect	
176:24	•	68:5	14:12	responses
182:25	reported	111:15	77 : 13	44:12
184:19,20	69:14	requesting	91:22	responsibi
186:16,18	reporter	82 : 4	105:11	lities
,21 187:2	126:17	231:9	141:12	80:18
188:20	209:13		147:14	128:6
189:1		require	149:24	
191:21	reporting	67:18	160:11,16	responsibi
201:3,7	30:10	required	167:4,7	lity
201:3,7	64:25	165:15	176:15	134:3
203:15	81:24	207:2	184:17	144:14,17
	100:19,20	requiremen	185:19	145:16
204:14,23	reports	t 96:6,8		responsive
206:5	208:9,11	L 90:0,0	respectful	172:18,20
213:18	209:5	requires	ly 96:18	
214:1		191:19	respond	rest 116:9
remembered	represent 90:5	res 34:14	32:1,24	result
29:17	90:5		38 : 3	88:23
208:20	representa	resent	88:4,15	results
remove	tion	95:11	120:9	10:5,7
202:14	75:14,18	resident	121:10	17:9
203:4	representa	26:1	189:11,21	69:14
	tive	residentia	233:13	
removed	143:13			resumed
96:8		1 62:18	responded	224:19
203:4	representa	residents	26:21	resuming
removing	tives	60 : 20	32:16	67 : 13
54:20	75:18	62 : 4	36:2	125 : 15
203:8	218:2	128:12,23	responding	182:6
	represente	resign	121:2	211:1
repeat	d 75:11	105:2,5	162:19	
45:11		•	responds	retaining
105:18	representi	resigned	32:3	140:10
rephrase	ng	121:16	86:3,12	retains
110:12	84:3,6,16	122:4	123:16	52:22
replacemen	, 18 93:3	resistance		retired
t 112:12	95:11	78 : 6	188:14	190:23
L 112:12	97:15		191:15	190:23
replied	represents	resolution	response	retirement
36:3	47:24	162:2	28:25	48:12
report	207:20	resort	29:4,17,1	RETIRES
64:17,19		114:10	9	236:19
71:18	reps 85:18	*********	30:11,21	
78:3	request	resource	31:17	revelance
79:18	27:3	154:19	35 : 18	72 : 12
81:8	30:11	155:6	38:9 67:6	review
96:7,9	34:9 35:7	156:25	89:6 93:5	5 : 23
30.1,3				

INQUIRY re COLLINGWOOD	05-01-2019	Page 282	of	294
------------------------	------------	----------	----	-----

	D 03-01-2019		
166:2,7,1	20:2,11,1	61:6,12,2	108:1,11,
1,19	8,24 21:8	5 63:5,9	20,24
167:5	22:8,11,2	64:3,19	109:8,16,
170:24	5	65:2 , 25	19 , 23
171:21	23:8,15,2	67:3,8,15	110:8,14
172:11	0	68:10 , 15	111:2,8,1
173:15,17	24:8,10,1	69:18	2,16,22,2
174:2,5,1	9	70:14,23	5
3 175:19	25:8,11,2	71:4,8,15	112:4,13,
176:2,8,2	1,24	, 23	15
1	27:7,12,2	72:1,9	113:2,9,1
177:2,7,2	5	73:4,7,12	5 , 23
3 , 25	28:14,21	74:10,16,	114:16
178:2 , 19	29:5,8,18	19,24	115:2,7,2
179:3,9	30:3 , 19	75:9,13,1	3
199:2	31:1,13,2	6 , 19	116:3,10,
RFPs	2,24	76:2,9,24	17 , 24
	32:9,13	77:4,8,17	117:5,23
· ·	33:4,9,22	,21 78:9	118:2,5,1
· I	34:10,13,	79:23	7 , 22
1	17	80:6,14	119:5,13,
1	35:2,8,19	81:10,13,	20
	, 22	21	121:7,11,
	36:4,7,23	82:15,20	18,22
	37 : 9		122:1,11,
		,19,21,25	20,23
1		84:7,12,1	123:4,8
		4,17,21	124:2,18
			125:4,8,1
	*		1
			Richmond
			223:17
	· ·		Rick 96:19
· ·		· ·	103:4
	·		
	· ·		rigorously
			189:12
			rinks
	·		62 : 17
			63:3,4
	·		road 34:19
			35:1
			65 : 15
	· ·		66:7,12,1
			4,17
2	· ·		92:13
18:4,15,2			
5	-		Robert
19:3,11,2			168:6
4			Rogers
	- / - ·	- ·	
	1,19 167:5 170:24 171:21 172:11 173:15,17 174:2,5,1 3 175:19 176:2,8,2 1 177:2,7,2 3,25 178:2,19 179:3,9 199:2 RFPS 172:2,4 178:6,13 RICHARD 3:5 5:6,18,21 6:1,7,11, 16,20,24 7:3,7,11, 18 8:3,18,25 9:11,14,1 9 10:2,6,12 ,22 11:2,5,8, 15,22 12:3,7,14 ,19,23,25 13:7,15,2 1 14:3,13,1 5,23 15:1,6,10 ,14,18,20 ,24 16:1,6,13 ,21 17:3,10,2 2 18:4,15,2 5 19:3,11,2	1,19 167:5 170:24 171:21 173:15,17 174:2,5,1 3 175:19 176:2,8,2 177:2,7,2 3,25 3,25 179:2,4 178:2,19 199:2 172:2,4 178:6,13 172:2,4 178:6,13 173:15,17 16,20,24 7:3,7,11, 18 8:3,18,25 9:11,14,1 9 10:2,6,12 ,22 11:2,5,8, 15,22 12:3,7,14 ,19,23,25 13:7,15,2 14:3,13,1 5,23 15:1,6,10 ,14,18,20 ,24 15:2,5 11:4,1 153:6 15:1,6,10 ,14,18,20 ,24 16:1,6,13 ,21 17:3,10,2 2 18:4,15,2 5 59:12,16 19:3,11,2 10:2,6,12 ,22 15:6,23 25:8,13,2 15:1,6,10 ,14,18,20 ,24 15:2,5 15:1,6,10 ,14,18,20 ,24 15:2,5 15:1,6,10 ,14,18,20 ,24 15:2,5 15:1,6,10 ,14,18,20 ,24 15:2,5 15:1,6,10 ,14,18,20 ,24 15:2,5 15:1,6,10 ,14,18,20 ,24 15:2,5 15:1,6,10 ,14,18,20 ,24 16:1,6,13 ,21 17:3,10,2 2 157:6,23 2 15:1,6,20 15	1,19

Page 283	of 294
3	seat
24:23,25	113:11
43:10	second
screen 8:24	5:12 23:13
19:16	40:1
143:1	98:11
161:13 182:16	115:21 146:19
scroll	148:19
30:5,7	161:19
32:3	167:24
33:17	174:8
35:18	secret
39:18 40:18,22	20:15 116:7
41:1,2,14	171:20
,22 47:15	175 : 13
49:15	secretary
50:9 51:5,11,1	7:4
6 52:13	secretive
70:18,24	175 : 9
85:9	section
90:17 94:4	54:16
102:16	163:9
107:16	sector 53:21
117:11,20	148:21,23
,25 160:22	150:10,14
213:25	, 17 151:6
214:24	156:22 157:5
215:23	158:20,21
216:21 230:14	159:11
scrolling	176:17
30:6	182:22 183:10
221:13	201:12,14
se 38:20	,16
176:16	223:10
sealed	seeing
16:15 21:16	10:5 20:14
	42:5
search	108:3

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	DD 05-01-2019	Page 283	of 294
126:21	183:15	201:11	3	seat
role 45:16	sale 36:20	234:6	24:23,25	113:11
59:8	42:23	scans	43:10	second
62:12	57:4 63:8	158:5,20	screen	5:12
76:10	75:5 77:7	190:13	8:24	23:13
80:24	78:2	201:1	19:16	40:1
84:20	138:15		143:1	98:11
115:19	139:19	scenario	161:13	115:21
118:14,25	165:16,23	51:23	182:16	146:19
128:6	191:10	52:1 53:2		148:4
133:13	194:5,13	science	scroll	161:19
141:3	208:21	206:15	30:5,7	167:24
145:23	223:23	score	32:3	174:8
178:3	Sandra	6:3,6,10,	33:17	
204:10	2:12	14,23 7:9	35:18	secret
235:4	77:12	9:24	39:18 40:18,22	20:15
roles	102:19	14:6,7	40:10,22	116:7
80:18	121:14	16:11	,22 47:15	171:20 175:13
		17:8	49:15	
Ron	Sara 78:15	25:14	50:9	secretary
84:10,25	sat	scored	51:5,11,1	7:4
86:4,15,2	138:10,20	5:9,12,14	6 52:13	secretive
3 93:2,25	145:8	8:22 9:22	70:18,24	175:9
94:9,22	satisfacti	10:20,24	85:9	section
95:6	on 10:19	11:13,17,	90:17	54:16
184:17		21,23	94:4	163:9
room 72:5	satisfied	12:1,13,2	102:16	
routes	78:19	2 13:4	107:16	sector
129:14	80:22	17 : 12	117:11,20	53:21
rubber	Saturday	37 : 12	, 25	148:21,23
66:2	103:18	42:19	160:22	150:10,14
00:2	save	scores	213:25	,17 151:6 156:22
rumour	134:19	5:24	214:24	157:5
137:8		8:1,20,21	215:23	158:20,21
running	saw 18:3	9:17,21	216:21	159:11
27:1	24:24 90:11	14:19,20	230:14	176:17
127:7	93:5	15:8,13,1	scrolling	182:22
129:10	120:21,24	6 16:3	30:6	183:10
Russell	146:25	17:11	221:13	201:12,14
168:6	147:3,6,8	18:3	se 38:20	, 16
	149:22	25:13	176:16	223:10
Ryan 2:19		scoring		seeing
213:19	scan	7:10,19,2	sealed	10:5
	127:19	0 8:5	16:15	20:14
S	148:19	9:18	21:16	42:5
sa 75:4	149:24 150:13	10:11,17	search	108:3
saddled	150:13	16:9 18:7	158:23	147:19
65:20	182:11	20:10	searches	173:22
salary	190:7	21:7,11,1	152:1	
	150.7			seek 42:10
I	1	l		i .

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWO	OD 05-01-2019	Page 284	of 294
87:14	selling	89:15	128:11	91:19
89:19	63:12	95 : 13	157:14	130:12
180:17	87 : 7	218:1	serviced	134:14
seeking	142:20	225:13	48:4	181:7
25:19	166:9,14	sent 26:16	40:4	191:10
27:19	sells 31:8	30:13,16	services	195:14
44:20		34:7	54 : 16	shared
110:25	semi-	38:8,24	85 : 19	133:5
234:1	retired	42:14	142:19	134:23
	127:13	47:14	176:16	139:15
seem	send 35:18	54:15	203:12	170:21
68:14,15	103:12	64:15,16,	session	
219:23	115:24	18 71:5,6	69:14	shareholde
233:5,21	130:3	72:19	70 : 6	r 75:7
seemed	151:11	74:9 96:2	107:18	165:4,21,
124:19	152:2	103:18	109:18	24
seems	165:10	115:18	110:1,5,2	shares
222:5,6	170:13	118:21	3 131:18	25:4
	171:21	120:22	134:15	161:4
seen 6:25	203:13	131 : 6	145:6	sharing
10:7	233:10	155 : 18	173:11,14	137:3,20
37:12	sending	170:6	, 25	138:2,7
41:12	30:20	172:2,4,6	184:14	
42:5,9,17	53:13	,7 178:13	sets 85:14	sheet
43:15	73:6	182:21,23		6:3,6,10,
55:14	97 : 22	183:21	setting	14,23 7:9
56:14	103:5	185 : 22	147:22	she's
59:2,5	115:22	202:11	seven	78:19
61:17,19 68:2	122:7	203:6	11:24	82:21
79:13	130:6	206:2	113:19	ship 88:22
80:2,16	164:2	222:12	151 : 24	112:19
90:5	165:13	234:12	several	116:22
139:13	166:10	235:4	28 : 25	117:1,9
147:17,18	179:2	separate	53 : 15	120:24
156:11	182:25	87 : 18	129:16	ahan 26.2
190:15	233:7,24	separately	141:25	shop 26:2 73:13
203:11	sends 31:8	205:13	168:4	
216:12	47:3		175:17	short
218:4,6	100:17	September	224:5	206:2
selected	167:22	46:16,24	severance	212:10
43:21		51:11	104:24	shortly
57:2 72:7	senior	seriously		188:8
	48:11	215:9	shade	short-term
sell 64:7	54:24	serve	196:13	114:1,20
142:16	55:5,6,10 118:25	128:9	shades	120:14
164:6	110:23	206:10	196:4	154:5
165:7,8,1	sense		share	
1 179:10	43:3,6	served	57 : 20	showed 5:9
seller's	57 : 19	133:18	59:19,21	9:7 20:25
140:16	81:14	service	75:8 78:2	21:2

	. re corringmod	JD 05 01 2013	raye 203	O1 234
108:8	38:21	six-month	204:20	119:24
showing	123:6	221:15	solicitor	199:9
9:23	157 : 18	skill	92 : 23	209:9
20:14	164:8	232:19	93:2	211:22
21:3	214:20		96:6,9	somewhere
23:25	219:3	skills	·	27:8 95:8
	similarly	169:6,7	solid	
shown	147:20	slide	207:13	sophistica
161:13	149:23	11:19	solidify	ted 62:14
shows	simple	19:21	48:17	sorry
134:21	18:10	20:7,13,1	Solutions	12:5,7
145:20	18:10	4,17,19,2	115:8	15:22 , 24
169:24	simply	5 23:24		20:8
184:21	110:3	24:24	solved	28:17
shut 26:9	119:5	141:24	26:20	29:11
36:14	207:9	143:1	29:24	30:5,6
	219:6	144:1	somebody	36:6
sic 72:12	sir 36:6	147:12	21 : 17	40:1,11,2
89:10	175 : 15	161:13,15	26:18 , 23	3 41:2
sign 87:21	181:12	slides	35 : 4	45:12 , 13
99:25	214:6,12	142:24	61:14	46:21 , 22
signalled	215:7,11,		65:5 68:9	
166:18	14	slightest	112:19	52:6 69:5
	217:4,7,1	172:21	114:1	81:23
signature	0,23	slightly	117:5,8	86:24
78:21	218:14	149:25	129:25	89:8 94:6
81:5	219:9,21	small	132:1	100:18
100:10	225:7	129:3	134:10	108:7,14
signatures	228:6	136:10,14	147:1	123:14
81:2	229:16	149:19,20	156 : 14	136:1
signed	230:20	169:5	181:7,8	138:9
78:4,17,1	sister	190:24	190:25	140:11,13
8	103:24	224:9	197:19	142:8
79:11,12,	104:11	smaller	213:14	145:14
20 81:1,2		224:7	223:23	146:12,13
90:6	sit 78:1		224:11	153:6,8,1 4 165:22
214:20	123:11	social	227:17	166:10
215:20	166:21	135:12,16	Somehow	167:9
signing	site 26:5	148:20	39:10	193:17
75:4	sitting	160:2	someone	197:11
	28:8	202:25	116:21,25	213:10
signs	55 : 24	socialize	119:22	214:8
78:22	137:2	160:5	120:23	216:22
79:3,4		sole	133:12	217:3
silly	situation	165:4,21,	192:16	224:21
110:16	36:12	24	199:6	226:14
Simcoe	200:15		somewhat	229:14
28:9	228:19	solemn	somewnat 95:1	231:3
	six 115:16	215:2	95:1 103:24	
similar	177:4	solicit	114:19	sort 7:24
			114:19	

	TO COLLINGIA	00 01 2013	, 1age 200	01 231
18:13	234:15,16	113:2,3	118:13	state
55:19	speaking	speculativ	119:17	235:19
67:22	5:8	e 58:4	121:20	stated
129:5,11	45:9,16		123:9	87:6,7
135:21	48:15	speed	129:15,22	99:22
168:16	78:11	216:20	,24	122:9
185:5	119:17	spelled	130:7,8,1	182:23
sorts	126:22	212:6	6,22,23	
61:23	140:7	spelling	131:12,22	statement
169:6	143:6	168:16	132:5,9,1	83:2
197:1	200:22	100:10	5	140:24
		spent	134:13,18	188:24
sought	special	26:24	, 25	189:2
43:17	129:19,20	194:23	137:24	statements
sound 14:2	specialize	234:6	144:16,24	85 : 22
27:5	d 11:11	spirit	145:2,11	stating
99:19	specific	196:14	148:15	96:13
sounds	28:18		168:4	121:16
56:21	64:21	spoke	169:12,22	122:4
89:5	83:17	30:25	173:13	
138:20	132:16	133:4	198:13	station
	141:11	153 : 7	200:6	175:6
source	144:23	171:9 197:12	207:10	stay
209:20	163:15,16		217:15	122:25
210:1,9	164:16	233:14 234:4	Staffing	180:11
sources	167:10		103:25	STAYING
183:11	170:9	spoken	stage 32:7	122:17
208:5,8,2	174:25	128:24	_	124:16
3,24	179:12	171 : 12	stamp 66:3	
South		199:12,13	stand	steer
48:23	specifical	sporadic	162:25	112:19
	ly 23:19	59 : 18	166:21	steering
spe 112:24	112:25	sports	181:3	88 : 22
speak	131:25	169:17	standard	116:22
44:22	140:12		218:1	117:1,9
45:1,3,14	142:5	spouses		120:23
,23 83:5	157:25 163:3	136:12	start	step
101:22	194:14	spreadshee	38:11	164:12
136:2	213:13	t 7:20	125:18	178:20
141:9,21		9 : 7	158:15	
149:10	specifics	21:3,6	235:24	stepping
186:5	45:25	staff	started	170:23
188:16	46:2	48:9,11	5 : 8	steps
189:24	specified	53:22	149:24	60:16
190:19	63:12	74:5	starting	94:16
192:8	spectrum	104:16,19	24:11	137:18
199:10	172:6	,20	31:5	141:11
200:17		105:24	125:6	143:4,25
217:4	speculatin	106:20	148:25	207:20
222:8	g 60:25	116:4	200:24	sti 76:11
		= = • • •		

INQUINI	re contingwoo	05 01 2015	raye 207	OI 234
stimulate	70:19	83:2	222:5	3 128:11
143:7	72:23	171 : 7	suggested	supporting
stop 52:18	73:11	style	72:25	10:19
124:10,11	138:21	168:14	74:23	
,13	139:12,17	a+1: a+: aa	90:7	<pre>supportive 55:1,11</pre>
160:24	141:15	stylistica	93:25	33:1,11
165:1,17	142:1,2,1	11y 210:2	suggesting	suppose
201:10	1	subject	14:22	192:9
211:23	143:7,13	167 : 22	18:19,20	supposed
230:9	144:8,12	submission	24:12,13	7:13,17
stopped	158:15,23	172:17	58:24	110:18
201:8	159:9,17	submit	59:4	120:14
	160:12,16	18:2	79:17	180:5,7
store	162:9,14	53:1,5		sure 10:12
126:23	171:8	·	suggestion	12:9
129:1	175:19,20 177:10,13	submitted	79:22	16:16
stories	184:18	176 : 21	suggestion	19:4
127:20	190:3	177:2,7,2	s	21:22
148:20		5 179:19	98:3,13,1	22:17
150:9	strategies	180:2	6	23:10
151:9,25	51:13	subparagra	suggests	37 : 21
152:1	strategy	ph 53:17	223:21	38:13
158:8	191:17	subsequent	233:25	40:24
174:18	street	23:6 93:1		45 : 25
175:3	1:18	173:25	summarize	56:6,10
story	79:11	177:21	132:21	58:15
29:20	129:1		summary	61:13
65:8,14,2		subsidiari	4:22	62 : 24
1	stressed	es 33:14	126:12	67 : 23
136:19,23	26:3	success	133:3	68:5,16
straight	stressful	65:8	182:16	74:2,12
48:16	112:16	successful	183:3	77:17 , 18
	string	66:8	202:6	78:13 , 15
strategic	70:3	126:23	summation	80:23
11:11			151 : 4	90:6
23:13,16	strong 49:21	successful	supersede	93:19,20
24:7,17,2		ly 65:16	220:4	97:9 99:4
3 35:25 36:10,22	structure	sudden		122:15
44:11	12:12	30:21	supersedes	124:20
45:17	146:17	66:12	195:25	128:14,15
46:17,25	STT 43:20	95:10	196:1	,24
51:14,18	44:21	Suffice	support	130:9,20
52:3,9	stuck	217:14	11:12,19	131:3
55:18,24	153:1,9		53 : 22	133:14,21 134:4
56:25	·	suggest 24:16	54:19,21	134:4
57 : 5	stuff	27:3	55 : 2	138:2
58:18	19:12	96:18	82:10	142:14
59:17	65:4,5	97:2	88:13	145:17
67 : 5	66:3	180:19	104:20	146:3
	68:17,21		123:3,6,1	

INQUIRY	re COLLINGWOO	05-01-2019	Page 288	OI 294
151:5	142:11	60:19	182:2	195:22
158:4,8	169:15,17	65:16		213:17
165:16	233:11		tend	214:8
168:13	234:8	te 77:1	134:20	219:16
171:14		teach	142:8	
172:17	talked	149:17	tender	thank 5:21
181:13	63:3	team 8:21	21:22	6:21
199:24	118:6	10:4 13:5	tense	17:6,7
211:15	139:25	18:1	195:6	24:20
224:1	172:9	23:13	214:8	34:17
amaniaad	talking	24:9,18,2		35:4
surprised	5:8 25:20	3 35:25	term 91:13	37:10
73:21	72:21	36:22	123:25	38:24
135:4,7	78:10	45 : 17	135:11	39:14 42:14
surroundin	110:20	46:17,25	138:13	
g 48:3	149:14	53:4	195:19	67:3,9
survey	171:22	55:18,25	213:14	68:25 75:9
206:2,3,4	214:2	57 : 5	terminate	
,8,9,20	216:23,24	58 : 19	107:21	101:10,19
207:6	233:8,10	59 : 17	109:6,13	,20,24,25
	talks	85:1,2	110:6	123:15 125:11,12
surveys	157:9	96:24	terminated	160:24
206:15		116:6	104:23	178:25
swimming	task	138:21	104.23	181:1
129:5	10:4,8	143:11	106:10	187:23
Sworn 3:5	13:5	144:8,9,1	108:19	210:15,17
	23:13,16	2,14,18,2	109:10	210:13,17
synergies	24:7,18,2	1 159:3	110:13	236:17
53:24	3 35:25	162:10		
synergisti	36:10,22	171:9	terminatio	thanking
c 13:2	44:11	204:8,9,1	n 102:3	34:21
	45:17	1,16,22	107:15	thanks
	46:17,25	205:9,17	108:10	32:3
table 3:1	51:14,18 52:9 53:4	teams 67:6	109:13	36:3,5
80:16	55:18,24	ceams 07.0	115:17	38:9
162:25	57:5	Team's	terms 27:5	103:4
169:7	58:19	44:11	138:10	236:6
188:19	59:17	51:15,19	152:7 , 18	That'd
234:8	67:5	52 : 9	153:12,17	82:22
	138:21	technical	156:5	
taint	141:15	203:7	182:10	theatre
68:19	142:2	telephone	194:10	129:1
taking	157:25	76:20,22	233:15	themselves
30:14		76:20,22	terrific	148:24
91:17	tasks	/ / • <u>T</u>	172:17	200:7
130:6	157:17	ten		there'd
talk 83:14	tax 28:1	10:21,24	territory	129:19
101:6	taxpayer	11:21,23	48:3	152:15
129:8	37:2	12:1	test 219:2	
136:11,12		13:3,4	text	therefore
100.11,12	taxpayers	14:2	COAC	142:20
1	j j			1

	i ie eoddinowe	95 09 01 2013	1 age 203	01 231
201:16	231:2	30:2	тос555939	touch
there's	they've	216:12	214:15	36:16
11:16	31:16	TOC0038108	TOC59013	towards
19:12	38:23	4:13	47 : 7	185:12
20:13	62:8,9	TOC0044255	TOC61079	212:4
24:2,13	130:1	4:12	39:19	town
29:5	third			1:2,16
30:19	116:20	TOC0059013 4:18	TOC61382	2:18 28:2
50:15	146:20		40:7,17	57 : 19
53:15	192:3,9,1	TOC0059065	TOC69692	59 : 7
62:7 66:19	4	4 : 3	71:9	61:10,22
72:11	thirty	TOC0061079	TOCO138988	63:8,11
75:6,7	11:13,14,	4:16	.0001	64:9
77:11	17 17:17	TOC0061382	4:21	65:19,20
79:5,9,14	18:2	4:17	today 36:8	75:11
84:9	thirty-one	TOC0062875	43 : 11	76:1 82:4
87:24	187:21,22	4:4	57 : 16	84:3,6,16 85:19,21,
88:1	thoughts		125:2	24
89:2,22	90:9	TOC0062881	211:8,12	86:16,24
93:1	103:11	4 : 5	tomorrow	87:5
95:5,7		TOC0069692	121:13	88:7,8,18
102:9	thousand	4:19	122:7	,22 89:9
107:5	183:16 224:9	TOC0119889	125:5,7	90:9,13,2
108:13 109:25		.0001	188:13	0,25
110:15	throughout	4:20	211:13	91:10,21
134:21	38:24	TOC0135342	235:23	92:23,24
137:8	43:9,19 222:7	.0001 4:6	236:9	93:2,3,9,
140:5		TOC0155656	top 12:18	14
143:5	throw	.0001 4:7	25 : 1	94:1,10,2 0,23,25
149:19	104:16		42:18	96:6,8
154:6	107:2	TOC0173501	topic	104:3,21
191:12	tighter	.0001 4:8	110:11	108:6,16
195:9	62:13	TOC0193240	170:18	109:25
196:19	till 15:23	.0001 4:9	181:25	114:9,11
209:25 210:7	201:5	TOC0216131	topics	115:3,5,9
232:18	Tim 72:22	.0001	148:22	116:5,14
	73:21	4:10	total 25:7	119:18
they'd	timeline	TOC0216131	39:10	126:14
21:22	161:18	.0001.000	totality	128:12
223:24	162:5	1 4:11	13:14	132:5
they're				135:13 136:10,15
91:22,23	timely 57:15	TOC119889	totally	144:16
92:1			25:21	149:19
110:17	Timothy	TOC119889.	38:22 63:9	161:2
138:2 180:8	2:14	1 102:15	66:21	165:4
199:16	TOC	TOC138988.	89:11	168:9
208:10	29:11,13	1 117:16	110:8	169:5

INQUINI	re corringmod	00 01 2013	Page 290	
172 : 12	travel	56:2,5,7	twenty-	134:5,7
174:8	159:24	63:18	seven	140:7
184:14	trend	64:6,12	188:7	147:5,7
195:16	233 : 16	65 : 13	. 51.00	150 : 12
196:19	233:10	66:4,20,2	type 51:23	154 : 22
197:18,20	trends	1 83:11	73:21	155 : 23
198:13	48:22	85:2		158:20
199:24	188:17	98:24	U	159:1,14
200:5	190:6	110:16	ultimate	165:14,16
204:19	233:12	113:25	180:24	167:3
205:12,16	234:4,8	116:5	ultimately	192:15
213:7	tried 43:9	118:12	38:2 96:6	194:17
218:10		119:6		195:4
232:19	trigger	131:3	unanimous	199:25
Town's	19:1	t's 22:18	75:7	204:8,11
86:17	true 145:7	78:14	88:13	207:19
87:1 95:7	210:11	70.14	109:9	214:9
97:6 98:3	212:8	tunc	166:7,19	218:13,18
199:18	215:3	172:16	Unanimousl	225:11 , 18
	truly	turn 8:11	y 109:8	231:20
Township	215 : 25	28:23	unaware	233:19
28:2		69 : 4	171:1	understand
track	trust	81:18	1/1.1	ing 8:20
151 : 7	218:19	139:3	uncommon	9:5 16:10
trail	try 56:4	141:20	62 : 6	44:13
31:10	62:4,8	153:3	underneath	69:12
	63 : 20	160:20	132:15	71:25
train 31:9	64:7 65:7	162:17	understand	82:9 86:8
transactio	66:16	169:13	5:10 7:17	97:22
n 75:3,12	70:9	173:1,3	10:17	119:11
77 : 7 78 : 2	71:2,20	176:4	21:25	130:7
79:8,19	101:23	184:8	23:2,3	148:6
84:18	118:6,13,	187:13,16	31:10	152:11
95:1	24 119:22	191:3	34:15	185:8
96:10	128:12,13	202:5	43:23	195:20
100:2	,14	turned	44:20	196 : 7
203:19	133:13	72:4	45:14	200:12,15
transactio	137:19		66:20	205:6
ns 89:17	149:15	turning	76 : 5	212:18
ns 09:17	169:7	37:7	79 : 16	213:8
transcript	208:20	128:3	84:5,20	214:11
3:14	trying	148:3	95:9	understood
133:1	9:25	169:19	97:5,14	
140:5	17:24	199:21	98:17	10:1
transforme	22:23	TV 8:6	101:8	29:10
r	23:1	126:22	103:20	44:16 45:2
26:6,21,2	24:15,16	twenty-	110:4	58:12 , 17
5 36:15	26:4	five	122:6,8	70:25
	27:14	11:16	123:25	80:18
Transit	38:18	80:15	127 : 23	83:4
43:5	40:24	50.10	130:22	00.7
	i			

			rage 251	
84:15	61:9,22	223:14,22	63:19,24	186:8
93:6	update	224:9	64 : 5	walk 10:10
105:8	160:11		65 : 22	14:17
109:17	161:2,8,1		78 : 7	
128:6	6 171:3	vaguely	81:12	walks 86:7
130:15	173:2,9,1	184:22	190:9	warmly
141:11	0 184:16		205:15	54 : 22
156:1,16	186:19	valuation	235:8	
157:19,21		146:11	viewed	warranties
180:18	updates	147:14	33:7	85 : 18
181:2	160:15	valuations		wasn't
182:12	173:17	9:6	views	7:13
217:1	176:8	1	51:15 , 19	9:3,22
undertakin	upon 5:1	value	52 : 10	13:21
	67:12,13	11:13	violate	14:22
g 158:24	125:14,15	47:24	180:3	18 : 7
unfair	136:17	86:1		24:14
110:14	151:22	90:21	voice	26:25
unfortunat	182:5,6	91:23	211:16	28:4,18
e	200:14	92:10,25	235:20	33:11
233:5,21	205:5	93:16,21	Voigt	36 : 25
233:3,21	208:1	227:16	168:6	38:10,15
unfortunat	210:25	values	volunteere	39:11
ely 131:8	211:1	21:4		57 : 23
179:2	236:21	various	d 62:21	58 : 10
union		61:9	vote	59:20,23
53:25	UPS 126:23	01:9	109:2,3	65:9 , 20
	urban	Vaughan	193:20	68:21
unless	168:7	223:16	194:3,16	73:15 , 21
79:14		vent	195:12	74:1,2
131:24,25	urgency 64:7	105:14	222:2	78:6 84:8
132:15			235:9	104:17
unlike	URL 203:6	Veridian	voted 8:4	105:13
21:22	useful	49:16,17,	146:3	106:25
35:8	32:5	21 53:23	212:19	107:1
117:6		54:4		109:4
196:17,18	usually	171:17	voting	120:12
unlikely	131:1	Veridian's	213:6	132:13
224:8	134:23	50 : 23		135:24
	167:1,3 199:17	version	W	136:5
unpaid		9:15	wait 15:23	145:13,15
unpaid 227:19	210:1	9:15 96:3,8	wait 15:23 52:7	145:13,15 151:5
_		96:3,8		· ·
227:19	210:1		52:7 192:11,20	151:5
227:19 unusual	210:1 utilities 2:7 223:19	96:3,8	52:7 192:11,20 waited	151:5 162:11
227:19 unusual 27:19	210:1 utilities 2:7	96:3,8 via 134:15	52:7 192:11,20 waited 193:10	151:5 162:11 164:23
227:19 unusual 27:19 28:5	210:1 utilities 2:7 223:19 224:7	96:3,8 via 134:15 viable 141:6,18	52:7 192:11,20 waited 193:10 waiting	151:5 162:11 164:23 165:9
227:19 unusual 27:19 28:5 80:15	210:1 utilities 2:7 223:19 224:7 utility	96:3,8 via 134:15 viable 141:6,18 video	52:7 192:11,20 waited 193:10 waiting 26:19	151:5 162:11 164:23 165:9 166:13
227:19 unusual 27:19 28:5 80:15 100:2	210:1 utilities 2:7 223:19 224:7 utility 141:12	96:3,8 via 134:15 viable 141:6,18 video 140:4	52:7 192:11,20 waited 193:10 waiting 26:19 31:17	151:5 162:11 164:23 165:9 166:13 168:3
227:19 unusual 27:19 28:5 80:15 100:2 138:6	210:1 utilities 2:7 223:19 224:7 utility 141:12 142:19	96:3,8 via 134:15 viable 141:6,18 video 140:4 view 57:13	52:7 192:11,20 waited 193:10 waiting 26:19 31:17 39:6	162:11 164:23 165:9 166:13 168:3 170:11
227:19 unusual 27:19 28:5 80:15 100:2 138:6 167:25	210:1 utilities 2:7 223:19 224:7 utility 141:12	96:3,8 via 134:15 viable 141:6,18 video 140:4	52:7 192:11,20 waited 193:10 waiting 26:19 31:17	151:5 162:11 164:23 165:9 166:13 168:3 170:11

INQUINI	TE COLLINGWOO	JD 03-01-2013	raye 292	01 294
181:14	221:3	219:23	200:13	213:4,16,
189:12	well-	whatsoever	205:15,19	20,24
194:4	versed	33:9	212:18	214:7,13,
195:7,15		166:8	217:17	19,22
197:18	200:6		221:21	215:8,12,
199:11	Wendy	234:3	225:25	15,24
234:13	236:25	whenever	229:11	216:4,9,1
235:13	we're	78:10	231:15	7
	13:22	123:9		217:5,8,1
water	24:21	whereas	whoever	1,21,24
127:14,20	63:11,12,	224:10	29:21	218:7,17,
,21			112:8	23
Watson 2:7	14,15,18	whereby	whole	219:10,17
******	109:22	77:25	41:21	,22
ways 129:17	125:6,18,	whether	63 : 19	220:15,22
129:17	20	19:9	73 : 17	221:1,20,
weak	129:6,7	21:12	84:18,23	25
104:22	160:3	23:13,19	89:4	222:4,10,
website	187:8,13	37:7	98:24	14
127:20,22	218:10	67:21	114:8	
155:6	235:24,25	90:13	117:7	223:1,9,1 3,20
202:13,15	West	91:1,9,12	118:18	224:1,12,
,22	169:16	,22,23	146:23	17
	we've 6:2	92:11,12	216:22	225:2,3,8
websites	10:7	93:9		
208:10	37 : 12	94:17	Whoops	,12,16,20
week 82:3	42 : 17	110:11,20	221:8	,24 226:8,16,
121:8	43:15	111:18	who's	20,24
127:19	45:25	112:25	115:5	20,24 227:5,10,
151:19,22	55:14	116:11	178:20	13,16,23
,24 152:5	59:5	141:5,10	198:3	
	61:17,19	142:14	whose	228:2,10,
weekly	68:1	158:22	198:18	13,18,25
150:8		160:14		229:4,9,1
151:4	78:24	162:4,18	widely	3,17,23
weeks	81:14	163:7,8	142:15	230:4,8,1
26:3,20	88:21	164:21	widen 66:7	2,13,18,2
32:15	93:19	167:7		3
33:1	104:20	173:16	widened	231:3,8,1
38:3,16	139:13		66:13	4,19
39:6	140:6	176:20 177:15	widening	232:2,9,2
53:15	145:18		65 : 15	4
146:25	158:10	178:1,2,2 1 179:17	66:14 , 17	233:3,19,
177:5	190:15		William	24
we'll 85:9	203:11	180:25	2:18 3:10	234:10,20
105:25	whatever	185:18 189:24	172:15	, 25
124:13	17:18		210:22	235:1,10,
182:2	21:2,13,1	190:19	210:22	18
211:11	8 26:8	192:17	19,25	236:3,6,1
211:11 213:16	116:11	194:11	212:1,2,9	0
	123:13	196:4,22		window
220:15,16		197:2	, 15	
1				

	. TO COMMINGWO			O1 231
231:20	179:1	,24	200:25	227:21
Wingrove	181:17	225:4,13,	201:21	wrong
44:4	wondering	14	226:4,5	24:13
77:24	124:7	226:10,17	232:1	36:24
78:11		,19,24	works 63:3	40:2
79:17	Woodworth	227:18	66:13,16	136:25
80:5,7,17	236:25	228:3,6,1	115:8	137:10
,25	wording's	4,19	130:4	187:15
82:1,13,2	36:23	229:5,15,		196:24
4		25	workshop	200:14
83:6,9,24	work 44:11	230:2,16,	148:14	207:8
96:4	63:18	19,22,24	150:4	219:11
99:13	66:9	231:2,4,9	154:1,18	219.11
	81:16	,11,16	workshops	wrote
102:3	116:4	232:5,13,	149:17	15:17
105:1,11	121:4	14,16,20,		16:4
106:13	126:8,13,	22 233:6	world	208:16
107:15,21	14,21		232:17	
108:4,9,1	127:3,13,	workable	Worship	<u> </u>
8 109:7	19 128:21	64:23	117:6	yesterday
110:7,13	135:13	65:24	worth	5:8 27:21
115:16	148:4,6,1	worked 8:9	93:22	35:10,15
120:8	1	65:8 , 14	93:22	42:24
121:16,21	149:1,4,9	107:5	would've	43:7
122:4,9	, 24	126:16	30:20	44:2,7,10
123:6,8	150:4,13	127:5	116:2	57:9,16
132:19,20	151:19	157 : 24	119:6	58:10
, 24	152:7,12,	159 : 12	write 35:7	59:25
133:4,5,6	20 153:18	171:19	72:21	63:25
143:12	155:1	workers	102:18	64:11
Wingrove's	156:2,3	128:2	188:11	65:3
81:15	157:2,18,			78:10
106:9	20,22	working	writer	79:6
112:11	158:22	26:15	149:12	80:17
135:5	159:9,18,	53:23	169:19	
wire	22 162:15	58 : 7	writes	yet 67:7
148:19	169:22	64:12	70:8	103:2
	182:11,13	93:25	71:19	185:17
wish 104:1	, 24	97:11 , 19	94:8	you'll
105:1	183:10,20	106:25	writing	26:22
wishes	,22 184:4	127:24	6:14	179:22
123:21	185:11,23	132:5	35:11,13	
	186:1,9	135:5	123:17	yours
witness	190:12,16	151:13		213:12
125:23	,18,22,23	154:12	153:13,19	yourself
211:8	191:24	155:3,22	written	13:18
221:3	192:12,23	158:19,21	56:1	76:21
236:11,19	201:4,8	169:24	152:21,24	
wondered	204:7,21	171 : 15	153:19	85:16
37:20	221:12,21	185:4	196:10	96:5,12
wonderful	222:7,19	186:4	213:1	132:10
	224:19,23	190:15		

INQUIRY re COLLINGWOOD	05-01-2019	Page 294 of 294
------------------------	------------	-----------------

163:9,24	
178:23 184:25 205:14	
yous 38:24	
184:25 205:14	